

Brussels, 11 November 2019 (OR. en)

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 DCL 1

DATAPROTECT 25 JAI 80 MI 145 FREMP 24 RELEX 114

DECLASSIFICATION

of document:	6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
dated:	25 April 2014
new status:	Public
Subject:	Negotiations on the modernisation of the Council of Europe Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of personal data (EST 108)
	- Preparation of the CAHDATA meeting on 28-30 April 2014

Delegations will find attached the declassified version of the above document.

The text of this document is identical to the previous version.

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED



COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

Brussels, 25 April 2014

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

DATAPROTECT 25 JAI 80 MI 145 FREMP 24 RELEX 114

NOTE

from:	Commission Services
to:	Delegations
Subject:	Negotiations on the modernisation of the Council of Europe Convention for the
	Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of personal data
	(EST 108)
	- Preparation of the CAHDATA meeting on 28-30 April 2014

Delegations will find in the Annex the EU proposed position drawn up by the Commission taking into consideration comments made by Member States, in view of the CAHDATA meeting on 28-30 April 2014.

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

Negotiations on the modernisation of the Council of Europe Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of personal data (EST 108)

Update 24/04/14

Information by the Commission with a view to the CAHDATA meeting on 28-30 April 2014 (Strasbourg)

Working Document

Convention 108 with Additional Protocol and Modernisation proposals

Note: the present document aims at making visible the current text of the Convention and Additional Protocol (1st column from the left to the right), the modernisation proposals adopted by the Consultative Committee ("T-PD") at its 29th Plenary meeting (2nd column), the text for discussion at the second CAHDATA meeting that was developed further to the 1st meeting of the CAHDATA and circulated on 25/3 (3rd column), the EU proposed position to the 25/3 proposed text (4th column) as well as the comments received by Member States and clarifications by COM (5th column).

CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL

T-PD PROPOSALS

TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)

EU PROPOSED POSITION COMMENTS

	Title : Convention for the Protection of Individuals with Regard to the Processing of Personal Data	Title : Convention for the Protection of Individuals with Regard to the Processing of Personal Data		
Preamble	Preamble	Preamble		
The member States of the	unchanged	The member States of the		
Council of Europe, signatory		Council of Europe and	Support	
hereto,		other signatories hereto,		
Considering that the aim of the	unchanged	Considering that the aim		
Council of		of the Council of		
Europe is to achieve greater		Europe is to achieve		
unity between its members,		greater unity between		
based in particular on respect		countries, based in	Support	
for the rule of law, as well as		particular on respect for		
human rights and fundamental		the rule of law, as well as		
freedoms;		human rights and		
Considering that it is desirable	Considering that it is	fundamental freedoms;		
Considering that it is desirable to extend the		Considering that it is necessary, given the		
safeguards for everyone's	necessary, given the diversification,	necessary, given the diversification,		
rights and	intensification and	intensification and	Support	DE asks how the right to
fundamental freedoms, and in		globalisation of data	Support	control one's personal
particular the right to the	_ ^	processing and		data is understood.
respect for privacy, taking	-	exchanges of personal		data is dilucistood.
account of the increasing flow		data flows, to secure		
across frontiers of personal		human dignity and the		
data undergoing automatic	9 3	protection of human rights		
processing;	and fundamental	and fundamental		
3,	freedoms of every person,			

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

2

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

EN

DESTDEINT HE/EH DESTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	in particular through the right to control one's personal data and the processing of such data.	in particular the right to personal autonomy, exercised through the right to control of one's personal data and of the processing of such data.			
Reaffirming at the same time their commitment to freedom of information regardless of frontiers;	Recalling that the right to protection of personal data is to be considered in respect of its role in society and that it has to be reconciled with other human rights and fundamental freedoms, including freedom of expression;	Recalling that the right to protection of personal data is to be considered in respect of its role in society and that it has to be reconciled with other human rights and fundamental freedoms, including freedom of expression;	Support		
	Considering that this Convention permits account to be taken, in the implementation of the rules laid down therein, of the principle of the right of public access to official documents;	Considering that this Convention permits account to be taken, in the implementation of the rules laid down therein, of the principle of the right of public access to official documents;	Support		
Recognising that it is necessary to reconcile the fundamental values of the respect for privacy and the free flow of information between peoples,	the global level the fundamental values of respect for privacy and protection of personal data, thereby contributing to the free	necessary to promote at the global level the fundamental values of respect for privacy and protection of personal data at the global level,	Support		

