



**COUNCIL OF  
THE EUROPEAN UNION**

**Brussels, 19 September 2012**

**13967/12**

**AGRIORG 153  
AGRIFIN 164  
AGRILEG 133**

**COVER NOTE**

---

from: Secretary-General of the European Commission,  
signed by Mr Jordi AYET PUIGARNAU, Director

date of receipt: 18 September 2012

to: Mr Uwe CORSEPIUS, Secretary-General of the Council of the European  
Union

---

No Cion doc.: SWD(2012) 280 final

---

Subject: Commission Staff Working Document  
Report on the recovery of Export Refunds for live bovine animals in 2011

---

Delegations will find attached Commission document SWD(2012) 280 final.

Encl.: SWD(2012) 280 final



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Brussels, 18.9.2012  
SWD(2012) 280 final

**COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT**

**REPORT ON THE RECOVERY OF EXPORT REFUNDS FOR LIVE BOVINE  
ANIMALS IN 2011**

## 1. INTRODUCTORY PART

### 1.1 INTRODUCTION

In their joint declaration of 22 November 2001 on the recovery of export refunds for beef and veal, the Parliament and the Council requested the Commission to submit an annual report to the budgetary authority. This report highlighted the implementation of and compliance with EU legislation, on the recovery of refunds in the event of a failure to comply with Commission Regulation (EC) No 615/98 of 18 March 1998 laying down specific detailed rules of application for the export refund arrangements as regards the welfare of live bovine animals during transport<sup>1</sup>. Parliament and the Council issued another joint declaration along the same lines on 25 November 2002.

Since then the Commission submitted summary annual reports to the Council and the European Parliament which are based on the annual reports submitted by the Member States.

It is recalled that from 1. 1. 2006 export refunds are no longer paid for slaughter animals but only for pure-bred breeding animals of Export Refund Nomenclature codes 0102 10 10 9140 (heifers with a live weight equal to or greater than 250 kg, up to the age of 30 months – as from 1. 1. 2012 replaced by Export Refund Nomenclature code 0102 21 10 9140) and 0102 10 30 9140 (cows with a live weight equal to or greater than 250 kg, up to the age of 30 months – as from 1. 1. 2012 replaced by Export Refund Nomenclature code 0102 21 30 9140) exported from the EU (modification introduced by Commission Regulation (EC) No 2147/2005).

### 1.2 CONTENT OF THE REPORT

The annual reports are based on the number of export declarations of live bovine animals for which the refunds have been paid (Article 8(a)) during the previous calendar year. It may take 6 months or more to complete the process from lodging the export declaration, transporting the animals to the third country, collecting the returned relevant customs and veterinary documents and deciding on the definitive payment of the refunds. Moreover, another aspect of the time gap is that information on refusal or recovery of refunds may be based on export transports having taken place in preceding years.

It has to be taken in consideration that the data concerns export refund expenditure relative to the financial year 2011 (from 16 October 2010 to 15 October 2011 (see table 1)).

Member States structured their reports based on the requirements of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 (Article 8); the same structure will be followed in this consolidated report.

The tables have been established in using the data communicated by the Member States.

## 2. LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Article 168 of Regulation (EC) No 1234/2007 of 22 October 2007 establishing a common organisation of agricultural markets and on specific provisions for certain agricultural

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ L 82, 19.3.1998, p. 19–22.

products (Single CMO Regulation)<sup>2</sup> subjects the granting and the payment of the refund for exports of live animals to compliance with the provisions established in EU legislation concerning animal welfare and, in particular, the protection of animals during transport. Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 lays down specific detailed rules of application for the export refund arrangements in this sector in order to ensure compliance with legislation concerning animal welfare in the framework of export refunds arrangements. Refunds are paid provided the provisions of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 and those of Council Regulation (EC) No 1/2005<sup>3</sup> on the protection of animals during transport and related operations have been met. Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 establishes a system of checks and provides for financial consequences for exporters who fail to comply with the provisions on the transport of animals. The checks and the financial consequences relate to the payment of the refund. They apply without prejudice to the checks provided for by Regulation (EC) No 1/2005.

## **2.1 Recast of Commission Regulation (EC) No 639/2003 and its repeal by Commission Regulation (EC) No 817/2010**

Since Regulation (EC) No 639/2003 had been substantially amended for better reinforcement reasons several times and since further amendments were to be made, it was recast in the interests of clarity in 2010 and has been repealed by Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 of 16 September 2010<sup>4</sup>.

