



Brussels, 7 November 2016
(OR. en)

14019/16

FIN 724

COVER NOTE

From:	Mr Klaus-Heiner LEHNE, President of the European Court of Auditors
date of receipt:	4 November 2016
To:	Mr Peter KAZIMIR, President of the Council of the European Union
Subject:	Report on the annual accounts of the European Training Foundation for the financial year 2015 together with the Foundation's reply

Delegations will find attached the European Court of Auditors' report on the annual accounts of the European Training Foundation for the financial year 2015.

This report is accompanied by the Foundation's reply and will shortly be published in the *Official Journal of the European Union*.

Encl.: Report on the annual accounts of the European Training Foundation for the financial year 2015 together with the Foundation's reply.¹

¹ In English only. The other languages of this report are available on the European Court of Auditors' website: <http://eca.europa.eu/>.



EUROPEAN
COURT
OF AUDITORS

Report on the annual accounts
of the European Training Foundation
for the financial year 2015

together with the Foundation's reply

INTRODUCTION

1. The European Training Foundation (hereinafter “the Foundation”, aka “ETF”), which is located in Turin, was established by Council Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90² (recast (EC) No 1339/2008). The Foundation’s task is to support the reform of vocational training in the European Union’s partner countries. To do this, it assists the Commission in the implementation of various programmes (e.g. IPA, FRAME, GEMM).
2. **Table 1** presents key figures for the Foundation³.

TABLE 1: KEY FIGURES FOR THE FOUNDATION

	2014	2015
Budget (million euro)	22,5	21
Total staff as at 31 December ⁴	133	129

Source: data provided by the Foundation.

INFORMATION IN SUPPORT OF THE STATEMENT OF ASSURANCE

3. The audit approach taken by the Court comprises analytical audit procedures, direct testing of transactions and an assessment of key controls of the Foundation’s supervisory and control systems. This is supplemented by evidence provided by the work of other auditors and an analysis of management representations.

STATEMENT OF ASSURANCE

4. Pursuant to the provisions of Article 287 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), the Court has audited:

² OJ L 131, 23.5.1990, p. 1.

³ More information on the Foundation’s competences and activities is available on its website: www.etf.europa.eu.

⁴ Staff includes officials, temporary and contract staff and seconded national experts.

- (a) the annual accounts of the Foundation, which comprise the financial statements⁵ and the reports on the implementation of the budget⁶ for the financial year ended 31 December 2015, and
- (b) the legality and regularity of the transactions underlying those accounts.

The management's responsibility

5. The management is responsible for the preparation and fair presentation of the annual accounts of the Foundation and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions⁷:

- (a) The management's responsibilities in respect of the Foundation's annual accounts include designing, implementing and maintaining an internal control system relevant to the preparation and fair presentation of financial statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error; selecting and applying appropriate accounting policies on the basis of the accounting rules adopted by the Commission's accounting officer⁸; making accounting estimates that are reasonable in the circumstances. The Director approves the annual accounts of the Foundation after its accounting officer has prepared them on the basis of all available information and established a note to accompany the accounts in which he declares, inter alia, that he has reasonable assurance that they present a true and fair view of the financial position of the Foundation in all material respects.
- (b) The management's responsibilities in respect of the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions and compliance with the principle of sound financial management consist of designing, implementing and maintaining an effective and efficient internal control system

⁵ These include the balance sheet and the statement of financial performance, the cash flow table, the statement of changes in net assets and a summary of the significant accounting policies and other explanatory notes.

⁶ These comprise the budgetary outturn account and the annex to the budgetary outturn account.

⁷ Articles 39 and 50 of Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) No 1271/2013 (OJ L 328, 7.12.2013, p. 42).

⁸ The accounting rules adopted by the Commission's accounting officer are derived from the International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) issued by the International Federation of Accountants or, where relevant, the International Accounting Standards (IAS)/International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) issued by the International Accounting Standards Board.

comprising adequate supervision and appropriate measures to prevent irregularities and fraud and, if necessary, legal proceedings to recover funds wrongly paid or used.