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

3

EN

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL between peoples: between peoples: Recognising the interest of Recognising the interest of a reinforcement of a reinforcement of international cooperation international cooperation Support between the Parties to the between the Parties to the Convention Convention Have agreed as follows: Support unchanged unchanged Chapter I - General Chapter Chapter I – General I – General provisions provisions provisions Article 1 - Object and Article 1 - Object and Article 1 - Object and purpose purpose purpose of purpose of this of this EU The purpose this The The purpose position reserved subject CZ prefers "territory" over Convention is to secure in the Convention is to secure for Convention is to secure for further to "jurisdiction", finding the territory of each Party for every individual subject to every individual subject to discussion. every individual, whatever his the jurisdiction of the the jurisdiction of the latter to be confusing. residence. Parties. whatever their Parties. whatever their nationality or nationality or residence. ES considers use of term respect for his rights and nationality or residence. fundamental freedoms, and in the protection of their the protection of their "jurisdiction" to he particular his right to privacy. personal data personal data when when essential. with regard to automatic undergoing processing, undergoing processing, processing of personal data thus contributing to thus contributing COM: In view of further respect for their rights and respect for their rights and coordination. see him ("data relating to fundamental fundamental background information at freedoms. freedoms. protection"). and in particular their right and in particular their right the following document on the reasons for introducing to privacy. to privacy. the concept of jurisdiction Article draft 1 modernised text by T-PD Convention 108: http://www.coe.int/t/dahl/st andardsetting/dataprotecti on/TPD documents/Memo

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

4

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

F.N

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **POSITION COMMENTS CONVENTION AND** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL randum%20on%20introdu cina%20the%20conc%20 %20of%20jurisdiction%20(J-PH%20Moinv)%20E.pdf **Article 2 – Definitions Article 2 – Definitions** Article 2 - Definitions For the purposes of this unchanged Support unchanged Convention: "personal data" means unchanged unchanged Support any information relating to an identified or identifiable individual ("data subject"); Support Deleted - see 3.1 below "automated data file" Deleted – see 3.1 below means any set of data undergoing automatic processing; "data processing" "data processing" Support subject to addition "automatic processing" means any operation or means any operation or of the word "destruction" BE LT and prefer includes the set of operations which set of operations which "erasure" over "destruction following operations if carried "data processing" of data" ("erasure" performed nogu performed nogu out in whole or in part by personal data, and in personal data, and in means any operation or incorporate any kind of automated means: storage of particular the collection, particular such as the set of operations which destruction): BE data data, carrying out of logical storage. preservation. collection. storage. performed would like to cover both nogu and/or arithmetical operations alteration. preservation, alteration, retrieval. personal data, and in authorised and on those data, their alteration. retrieval. disclosure. particular such as the disclosure. making unauthorised destruction. retrieval erasure. available. erasure **or** making available. collection. storage. dissemination: erasure. or destruction of destruction of data, or preservation, alteration, COM comment: Both the carrying out of data, or the carrying out retrieval. disclosure. authorised or unauthorised of logical and/or making available. destruction of data should logical and/or arithmetical operations arithmetical operations erasure, or destruction of be covered as a data on such data: data, or the carrying out processing operation (cf. on data:

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 5

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
			of logical and/or arithmetical operations on such data;	definition of processing contained at EU level in Article 2 (b) of Directive 95/46/EC; or at national level, e.g. in Section 1(1) of the Irish Data Protection Act 1988(revised).	
	where no automated processing is used, data processing means the operations carried out within a structured set established according to any criteria which allow to search for personal data;	where no automated processing is not used, data processing means an the operations—or set of operations—performed upon personal data earried out within a structured set of such data which are accessible and retrievable according to specific criteria—established according to any criteria which allow to search for personal data;	Support		
d "controller of the file" means the natural or legal person, public authority, agency or any other body who is competent according to the national law to decide what should be the purpose of the automated data file, which categories of personal data should be	d "controller" means the natural or legal person, public authority, service, agency or any other body which alone or jointly with others has the decision-making power with respect to data processing.	d "controller" means the natural or legal person, public authority, service, agency or any other body which alone or jointly with others has the decision-making power with respect to data processing.	Support		