For more detailed information about the legal background see the previous reports.

## **3. APPLICATION OF REGULATION (EU) No 817/2010 IN 2011**

### **3.1 AMOUNTS OF EXPORT REFUNDS PAID**

The payment of the refund for exports of live animals pursuant to Article 168 of Regulation (EC) No 1234/2007 paid in the years 2007 to 2011 is shown in the following figure:

No exports of live animals in 2011 in the framework of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 were confirmed by Belgium, Bulgaria, Cyprus, Denmark, Greece, Ireland, Latvia, Luxemburg, Malta, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, United Kingdom.

---

<sup>2</sup> OJ L 299, 16.11.2007, p. 1.

<sup>3</sup> OJ L 3, 5.1.2005, p. 1–44.

<sup>4</sup> OJ L 245, 17.9.2010, p. 16.

Table 1

<b>AMOUNTS OF EXPORT REFUNDS ON LIVE BOVINE ANIMALS PAID IN , 2007*, 2008*, 2009*, 2010* and 2011*, **</b>					
<b>Member State</b>	<b>2007 (EUR)</b>	<b>2008 (EUR)</b>	<b>2009 (EUR)</b>	<b>2010 (EUR)</b>	<b>2011 (EUR)</b>
<b>AT</b>	2 026 468	1 863 287	1 813 781	1 235 611	1 530 250
<b>CZ</b>	168 170	185 946	242 489	116 132	150 750
<b>DE</b>	5 929 080	5 631 047	5 455 436	3 854 866	4 091 102
<b>DK</b>	391 357	55 815	67 648		
<b>EE</b>				41 365	71 789
<b>ES</b>					
<b>FI</b>		41 179	51 954	77 676	36 657
<b>FR</b>	1 194 608	436 568	198 394	622 760	799 108
<b>HU</b>	1 247 615	448 141	1 012 927	772 561	731 900
<b>IE</b>	-38 439		60 052		
<b>IT</b>	5 264	4 012	10 119		
<b>LT</b>					8 263
<b>NL</b>	3 573 617	1 273 624	1 148 104	1 534 853	2 061 093
<b>SE</b>	9 257	80 689	74 636		
<b>SI</b>	24 703	25 882	21 059		
<b>SK</b>				426 548	157 830
<b>Total***</b>	<b>14 531 699</b>	<b>10 046 191</b>	<b>10 156 599</b>	<b>8 682 372</b>	<b>9 638 743</b>

\* EAGGF financial year starts on 16 October of one year and ends on 15 October of the following year;

\*\* For the data available prior to 2007 see the previous reports;

\*\*\* Total can differ due to rounding.

### **3.2. INFORMATION TRANSMITTED BY MEMBER STATES RELATED TO EXPORT REFUNDS FOR LIVE ANIMALS**

Since 2000, the Commission has asked Member States to send annual data on the amounts of refund refused or recovered. Table 7 in Annex 1 gives an overview of the figures sent by the Member States for the year 2011. This chapter compares the information of the years 2007 until 2011.

#### **3.2.1. The number of export declarations of live animals exported with refunds (information provided under Article 8(a) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010)**

The number of export declarations increased by 37,9% from 2 283 in 2010 to 3 149 in 2011, a number similar to 2007 with the biggest increase in particular in Germany and the Netherlands.

Table 2: Number of export declarations\*

Member State	Declarations 2007	Declarations 2008	Declarations 2009	Declarations 2010	Declarations 2011
AT	244	420	300	259	333
CY					
CZ	34	34	26	32	45
DE	992	1 398	1065	1 055	1 407
DK	124	12	22		
EE				16	21
ES					
FI		9	14	17	19
FR	638	54**	77	162	244
HU	180	111	259	144	189
IT			2		1
LT					6
NL	1 017	228	369	504	834
SE	4	27	1		
SI	5	6	2		
SK			15	94	50
Total	3 238	2 299	2152	2 283	3 149

\* For the data available since 2002 see the previous reports;

\*\* According to France the definitive payment of export refunds has not yet been effected.

### 3.2.2 The number of live animals exported with refunds

The total number of live bovine animals exported from the EU, based on the number of export declarations for which refunds were paid, increased by 23 702 animals (33,8%) from 70 147 animals in 2010 to 93 849 animals in 2011. Increase of exports took place in particular in Germany and the Netherlands. The number of exported live bovine animals decreased in Slovakia.

