GENDER BUDGETING AND PERFORMANCE BUDGETING IN AUSTRIA

Parliamentary Budget Office

14th November 2017
AGENDA

• Framework of Performance Budgeting and Gender Budgeting
• Gender Dimension in Austria Statistical Framework
• Gender Budgeting and the Annual Budget Law
• Gender Dimension in the Impact Assessment of new Legislation and Projects with major Budgetary Consequences
• Gender Equality and Gender Budgeting – Challenges and Parliamentary Debate
• Evaluation and Reporting on Gender Equality and Gender Budgeting
• Gender Equality and Gender Budgeting – Input and Conclusions by the Parliamentary Budget Office
FRAMEWORK OF PERFORMANCE BUDGETING AND GENDER BUDGETING
PRINCIPLES OF THE NEW FEDERAL ORGANIC BUDGET ACT

- Budgetary discipline and planning: binding medium term expenditure framework
- Flexibility for line ministries through full carry-forward of unused funds

Result-oriented management of administrative units

New budget structure: „lump-sum budgets“

Accrual budgeting and accounting

Performance Budgeting

unanimous decision in parliament

new budget principles: outcome-orientation; efficiency; transparency; true and fair view

Source: BMF
**Gender Budgeting**

**Definition by the Council of Europe**

Gender Budgeting is an application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process. It means a gender-based assessment of budgets, incorporating a gender perspective at all levels of the budgetary process and restructuring revenues and expenditures in order to promote gender equality.
BUDGET REFORM FRAMEWORK

- **Outcome orientation** is one of the fundamental principles of the federal budget reform 2013. In addition to financial data **performance information** has to be included in the budget documents.

- **Gender Equality** is an integrated part of the new performance budgeting system.

- Under each of the 33 budget chapters up to 5 outcome-oriented objectives have to be defined, one has to address gender equality.

- **Performance information** is part of the budget decision of the legislator and can be amended in all directions.

- Gender Dimension has to be considered on all budget management levels.

- The required **impact assessment** for all new **legislation**, administrative regulations and major projects has to evaluate the gender dimension if the impact is material.
Performance Budgeting Framework
PARLIAMENTARY FRAMEWORK (DOCUMENTS)

Performance information is especially included in the following documents on the parliamentary agenda:

- Performance information part of the annual budget documents and of the strategic report accompanying the Mid Term Expenditure Framework
- Yearly reports by the Performance Management Office on internal evaluations of performance budgeting results
- Impact assessment is part of the sets of documents for all drafts of new legislation presented by the government (usual way of initiating new legislation)
- Yearly reports by the Performance Management Office on internal evaluations of impact assessment of new legislation and major projects
- Performance information in periodic policy field reports (not part of the budget or legislation procedures): E.g. security report, “green” report, income report, equality report
Parliamentary Framework (Organisation)

Parliamentary committees involved in discussion of performance information

- **Budget Committee (and subcommittee):**
  - Debate on performance information (objectives, measures, indicators) within the annual budget and the mid term expenditure framework
  - Internal evaluation reports of performance budgeting results and impact assessment of new legislation and projects

- **Sectorial Committees:**
  - Review of impact assessment of new legislation
  - Discussion of policy field reports (including the gender Perspective; e.g. income report)

- **Gender Equality Committee (special committee for Gender Equality):**
  - New legislation on matters of equal treatment, fight against discrimination of women and men, equal-treatment in all policy areas
  - Equality report
GENDER DIMENSION IN AUSTRIA
STATISTICAL FRAMEWORK
Gender Pay Gap in EU Member States 2015

Gender Pay Gap 2006-2015

FEMALE EMPLOYMENT RATE

S: STATISTICS AUSTRIA, Labour Force Survey (Microcensus). Compiled on 27 April 2017. – 1) ILO definition; Employed population 15 to 64 years as percentage of population 15 to 64 years.
Female Employment Rate in the EU in 2016