	DESTDEINT HE/EH DESTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
stored and which operations should be applied to them.					
	e "recipient" means a	e "recipient" means a	Support		
	natural or legal person,	natural or legal person,			
	public authority, service,	public authority, service,			
	agency or any other body	agency or any other body			
	to whom data are	to whom data are			
	disclosed or made	disclosed or made	(A		
	available;	available;			
	f "processor" means a	f "processor" means a	Support		
	natural or legal person,	natural or legal person,	, , ,		
	public authority, service,	public authority, service,			
	agency or any other body	agency or any other body			
	which processes personal	which processes personal			
	data on behalf of the	data on behalf of the			
	controller;	controller;			
Article 3 – Scope	Article 3 – Scope	Article 3 – Scope			
1 The Parties undertake to	1	1 Each Party undertakes			
apply this	to apply this Convention to	to apply this Convention to	first paragraph, support		
Convention to automated personal data files and	data processing subject to its jurisdiction,	data processing subject to its jurisdiction in the	text as proposed by T-PD.	protection of personal data	
personal data files and automatic processing of	thereby protecting the	public and private		of any person subject to its jurisdiction" should go to	
personal data in the public and	right to protection of	sectors, thereby		the Explanatory Report but	
private sectors.	personal data of any	protecting the right to		not in the text (cf. Art. 1).	
F 410 00010101	person subject to its	protection of personal			
	jurisdiction.	data of any person		NL would like to have the	
		subject to its		last part of sentence	
	1bis This Convention	jurisdiction.		deleted and suggests	
	shall not apply to data			instead to add "whatever	
	processing carried out by	1bis This Convention		his nationality or	
	a natural person for the	shall not apply to data		residence".	
	exercise of purely	processing carried out by			

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

7

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL CZ suggests deleting the personal a natural person for the or household activities. of purely adjective "purely". exercise personal or household DE places a reservation activities. the household on exception against the difficulties of finding purely personal or household e.g. in the activities internet; DE suggests to further concretise this concept. 2 Any State may, at the delete Support delete time of signature or when depositing its instrument of ratification. acceptance. approval or accession, or at any later time, give notice by a declaration addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe: a that it will not apply this delete delete Support Convention to categories certain automated personal data files. a list of which will be deposited. In this list it shall include. however. not categories of automated data files subject under its domestic protection law to data provisions. Consequently, it shall amend this list by a new

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

BGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED T-PD PROPOSALS **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL declaration whenever additional categories automated personal data files subjected to data protection provisions under its domestic law: bthat it will also apply this delete Support delete Convention to information relating to groups of persons, associations. foundations. companies, corporations and any other bodies consisting directly or indirectly of individuals, whether or not such bodies possess legal personality; cthat it will also apply this delete delete Support Convention to personal data files which are not processed automatically. 3Any State which has delete delete Support extended the scope of this Convention by any of the declarations provided for in sub-paragraph 2.b above may give notice in the said declaration that such extensions shall apply only to categories certain personal data files, a list of which will be deposited.

DECEDEINT HE/EH DECEDICTED						
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS		
4Any Party which has excluded certain categories of automated personal data files by a declaration provided for in sub-	delete	delete	Support			
paragraph 2.a above may not claim the application of this Convention to such categories by a Party which has not excluded them.						
5Likewise, a Party which has not made one or other of the extensions provided for in		delete	Support			
sub-paragraphs 2b and c above may not claim the application of this Convention on these points with respect to a Party which has made such extensions.		653				
6The declarations provided for in paragraph 2 above shall take effect from the moment of the entry into force of the Convention with regard to the State which has made them if they have been made at the time of signature or deposit of its instrument of ratification, acceptance, approval or accession, or three months after their		delete	Support			