Table 3: Number of live animals exported with refunds\*

MS	2007	%	2008	%	2009	%	2010	%	2011	%
	animals		animals		animals		animals		animals	
AT	6 851	8,45%	13 058	18,64%	8 707	13,11%	7 786	11,10%	9 734	10,37%
CY										
CZ	1 061	1,31%	1 070	1,53%	851	1,28%	1 032	1,47%	1 309	1,39%
DE	30 296	37,37%	41 504	59,26%	32 654	49,17%	33 389	47,60%	44 242	47,14%
DK	2 307	2,85%	278	0,40%	495	0,75%				
EE							476	0,68%	568	0,61%
ES										
FI			366	0,52%	424	0,64%	621	0,89%	638	0,68%
FR	1 112	1,37%	1 704**	2,43%	2 205	3,32%	2 762	3,94%	2 831	3,02%
HU	6 194	7,64%	3 508	5,01%	8 363	12,59%	4 697	6,70%	5 766	6,14%
IE										
IT					70	0,11%			33	0,04%
LT									402	0,43%
NL	33 009	40,72%	7 462	10,65%	12 086	18,20%	16 566	23,61%	26 873	28,63%
SE	106	0,13%	936	1,34%	36	0,05%				
SI	136	0,17%	157	0,22%	48	0,07%				
SK					469	0,71%	2 818	4,01%	1 453	1,55%
Total	81 072	100%	70 043	100%	66 408	100%	70 147	100%	93 849	100%

\* For the data available since 2002 see the previous reports;

\*\* According to France the definitive payment of export refunds has not yet been effected.

### 3.2.3 The number of export declarations and animals for which payment of the refund was partly or totally refused or recovered

According to the requirements of Article 8(b) and (c) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 the Member States communicated the following information:

The Member States refused to pay the refund in full or in part for 377 (2010: 239) export declarations, concerning 7 020 (2010: 3 192) animals. For another 58 (2010: 18) export declarations, concerning 1 555 (2010: 42) animals, the export refunds had to be recovered. In total for 8,37% (2010: 4,41%) of the exported animals irregularities occurred in either the refund provisions (like refund code) or in the welfare conditions as mentioned in Regulation (EC) No 1/2005 or in Articles 5, 6 and 7 of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010. The reasons for such partly or total refusals, or partly or total recoveries reported by the Member States are mentioned under point 3.2.5 of this report. Further details are given in Annex 2.

### 3.2.4 Amounts of refunds not paid or recovered and recovery still running

According to the information provided under Article 8(f) and (g) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 the major amounts of refunds not paid or recovered were dealt with by Germany. In total Germany was involved in 683 140 EUR not paid or recovered refunds, which is 63,26% of the total EU amount of 1 079 972 EUR composed of 878 662 EUR not paid and 201 311 EUR recovered, and excluding recovery still running.

Table 4: Overview on refunds not paid, recovered or still running

Mem ber State	Refunds not paid (EUR) [1]	Refunds recovered (EUR) [2]	Recovery of refunds still running (EUR) [3]	Total refunds not to be paid (sum [1] to [3] in EUR)	Refunds paid* (EUR)	Total refunds requested [paid* + not paid (EUR)]	refunds not to be paid as % of total refunds requested
AT	16 332			16 332	1 530 250	1 546 582	1,06%
CZ	2 428			2 428	150 750	153 178	1,58%
DE	683 140			683 140	4 091 102	4 774 243	14,31%
EE	13 152			13 152	71 789	84 941	15,48%
FI	294			294	36 657	36 951	0,80%
FR	80 660			80 660	799 108	879 768	9,17%
HU	9 640			9 640	731 900	741 540	1,30%
LT					8 263	8 263	0,00%
NL	58 394	201 311		259 705	2 061 093	2 320 798	11,19%
SK	14 622			14 622	157 830	172 452	8,48%
Total **	878 662	201 311	0	1 079 972	9 638 743	10 718 715	10,08%

\* EAGGF financial year starts on 16 October of one year and ends on 15 October of the following year.

\*\* Total can differ due to rounding.

The Regulation provides for either partial or total non-payment of the refunds (Articles 5 and 6) or recovery of payment if it is established after payment that Regulation (EC) No 1/2005 has not been complied with (Article 7).

A comparison from 2007 to 2011 as regards the amount involved shows the following result:

The amount of unpaid or recovered refunds decreased between 2007 and 2008. In 2009 the amount of unpaid or recovered refunds increased. Another increase followed in 2010 and even more significant increase appeared in 2011 – from 458 468 EUR in 2010 unpaid and recovered refunds to 1 079 972 EUR in 2011 (excluding recovery still running). In 2010 the amount of refused and recovered (including recovery still running) represented 5,02% of the refunds requested; in 2010 this was 10,08% of the total amount of refunds requested.