Erwerbstätigenquoten der 15- bis 64-jährigen Frauen im EU-Vergleich 2016

PART-TIME RATE

PART-TIME RATE IN THE EU IN 2016
MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT - NATIONAL COUNCIL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>19.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>33.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>27.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>30.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>34.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT - FEDERAL COUNCIL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>21.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>32.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GENDER BUDGETING AND THE ANNUAL BUDGET LAW
CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

Commitment to effective gender equality due to provisions of the Austrian Constitution and the new federal budget law

- **Art. 7(2) Austrian Constitution:**
  “The Federation, Laender and municipalities subscribe to the effective equality of women and men. Measures to promote factual equality of women and men, particularly by eliminating actual existing inequalities, are admissible.”

- **Art. 13(3) Austrian Constitution:**
  “The Federation, Laender and municipalities have to strive for gender equality in their budget management.”

- **Art. 51(8) Austrian Constitution:**
  “In the budget management of the Federation, the relevant principles of outcome orientation - especially in accordance with the targets of gender equality - ... are to be considered.”

The Austrian Constitution as a basis for the objective of gender equality has attracted international attention.
GENDER EQUALITY/GENDER BUDGETING AND THE BUDGET LAW (I)

- A gender objective has to be considered by all Ministries and Supreme Institutions and was included in nearly all budget chapters.
- Most of the Ministries have defined targets with impact on the society; only in individual cases have internal organisational targets been determined.
- Relevant Austrian gender problems have been taken into consideration, e.g.
  - major income imbalances between women and men
  - unequal rates of part- and full-time employment
  - there are significantly more women in part-time work than men
  - high numbers of women receiving financial state support
  - unequal rates between women and men engaged in unpaid work

legal requirements of the federal budget law have mostly been fulfilled
Gender Equality/Gender Budgeting and the Budget Law (II)

- Wide variety regarding the focus of gender objectives:
  - Reduce gender pay gap
  - Fairer rate between paid and unpaid work
  - Improved representation of women in institution’s board of directors – pre-defined number of women in entities belonging to the state (state holds a minimum of 50%)
  - Improve balance between family and career – to increase number of teleworking places
  - Safeguard in particular women, children and elderly people against violence
  - Sustainable development of rural regions concerning equal opportunities for women and men
  - Reduce poverty among women
  - Ensure equal treatment regarding mobility and assure equal access to traffic services
  - Consider the specific situation of women during the execution of a prison sentence with the focus on reintegration and relapse prevention
### Example 1: Chapter "Taxes"; Gender Objective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome objective</th>
<th>Improve distribution of paid and unpaid work between women and men by the tax system</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Why this outcome objective?</td>
<td>For different reasons (e.g. carry-out of unpaid work, high part-time work ratio, employment in fields with lower average payment, child care) the gender pay gap in Austria tends to be on a high level compared to other countries. The gender pay gap is the difference between male and female earnings expressed as a percentage of male earnings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is being done to achieve this outcome?</td>
<td>Reduce adverse incentives for (full) employment of women in the tax system (e.g. reduction of the minimum income tax rate for increasing full employment of women)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| What would success look like? | **Gender pay gap**: status 2013: 18.2 %, target level 2017: 17.1 %  
**Women in part-time work**: status 2013: 84 %; target level 2017: 82 % |