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL receipt by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe if they have been made at any later time. These declarations may be withdrawn, in whole or in by a notification part. addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe. Such withdrawals effect three shall take months after the date of receipt of such notification. Chapter II - Basic Chapter II - Basic Chapter II – Basic principles principles for the principles for the for data protection protection of personal protection of personal data data Article 4 - Duties of the Article 4 – Duties of the Article 4 - Duties of the **Parties Parties Parties** 1Each Party shall take the Each Party shall take Each Party shall take Support text as proposed CZ considers paragraphs necessary measures in its the necessary measures the necessary measures by T-PD. 1 and 2 to be superfluous domestic law to give effect to in its domestic law to give in its domestic law to give and suggests to delete the basic principles for data effect to the provisions set effect to the provisions set them. out in this Convention protection set out in this out in this Convention ES chapter. and ensure their and secure their suggests either effective application. effective application. keeping "ensure" or replacing "secure" bv "guarantee". COM: T-PD text seems more straight forward (why adjective should the

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL "domestic" be deleted?). To ensure is to make something happen, which is stronger than 'secure' (which only requires best efforts). 2 These measures shall 2 These measures shall Support 2These measures shall be be taken by each Party be taken by each Party taken at the latest at the time prior to ratification or prior to ratification or of entry into force of this Convention in respect of that accession to this accession to this Partv. Convention. Convention. 3 Each Party undertakes 3 Each Party undertakes Support to allow the Convention to allow the Convention Committee provided for in Committee provided for in Chapter V to evaluate the Chapter V to evaluate the measures it has taken in observance of to its law to give effect to the engagements and contribute actively to this provisions of this evaluation, notably Convention observance of submitting reports on the its engagements and to measures it has taken and contribute actively to this which give effect to the evaluation process. provisions of the present notably by submitting reports on the measures it Convention. has taken and which give effect to the provisions of the present Convention. Article 5 - Legitimacy of Article 5 - Legitimacy of Article 5 - Quality of data data processing and data processing and quality of data quality of data Data processing Data processing Support shall be proportionate in shall be proportionate in IE raises questions on

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

12

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

EN

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL relation to the legitimate relation to the legitimate how proportionality would pursued and transposed pursued and purpose into purpose reflect at all stages of the reflect at all stages of the national law giving effect processing a fair balance processing a fair balance to the Convention. all interests all between between interests concerned, be they public concerned, be they public or private interests, and or private interests, and the rights and freedoms at I the rights and freedoms at stake stake Each Party shall 2 Each Party shall EU position reserved FR, LT in favour of "exlicit 2 provide provide that data that data consent". processing can be carried processing can be carried out on the basis of the out on the basis of the ES, RO, SI in favour of free, specific, informed "unambiguous consent". free, specific, informed and [explicit, and Texplicit. unambiguous] consent of unambiguous] consent of NL raises questions on the data subject or of the data subject or of other legal basis of some legitimate basis laid some legitimate basis laid processing (beyond down by law. down by law. consent). undergoing 3 Personal data Personal data Personal data Support automatic processing shall undergoing automatic undergoing automatic be: processing shall be: processing shall be: aobtained and processed lawfully. NL is wondering whether processed lawfully Support processed "transparent" is clear in fairly and lawfully; and fairly. and fairly and in a this context (cf. Art. 7bis). transparent manner. bstored for specified and b. collected for b. **collected** for Support legitimate purposes and not explicit, specified and specified explicit, used in a way incompatible legitimate purposes and legitimate purposes and not **processed** in a way with those purposes; not **processed** in a way

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

13

	DECT	DEINT HE/FH DECTDICT	FI	
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	incompatible with those purposes;	incompatible with those purposes;		
cadequate, relevant and not excessive in relation to the purposes for which they are stored;		c. adequate, relevant and [not excessive] and [limited to the minimum necessary] in relation to the purposes for which they are processed;	Partial reservation: "not excessive" is to be included in all cases; possibility to refer back to the text proposed by the T-PD.	ES, IE prefer keeping "not excessive" (along with the other adjectives) while deleting "limited to the minimum necessary". LT would like to keep "limited to the minimum necessary". SI to keep "not excessive". COM prefers to maintain both "not excessive" and "limited to the minimum necessary" to underline expressly both dimensions of the principle of minimisation.
daccurate and, where necessary, kept up to date;		unchanged	Support	
epreserved in a form which permits identification of the data subjects for no longer than is required for the purpose for which those data are stored.	e preserved in a form which permits identification of data subjects for no longer than is necessary for the purposes for which those data are processed .	e. preserved in a form which permits identification of data subjects for no longer than is necessary for the purposes for which those data are processed .	Support	