Table 5: Comparison of unpaid or recovered declarations, animals and refunds (2006–2010)\*,  
\*\*

	Partly or completely non payment	Payment definitively recovered	Total
<b>Declarations 2011</b>	377	58	435
<b>Animals 2011</b>	7 020	1 555	8 575
<b>EUR 2011</b>	<b>878 661</b>	<b>201 311</b>	<b>1 079 972</b>

<b>Declarations 2010</b>	239	18	251
<b>Animals 2010</b>	3 192	42	3 234
<b>EUR 2010</b>	<b>453 718</b>	<b>4 750</b>	<b>458 468</b>

<b>Declarations 2009</b>	95	32	127
<b>Animals 2009</b>	1 306	597	1 903
<b>EUR 2009</b>	<b>190 065</b>	<b>78 777</b>	<b>268 842</b>

<b>Declarations 2008</b>	91	21	112
<b>Animals 2008</b>	1344	565	1 909
<b>EUR 2008</b>	<b>110 096</b>	<b>104 182</b>	<b>214 278</b>

<b>Declarations 2007</b>	170	69	239
<b>Animals 2007</b>	2 781	1 138	3 919
<b>EUR 2007</b>	<b>432 484</b>	<b>115 196</b>	<b>547 680</b>

\* Does not include recovery still running;

\*\* For the data available since 2002 see the previous reports.

### 3.2.5 The reasons for non-payment and recovery of refunds for live bovine animals in 2011

According to the requirements of Article 8(d) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 Member States communicated the information shown in table 6 and explanations below that table to the Commission on the reasons for the non-payment and the recovery of the refund for the animals referred to in Articles 8(b) and 8(c) of the same Regulation. According to Article 8(d) of Regulation (EU) 817/2010 Member States have to report the number of animals recorded under category B (animals that gave birth or aborted during transport), C (other animals not in

conformity) or D (dead animals). Detailed information can be found in the following table and the summary per Member State.

Table 6:

Member State	Live animals exported with refunds	B (animals that gave birth or aborted during transport)		C (other animals not in conformity)		D (dead)		Total (B + C + D)	
		animals	% of live animals exported with refunds	animals	% of live animals exported with refunds	animals	% of live animals exported with refunds	animals	% of live animals exported with refunds
AT	9 734	2	0,021%	95	0,976%	12	0,123%	109	1,120%
CZ	1 309			33	2,521%			33	2,521%
DE	44 242	42	0,095%	4 898	11,071%	23	0,052%	4 963	11,218%
FI	638			3	0,470%			3	0,470%
FR	2 831	3	0,106%	1 080	38,15%	1	0,035%	1 084	38,290%
HU	5 766	1	0,017%	77	1,335%	4	0,069%	82	1,422%
NL	26 873	12	0,045%	1 931	7,186%	18	0,067%	1 961	7,297%
SK	1 453			131	9,016%			131	9,016%
Total EU	93 849	60	0,064%	8 248	8,789%	58	0,062%	8 366*	8,914%

\* The total number of 8 366 animals covers only the specific welfare aspects under B, C and D of Annex I, II and III of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010. The total of 8 575 animals in table 5 covers all irregularities including administrative aspects.

### 3.2.5.1 EXPLANATIONS PROVIDED BY MEMBER STATES ON THE REASONS FOR THE NON-PAYMENT AND THE RECOVERY OF THE REFUND

#### CZECH REPUBLIC

Non-payment of the refund:

- The refund for the entire export declaration (33 animals) was not paid because the results of the check according to Article 3(2) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 were not satisfactory (due to the exceeding of the transport time);

## **ESTONIA**

Non-payment of the refund:

- The reason for the partial non-payment was that animals were not pure-bred breeding animals,
- The reason for the total non-payment was the violation of the animal welfare requirements of animals according to Annex 1, Chapter V, point 1.1.4 d and 1.1.5 of Regulation (EC) No 1/2005;

## **FINLAND**

Non-payment of the refund:

- 3 animals had been injured during transportation;

## **FRANCE**

Non-payment or recovery of the refund:

- For 441 animals the incomplete veterinary report from the exit point of the EU,
- For 499 animals the veterinary report was not received yet from the exit point of the EU,
- 4 animals aborted during transport,
- For 31 animals non-compliance with journey times and resting periods,
- For 108 animals non-compliance of the transport plan,
- 1 animal died during transport,
- 21 heifers aborted during the quarantine at the destination,
- 24 heifers aborted after the quarantine at the destination,
- 10 heifers died in quarantine at the destination;

## **GERMANY**

Non-payment or recovery of the refund:

- Non-compliance with journey times and resting periods,
- Animals that died, were injured or gave birth during transport,
- Veterinarians' remarks in the check reports in accordance with Annexes I, III and IV,
- Check reports not submitted or not submitted in time,
- Check reports not formally recognised,
- Export via an unauthorised exit point,
- Discrepancies between journey log and check report
- Journey log missing or incomplete,
- Non-compliance with temperature tolerances,
- Entries refused or unsatisfactory under Article 2(3) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010;

## HUNGARY

Non-payment of the refund:

- In Section B of the check report drawn up in accordance with Annex III of the Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 was shown that 1 animal calved during transport,
- In Section D of the check report drawn up in accordance with Annex III of the Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 was shown that 4 animals died during transport,
- The veterinarian of the final destination in Russia remarked that 1 heifer had a ligament rupture at his right hind leg,
- The veterinarian of the final destination in Kazakhstan remarked that 1 heifer had a fracture of the right hip bone,
- In the case of sixteen heifers more than 90% of the expected gestation period has already passed,
- For 59 animals, based on the journey log the journey times and resting periods were not in conformity with the Regulation (EC) No 1/2005;

## THE NETHERLANDS

Non-payment of the refund:

- In the case of 6 declarations, 6 animals had given birth before unloading in the third country of final destination,
- In the case of 6 declarations, 7 animals had not been released for free circulation in the country of destination,
- In the case of 1 declaration, 1 animal was left behind in the customs territory of the EU because the animal was sick,
- In the case of 1 declaration, 1 animal aborted and 1 gave birth during transport,
- In the case of 1 declaration, 1 animal aborted and 1 died during transport,
- In the case of 5 declarations with a total of 166 animals, the Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority ("NVWA") found that the journey time had been exceeded as laid down in Regulation (EC) No 1/2005,
- In the case of 4 declarations, a total of 4 animals were injured during uploading in the country of destination. This did not comply with Regulation (EC) No 1/2005,
- In the case of 1 declaration, Regulation (EC) No 1/2005 was not complied with for 33 animals. The Moroccan veterinarian found that the animals had, inter alia, acute diarrhoea, some were dehydrated and suffering from decubitus. 1 animal had

also aborted prematurely. The veterinarian also reports that all were suffering from constipation and stress. The above is due to the position of the lorry in the boat. It was at the lowest point in the boat,

- In the case of 6 declarations with a total of 214 animals, the NVWA found that the control posts did not comply with Regulations (EC) No 1255/1997 and Regulation (EC) No 1/2005. After export certification by the supervising veterinarian of the NVWA, the animals, which were exported from the assembly centre, were immediately unloaded from the livestock lorries again. The animals were then stabled at the control point. After several days in the stable the animals were taken to the customers. Prior to transport the animals were not examined by a supervising veterinarian of the NVWA to determine their physical fitness for transport. The means of transport used to transport them were not checked either,
- In the case of 1 declaration, 1 animal aborted during transport;

Recovery of the refund:

- In the case of 28 declarations with a total of 927 animals, the NVWA found during an ex-post administrative check in the framework of Regulation (EC) No 485/2008 that the welfare rules as regards journey times, resting periods and feeding intervals, as referred to in the annexes to Regulation (EC) No 1/2005, had not been complied with. Checks were carried out with transporters of live bovines, the aims of these checks being to verify whether the welfare rules as regards journey times, resting periods and feeding intervals had been complied with in the course of export. Since the transporters were no longer able to produce the tachograph discs (or other evidence), it is impossible to verify whether or not the transporters complied with the prescribed journey times and resting periods,
- In the case of 8 declarations, a total of 9 animals were not released for free circulation in the country of destination,
- In the case of 1 declaration, 1 animal died in the customs territory of the EU during transport,
- In the case of 2 declarations, a total of 2 animals gave birth before unloading in the third country of final destination,
- In the case of 18 declarations with a total of 586 animals, the NVWA found that the control posts did not comply with Regulations (EC) No 1255/1997 and (EC) No 1/2005. After export certification by the supervising veterinarian of the NVWA, the animals, which were exported from the assembly centre, were immediately unloaded from the livestock lorries again. The animals were then stabled at the control post. After several days in the stable the animals were taken to the customers. Prior to transport the animals were not examined by a supervising veterinarian of the NVWA to determine their physical fitness for transport. The means of transport used to transport them were not checked either.