Source: MOF, illustration PBO
### EXAMPLE 2: FEDERAL MINISTRY OF HEALTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome</strong></td>
<td>- Equal access to health care for men and women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Improvement of health in the context of gender appropriate health care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What is being done to achieve this outcome?</strong></td>
<td>- Transparency of improvement of health in the context of gender appropriate health care (study)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Early diagnosis programm of breast cancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Gender appropriate health reports on the health care system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What would success look like?</strong></td>
<td>- Participation of women and men in preventive medical checkups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Participation of women in early diagnosis programm of breast cancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indicator e.g.</strong></td>
<td>Participation of women in a early diagnosis programm of breast cancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(percentage of women at the age of 45 to 70 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Status e.g.</strong></td>
<td>Status: 2015: 42 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Target state: 2017: 50 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BMF, illustration PBO
### Example 3: Federal Ministry of Family and Youth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reconciliation of work and family life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What is being done to achieve this outcome?</th>
<th>Agreement between the federal state, provinces and municipalities to implement an enlarged offer of opportunities for childcare</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Promotion of child care benefits for men</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What would success look like?</th>
<th>Increase of benefits of child care of men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increasing rate of re-entry of women (increasing employment rate of women)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increasing rate of childcare in institutions (e.g. kindergarten)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator e.g.</th>
<th>Increasing rate of re-entry of women into labour market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employment rate, Small children in Child Care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status e.g.</th>
<th>Employment rate women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Status:</td>
<td>Target state:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013: 66.8 %</td>
<td>2017: 67.5 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BMF, illustration PBO
### Example 4: Federal Ministry of the Interior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Outcome</strong></th>
<th><strong>Outcome</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Protection against violence, especially women and minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Why this outcome objective?** | **Violence is increasing in our society. Mostly women and children are victims of physically and psychologically violence in their close relationships.*** |

| **What is being done to achieve this outcome?** | **- Measures for violence prevention for women**  
**- Measures for violence prevention for children and teenager** |

| **What would success look like?**  
**Indicators** | **Effectiveness of Barring orders: number of controls of barring orders versus all number of controls: status 2014: 7.2, target 2017: 7**  
**Clearance Rate: status 2014: 81.9 %, target 2017: 82 %** |

Source: BMF, illustration PBO
**Example 5: Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Promotion of women in organisations, increase of women’s share in boards of directors of state-owned organisations, strengthen leadership skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Why this outcome objective?</td>
<td>The state has a prototypical effect in employing women in leading positions. This has positive effects on career opportunities of women, but also on competitive advantages and location advantages.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| What is being done to achieve this outcome? | - Quota system in state-owned organisations  
- Executive training program for women (Future.Women)  
- Public database containing women for personal decisions (leading positions) |
| What would success look like? Indicator e.g. | Percentage of women in leading positions in state-owned organisations: status 2014: 25 %, target 2017: 35 %  
Number of women participating in management seminars: status 2014: 152; target 2017: 240  
Number of registrations of women in database for leading positions: status: 2014: 400, target 2017: 480 |
Gender Dimension in the Impact Assessment of New Legislation and Projects with Major Budgetary Consequences
OUTCOME-ORIENTED IMPACT ASSESSMENT

• New regime (from 2013) covers impact assessments of new regulations and projects with budgetary consequences
• Streamlined previous approaches to impact assessment and set up a unified and coherent system
• Entails a two-step procedure to identify and assess substantial impacts on the overall economy, small and medium-sized enterprises, environmental impacts, impacts in the field of consumer protection policy, administrative costs for citizens and enterprises, social impacts, children and on impacts regarding equality of women and men
• Financial impacts have to be always assessed
• Impact assessment accompanies new legislation from draft into parliamentary process to evaluation
• Provides ministry staff with an IT-tool to carry out the assessments and to automatically generate necessary legal materials
THE IMPACT DIMENSION OF GENDER EQUALITY

Which effects on the equality of women and men could be caused by laws and projects initiated by line ministries?