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 14

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

DECEDEINT HE/EH DECEDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
Article 6 - Special categories of data	Article 6 – Processing of sensitive data	Article 6 – Processing of sensitive data			
Personal data revealing racial origin, political opinions or religious or other beliefs, as well as personal data concerning health or sexual life, may not be processed automatically unless domestic law provides appropriate safeguards. The same shall apply to personal data relating to criminal convictions.	1 The processing of genetic data, of personal data concerning offences, criminal convictions and related security measures, the processing of biometric data uniquely identifying a person, as well as the processing of personal data for the information they reveal relating to racial origin, political opinions, tradeunion membership, religious or other beliefs, health or sexual life, shall only be allowed where the applicable law provides appropriate safeguards, complementing those of the present Convention. 2. Appropriate safeguards shall prevent the risks that the processing of such sensitive data may present to the interests, rights and fundamental freedoms of the data subject, notably a risk of discrimination.		EU position reserved; preferable to keep the end of the sentence as proposed by T-PD ("complementing those of the present Convention"), which clarifies that the safeguards are not the ones generally foreseen by the Convention but additional ones.	DE suggests further exploring the context in which data is used. ES asks for clarifications on the concept of "biometric data", possibly in the Explanatory Report. IE would like the last part of the sentence ("complementing those of the present Convention") to be deleted. COM: Is "safeguards [] enshrined in law" the same as "where the applicable law provides appropriate safeguards"?	

	DECI			
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
		to the interests, rights and fundamental freedoms of the data subject, notably a risk of discrimination.		
Article 7 – Data security	Article 7 - Data security	Article 7 – Data security		
Appropriate security measures shall be taken for the protection of personal data stored in automated data files against accidental or unauthorised destruction or accidental loss as well as against unauthorised access, alteration or dissemination.	1 Every Party shall provide that the controller, and, where applicable the processor, takes the appropriate security measures against accidental or unauthorised access, destruction, loss modification or dissemination of personal data.	1 Every Party shall provide that the controller, and, where applicable the processor, takes the appropriate security measures against risks such as accidental or unauthorised access to, destruction, loss, use, modification or disclosure of personal data.	Support	
	2 Each Party shall provide that the controller shall notify, without delay, at least the supervisory authorities within the meaning of Article 12 bis of this Convention of those data breaches which may seriously interfere with the rights and fundamental freedoms of data subjects.	2 Each Party shall provide that the controller shall notify, without delay, at least the supervisory authorities within the meaning of Article 12 bis of this Convention of those data breaches which may seriously interfere with the rights and fundamental freedoms of data subjects.	Support	
	Article 7bis –	Article 7bis -		

DECTRING HE/EH DECTRICTED

DESTDEINT HE/EH DESTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
		Transparency of		
	processing	processing		
	1 Each Party shall see to	1 Each Party shall	EU position reserved	While agreeing with COM,
	it that the controller	provide that where	subject to further	BE suggests to replace
	ensures the transparency	personal data are	discussion; possibility to	"provide" by the verb
	of data processing by	collected from data	refer back to the text	"promote" / "encourage".
	informing the data	subjects or indirectly from	proposed by the T-PD or	
	subjects, unless they have	another source, unless	see following alternative:	DE suggests to further
	already been informed, of	they have already been		concretise the extent to
	at least the identity and	informed, the controller	1 Each Party shall provide	which the transparency
	habitual residence or	shall be responsible for	that the controller	obligations apply and to
	establishment of the	informing the data	ensures the	balance the individuals'
	controller, the purposes of	subjects of at least the	transparency of data	interest with the
	the processing carried out,	identity and habitual	processing by informing	controller's burocratic
	the data processed, the	residence or	the data subjects, where	burden.
	recipients or categories of	establishment of the	personal data are	IE : 1
	recipients of the personal	controller and the	collected from data	IE in favour of the 25/3
	data, and the means of	purposes of the	subjects or indirectly from	proposed text -on "lawful"
	exercising the rights set	processing for which the	another source unless	(processing), IE suggests
	out in Article 8, as well as	data are intended carried	they have already been	that this is not dealt with in
	any other information	out, the data processed,	informed, of <u>at least</u> the	this Article.
	necessary to ensure fair	the recipients or	identity and habitual	The second the March Const
	and lawful data	categories of recipients of	residence or	HU would like "the legal
	processing.	the personal data, and the	establishment of the	basis for processing" to be
		means of exercising the	controller. and the	added in the information to
		rights set out in Article 8,	purposes of the	be provided to data
		as well as providing them	processing for which the	subjects.
		with any additional other	data are intended, the	COM. The many many many
		information necessary to	data processed, the	COM: The new proposed
		ensure fair and	recipients or categories of	formulation with the
		transparent lawful data	recipients of the personal	subordinate clauses is
		processing of the personal	data, and the means of	less straight-forward. The
		data.	exercising the rights set	suggested reformulation