The auditor's responsibility

6. The Court's responsibility is, on the basis of its audit, to provide the European Parliament and the Council⁹ with a statement of assurance as to the reliability of the annual accounts and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions. The Court conducts its audit in accordance with the IFAC International Standards on Auditing and Codes of Ethics and the INTOSAI International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions. These standards require the Court to plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance as to whether the annual accounts of the Foundation are free from material misstatement and the transactions underlying them are legal and regular.

7. The audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the accounts and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions. The procedures selected depend on the auditor's judgement, which is based on an assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the accounts and material non-compliance by the underlying transactions with the requirements in the legal framework of the European Union, whether due to fraud or error. In assessing these risks, the auditor considers any internal controls relevant to the preparation and fair presentation of the accounts, as well as the supervisory and control systems that are implemented to ensure the legality and regularity of underlying transactions, and designs audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances. The audit also entails evaluating the appropriateness of accounting policies, the reasonableness of accounting estimates and the overall presentation of the accounts. In preparing this report and Statement of Assurance, the Court considered the audit work of the independent external auditor performed on the Foundation's accounts as stipulated in Article 208(4) of the EU Financial Regulation¹⁰.

8. The Court considers that the audit evidence obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for its statement of assurance.

⁹ Article 107 of Regulation (EU) No 1271/2013.

¹⁰ Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 966/2012 of the European Parliament and of the Council (OJ L 298, 26.10.2012, p. 1).

Opinion on the reliability of the accounts

9. In the Court's opinion, the Foundation's annual accounts present fairly, in all material respects, its financial position as at 31 December 2015 and the results of its operations and its cash flows for the year then ended, in accordance with the provisions of its Financial Regulation and the accounting rules adopted by the Commission's accounting officer.

Opinion on the legality and regularity of the transactions underlying the accounts

10. In the Court's opinion, the transactions underlying the annual accounts for the year ended 31 December 2015 are legal and regular in all material respects.

FOLLOW-UP OF PREVIOUS YEARS' COMMENTS

11. An overview of the corrective actions taken in response to the Court's comments from previous years is provided in **Annex I**.

This Report was adopted by Chamber IV, headed by Mr Baudilio TOMÉ MUGURUZA, Member of the Court of Auditors, in Luxembourg at its meeting of 13 September 2016.

For the Court of Auditors

(s) Vítor Manuel da SILVA CALDEIRA
President

Follow-up of previous years' comments

Year	Court's comment	Status of corrective action (Completed / Ongoing / Outstanding / N/A)
2013	At the end of 2013, the Foundation had 7,5 million euro in accounts at a single bank with a low credit rating (F3, BBB) ¹ .	Ongoing
2014	Cancellations of appropriations carried-over from 2013 were high for title I (15,9 %) and title II (7,6 %) which indicates an over-estimation of financial needs.	N/A
2014	The overall level of committed appropriations was high at 99,9 %. The level of committed appropriations carried over to 2015 was high for title II (administrative expenditure) at 0,75 million euro, i.e. 36,2 % (2013: 0,55 million euro, i.e. 30 %). The main reason was planned purchases made at the end of 2014 for the renewal of office furniture (0,37 million euro), software (0,14 million euro) and hardware (0,1 million euro).	N/A
2014	In 2005 new EU Staff Regulations entered into force, including provisions that future remunerations of officials recruited before 1 May 2004 should not be less than under the previous EU Staff Regulations. The Court's audit revealed that this was not complied with and, in the case of 2 of the 96 temporary agents employed at that time, this led to a total underpayment of 14 745 euro (salary cost for ETF) for the period 2005 to 2014. The Foundation has made the supplementary salary payments in June 2015.	Completed

¹ Amount reduced to 1,8 million euro.

THE FOUNDATION'S REPLY

The Foundation has taken note of the Court's report.