The dimension of equality comprises several areas:

- **Payments** to natural or legal persons
- **Employment, income, and education** (distribution of new jobs between men and women, the development of the Gender Pay Gap and the participation of men and women in educational offerings)
- **Unpaid work** (childcare, housework, care for the sick and elderly and formal and informal voluntary work)
- **Public revenue** (distribution of tax burdens and reliefs, exemption causes)
- **Decision-making processes and decision-making bodies** (representation)
- **Health** (prevention, medical products, physical and psychological stress factors, and life-habits)
GENDER EQUALITY AND GENDER BUDGETING – CHALLENGES AND PARLIAMENTARY DEBATE
**Gender Equality/Gender Budgeting – Challenges (I)**

- The level of defined objectives, activities and indicators differs in respect of quality and ambition.
- Identification of over-ambitious general objectives set by Ministries, which cannot be fulfilled by just one Ministry (e.g. reduction of the gender pay gap).
- Success of efforts and activities becomes evident only in the medium term, while indicators are set up for one year and defined with caution in accordance with minister’s accountability (e.g. Rate of female professors 2011/12: 19.6%; target 2013: 20%). From budget 2014 a medium perspective is provided.
- Lack of oversight reporting on the complete number of measures and performance indicators applied by a Ministry results in a poor overall picture.
Gender Equality/Gender Budgeting – Challenges (II)

• Objectives and measures concerning gender equality were hardly coordinated between Ministries (e.g. improved representation of women in state institution´s board of directors). Federal Performance Management Office is now in charge of the coordination.

• Use of internal organisational objectives (e.g. promoting leadership training possibilities for women) instead of objectives affecting the general public.

• Missing a clear distinction between gender equality targets, female promotion and social targets.

• International comparisons and improvements of international ranks are not used as performance indicators.
GENDER EQUALITY/GENDER BUDGETING – CHALLENGES (III)

• Some good examples of gender responsive budgeting have been identified (e.g. reduction of gender pay gap, as well as the application of gender based project grants).

• In most policy areas, valid sex-disaggregated and gender-related data to identify the gaps are not available. Therefore, a fact based statement about the gender-differentiated impact of revenue-raising policies and the allocation of resources is not possible. Sex-disaggregated data collection as a defined measure is rare.

• An overview of the planned resources for enhancing gender equality is not possible due to the lack of reference to the budget.

new federal budget law is a lever for gender equality, but there is room for improvement regarding the implementation
GENDER EQUALITY IN THE BUDGET DEBATE (I)

• Outcome orientation provides information for a sound discussion of the gender dimension and gender impacts of the budget

• High importance of gender equality and gender budgeting in the budget debate

• All political parties took part in the discussion on gender targets with different approaches

• Topic seems to be „female“:
  – Most of the speakers were female Members of Parliament
  – No clear distinction between gender equality objectives and female promotion (e.g. women and leadership)
  – More questions and statements concerning equal treatment of women, only in single cases questions concerning equal treatment of men
**Gender Equality in the Budget Debate (II)**

High interest from the Members of Parliament, but also criticism and challenges to improvement

- Objectives, measures/activities and performance indicators were questioned
  - relevance and clearer definition of the objectives
  - lacking target-orientation of defined measures/activities
  - level of ambition regarding the performance indicators
  - use of inadequate indicators in respect of the envisaged outcome
  - availability of adequate funds

- General overview on the gender targets in the federal budget report was missing

- Coordination between Ministries should be enhanced
Evaluation and Reporting on Gender Equality and Gender Budgeting
PERFORMANCE EVALUATION AND REPORTING

• Reporting on achievements and impacts
  – based on internal assessments of the Line Ministries
  – quality assurance and support by the Federal Performance Management Office (in the Federal Chancellary)

• Annual Federal Performance Report
  – focus: outcome and output statements in the Annual Budget
  – drawn up by the Federal Performance Management Office
  – to be submitted to Parliament by October 31\textsuperscript{th}

• Annual Report on impact assessment of new regulations and projects with budgetary consequences
  – focus: internal assessment of the outcome of new regulations and major projects
  – submitted in May of the following year by the Federal Performance Management Office
INTERNAL ASSESSMENT 2016

Work (Chapter 20)