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

17

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

EN

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL out in Article 8. as well as the controller's places providing them with any transparency requirement additional other information at the beginning of the necessary to ensure fair. sentence and resembles and transparent the text as agreed at and lawful data processing of technical level. It also the personal data. includes important elements of transparency. such as information to data subjects relating to the exercise of their rights. COM: The addition of 'transparent' after 'fair' is to be welcomed. lawfulness should also be maintained. Where the personal 2. Where the personal Support BE points out that even data are not collected from data are not collected from when data is collected the data subjects, the the data subjects, the from data subjects controller shall controller shall to the exceptions nonetheless nonetheless not be not be information of data subject required to provide such required to provide such may apply. information where the information where the is expressly processing is expressly processing prescribed by law or this prescribed by law or this proves to be impossible or proves to be impossible or involves disproportionate involves disproportionate efforts. efforts. Article 8 - Rights of the Article 8 - Rights of the 8 Additional Article data subject data subject

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

18

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL safeguards for the data subject Any person shall be enabled: COM: "Shall have the be Support subject to slight Any person shall Every person shall be modification; possibility to right" is simpler and more entitled. entitled. refer back to the text straightforward that "be entitled to": the latter might proposed by the T-PD. also risk to be understood Every person shall be as weakening the data entitled have the right: subject's rights. a not to be subject to a a not to be subject to a Support subject to slight ato establish the existence of an automated personal data significantly significantly modification; possibility to ES would like "solely" to decision decision file, its main purposes, as affecting him/her, based affecting him/her, based refer back to the text be maintained. well as the identity and solely on an automatic solely on an automated proposed by the T-PD. habitual residence processing of data without automatic processing of principal place of business of having their views taken data without having their a not to to be subject to a the controller of the file: significantly into consideration: views taken decision into consideration; affecting him/her, based solely on an automated automatic processing of data without having their views taken into consideration;

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DESTDICT	FN	
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	b to object at any time to the processing of personal data concerning him/her unless the controller demonstrates compelling legitimate grounds for the processing which override their interests or rights and fundamental freedoms;	the processing of personal data concerning him/her unless the controller demonstrates compelling legitimate grounds for the processing which override their interests or rights and fundamental freedoms; (moved to new d.)	Support	
bto obtain at reasonable intervals and without excessive delay or expense confirmation of whether personal data relating to him are stored in the automated data file as well as communication to him of such data in an intelligible form;	request, at reasonable intervals and without excessive delay or expense confirmation of the processing of personal data relating to him/her, the communication in an intelligible form of the data processed, all available information on their origin, on the preservation period as well as any other information that the controller is required to provide to ensure the transparency of processing	request, at reasonable intervals and without excessive delay or expense confirmation of the processing of personal data relating to him/her, the communication in an intelligible form of the data processed, all available information on their origin, on the preservation retention period as well as any other information that the controller is required to provide to ensure the transparency of	deletion of "compelling" (grounds); possibility to refer back to the text proposed by the T-PD. b be entitled to obtain, on request, at reasonable intervals and without excessive delay or expense confirmation of the processing of personal data relating to him/her, the communication in an intelligible form of the data processed, all available information on their origin, on the	