## SLOVAKIA

Non-payment or recovery of the refund:

- 30 heifers – the journey logs were not kept,
- 1 heifer – older than 30 months,
- 52 heifers – unsatisfactory result of the veterinary control at the exit point according to Article 2(2) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010,
- 47 heifers – missing authorisation for the international carriage of goods by road for hire or reward in Regulation (EEC) No 881/92,
- 1 heifer – unsatisfactory health conditions.

### **3.2.6 PENALTIES (Article 8 (e) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010)**

France, Germany, Hungary and the Netherlands communicated that they applied penalties.

#### **France:**

Amount of 479,15 EUR of penalties applied for 4 animals according to Article 6 of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010;

#### **Germany:**

6 cases for 12 animals and 1 731,68 EUR of penalties imposed according to Article 6(1) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010;

2 cases for 9 animals and 7 209,39 EUR of penalties imposed according to Article 6(2) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010;

#### **Hungary:**

2 cases for 29 animals and 4 861,35 EUR of penalties imposed according to Article 6 of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010;

#### **The Netherlands:**

4 penalties were imposed as referred to in Article 6(1) of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010. This concerns a total of 8 animals, the unpaid refund amounts to 728,68 EUR.

### **3.2.7 Any other information Member States consider relevant regarding the functioning of Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 (Article 8 (e) of the Regulation)**

#### **Sweden:**

One export licence for 155 animals was issued in August 2011 but that licence has never been utilised. The security has been forfeited.

### **3.3 Clearance of accounts by the Commission**

The Commission is still pursuing two clearance of accounts cases against 2 other Member States.

### **3.4 Communication of irregularities by Member States**

The irregularities with a financial impact greater than 10 000 EUR (amount unduly paid, recovered or not yet recovered) have to be communicated by the Member States to the Commission (OLAF), pursuant to Commission Regulation (EC) No 1848/2006.

In the financial year 2011, Member States reported 4 cases of irregularities concerning export refunds for live bovine animals (budget post 05 02 13 04). The total amount affected was 87 725 EUR.

**ANNEX I**

Table 7

Annual report 2011, Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 - overview in terms of refunds in EUR												
Member State	Article 8(a) total number		Article 8 (b) refund not paid		Article 8 (b) refund partially not paid		Article 8 (c) refund recovered		Article 8 (f) refund not paid		Article 8 (g) recovery still running	
	declarations	animals	declarations	animals	declarations	animals	declarations	animals	€ not paid	€ recovered	declarations	€ amounts
AT	333	9 734	18	79			1	30	16 332			
CZ	45	1 309	1	33					2 428			
DE	1 407	44 242	158	4 883	57	61			683 140			
EE	21	568	5	143	7	19			13 152			
FI	19	638			2	3			294			
FR	244	2 831	81	1 139					80 660			
HU	189	5 766	9	93					9 640			
IT	1	33										
LT	6	402										
NL	834	26 873	32	436			57	1 525	58 394	201 311		
SK	50	1 453	5	129	2	2			14 622			
Total	3 149	93 849	309	6 935	68	85	58	1 555	878 662	201 311	0	0



**ANNEX 2**

Table 8

Annual report 2011, Regulation (EU) No 817/2010 - overview in terms of animals										
Member State	Article 8 (b) refund not paid		Article 8 (b) refund partially not paid		Article 8 (c) refund recovered		Total animals 8(b)+ 8(c)	Total animals exported (see table 3)	Total animals paid, recovered + not paid	% animals, refund not paid or recovered
	declarations	animals	declarations	animals	declarations	animals				
AT	18	79			1	30	109	9 734	9 843	1,11%
CZ	1	33					33	1 309	1 342	2,46%
DE	158	4 883	57	61			4 944	44 242	49 186	10,05%
EE	5	143	7	19			162	568	730	22,19%
FI			2	3			3	638	641	0,47%
FR	81	1 139					1 139	2 831	3 970	28,69%
HU	9	93					93	5 766	5 859	1,59%
IT								33	33	0,00%
LT								402	402	0,00%
NL	32	436			57	1 525	1 961	26 873	28 834	6,80%
SK	5	129	2	2			131	1 453	1 584	8,27%
Total	309	6 935	68	85	58	1 555	8 575	93 849	102 424	8,37%