Performance objective #5
Increasing rate of re-entry of women into labour market

20.5.1 Beschäftigungsquote Frauen [%]
20.5.2 Arbeitslosenquote Frauen [%]

= female employment rate

= female unemployment rate
Internal Assessments of gender equality objectives

- Fully achieved: 48.5% (2014), 44.1% (2015), 36.4% (2016)
- Achieved: 30.3% (2015), 30.3% (2016)
- Partly achieved: 17.6% (2014), 17.6% (2015)
- Not achieved: 12.1% (2014), 12.1% (2015), 3.0% (2016)
CLUSTER: Labour Market and Education

Labour Market (Chapter 20)
Higher employment rate of women and especially support of women re-entering the workforce

Public Taxes (Chapter 16)
Fair distribution of paid and unpaid work between women and men is supported by the taxation system

Social affairs and consumer protection (Chapter 21)
Empowerment of women with handicaps to be recruited in ordinary employment

Education (Chapter 30)
Improve equity of opportunities and gender in education system

Old Age Pensions (Chapter 22)
Augmenting the percentage of women with an entitlement to their own old age pension (irrespective of their husbands’)

CLUSTER: RECONCILIATION OF WORK AND FAMILY LIFE

Family and Youth (Chapter 25)
Facilitating the reconciliation of work and family life
Improving the child care facilities in federal states

Public Health (Chapter 24)
Promoting, maintaining and re-establishing good health conditions with a gender specific focus

Court of Audit (Chapter 6)
Promoting gender disaggregated information on the impact of public spending

Constitutional Court (Chapter 3)

Administrative Court (Chapter 4)
Facilitating the reconciliation of work and family life – teleworking places
EVALUATION IN THE PARLIAMENTARY DEBATE (I)

• Establishment of a special subcommittee of the budget committee for discussion of evaluation results

• Smaller number of Members of Parliament for more efficient discussion than in the budget committee (11 vs. 25 MPs)

• Questions are directly answered by civil servants of line ministries

• Until now 5 fruitful meetings since 2016

• Evaluation Report is also discussed in the budget committee with line ministers

• Efficient meetings for Members of Parliament with serious discussion on certain policy fields

• Public administration get feedback directly from Members of Parliament, promotes general enhancement of performance budgeting
Main topics of Members of Parliament:

- Quality of performance budgeting information in general
- Level of ambition regarding objectives and indicators
- Use of inadequate indicators in respect of the planned outcome
- Measurement of achievement of objectives with taken measures
- Gender Budgeting as a interdisciplinary issue
- But: Members of Parliament see general enhancement of performance budgeting and its reports since 2013
Gender Equality and Gender Budgeting – Input and Conclusions by the Parliamentary Budget Office
INPUT BY THE PBO

To consult the Parliament on performance budgeting and the effective equality of women and men (gender budgeting) is part of the Mandate

- **Analysis on gender equality and gender budgeting** (e.g. needs for action regarding targets concerning gender equality and gender budgeting as identified in the PBO´s budget analysis)

- Elaboration of **maps giving an overview** of the objectives, measures and indicators to improve transparency

- **Proposals for improvements** of the budgetary document´s setup und reports presented by the government with respect to sex-disaggregated data (e.g. grant report)

- **Input for further development** – transparent budget with regard to diversity (considering people with migration background, generations, disabled people)
IMPLEMENTATION OF GENDER BUDGETING IN AUSTRIA

✓ Gender Budgeting is an integrated part of the performance budgeting system and legal requirements of the federal budget law have mostly been fulfilled

✓ Gender Budgeting is considered on all budget management levels and thereby the new federal budget law is a lever for gender equality

✓ Higher Awareness of Gender Budgeting/Gender Equality, intensive discussion of the objectives in the budget committee and in the plenary sessions

✓ But there is room for improvement regarding the implementation (e.g. the coordination between the Ministries)
THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION

Contact:

Helmut Berger
Head of PBO
Tel. +0043 1 40 110-2889; +0043 676 8900-2889
E-mail: helmut.berger@parlament.gov.at