DESTREINT HE/EH DESTRICTED						
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS		
	7bis paragraph 1; d to obtain, on request, knowledge of the reasoning underlying the data processing, the results of which are applied to him/her;	c be entitled to obtain, on request, knowledge of the reasoning underlying the data processing, the results of which are applied to him/her; d be entitled to object at any time to the processing of personal data concerning him/her unless the controller demonstrates compelling legitimate grounds for the processing which override their interests or rights and fundamental freedoms;	period as well as any other information that the controller is required to provide to ensure the transparency of processing in accordance with Article 7bis paragraph 1; c be entitled to obtain, on request, knowledge of the reasoning underlying the data processing, the results of which are applied to him/her; d be entitled to object at any time to the processing of personal data concerning him/her unless the controller demonstrates compelling legitimate grounds for the processing which override their interests or rights and fundamental freedoms;	BE agrees with COM on "compelling" and would like to have even stricter right of opposition. DE suggests considering possible consequences in the formulation of the right to object. IE in favour of deleting "compelling" (grounds). COM: 'Compelling' is the reason why the legitimate grounds in the case at hand override the data subject's rights; this wording derives from Article 14(a) of Directive 95/46/EC.		

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 21

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

	DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS		
cto obtain, as the case may be, rectification or erasure of such data if these have been processed contrary to the provisions of domestic law giving effect to the basic principles set out in Articles 5 and 6 of this Convention;	•	e be entitled to obtain, upon on request, as the case may be, rectification or erasure of such data if these have been processed contrary to the law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention;	Support subject to slight modification; oppose the deletion of "compelling" (grounds); possibility to refer back to the text proposed by the T-PD. e _be_entitled to obtain, upon on request, as the case may be, rectification or erasure of such data if these have been processed contrary to the law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention;			
dto have a remedy if a request for confirmation or, as the case may be, communication, rectification or erasure as referred to in paragraphs b and c of this article is not complied with.		See f below				
	f to have a remedy if a decision significantly affecting them has been taken without taking into consideration their views or no response is given to a request for confirmation, communication, rectification, erasure or to	f be entitled to have a remedy if a decision significantly affecting them, based solely on an automated processing, has been taken without having taken his/her views taking into consideration their views	Support subject to slight modification; possibility to refer back to the text proposed by the T-PD. f be entitled to have a remedy if a decision significantly affecting them, based	ES suggests keeping "solely". COM: "based solely on an automated processing" is part of the acquis – cf. Article 15.		

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 22

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

	DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	an objection, as referred to in this Article;	or no response is given to a request under this Article has been received from the controller for confirmation, communication, rectification, erasure or to an objection, as referred to in this Article;	solely on an automated processing, has been taken without having taken his/her views taking into consideration their views or no response is given to a request under this Article has been received from the controller for confirmation, communication, rectification, erasure or to an objection, as referred to in this Article;		
	g to benefit, whatever their residence, from the assistance of a supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis, in exercising the rights provided by this Convention.	g be entitled to benefit, whatever their residence, from the assistance of a supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis, in exercising the rights provided by this Convention.	Support subject to slight modification; possibility to refer back to the text proposed by the T-PD. g <u>be entitled</u> to benefit, whatever their residence, from the assistance of a supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis, in exercising the rights provided by this Convention.	HU raises question on the interaction with the one-stop-shop mechanism.	
	Article 8bis – Additional obligations	Article 8bis – Additional obligations			
	1- Each Party shall provide that the controller, or where applicable the processor, shall take at all		EU position reserved subject to further discussion.	CZ suggests maintaining the deletion of the 25/3 proposed text, as these requirements will not	

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 23

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DECTDICT	FN	T
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	authorities provided for in Article 12 bis of this Convention the compliance with the applicable law. 2- Each Party shall	the processing all appropriate measures to implement the provisions giving effect to the principles and obligations of this Convention and to establish internal mechanisms to verify and be able to demonstrate at least to the supervisory authorities provided for in Article 12 bis that the data processing under their control is in compliance with the measures taken to give effect to this Convention of this Convention the compliance with the applicable law.		enable any Party to verify compliance. IE in favour of 25/3 proposed text; deleted text can go to the Explanatory Report. NL finds this article very detailed; discussion at EU level not yet conclusive. COM: "At least" should be maintained because others, such as the Courts or, if appropriate, data subjects, would also benefit from this.
	a risk analysis of the potential impact of the intended data processing on the rights and fundamental freedoms of the data subject and design data processing operations in such a way as to prevent or at least	2- Each Party shall provide that the controllers and, or where applicable, processors, shall undertake a risk assessment of the likely carry out a risk analysis of the potential impact of the intended data processing on the data protection rights and fundamental freedoms of the data		CZ suggests limiting obligation to perform an impact assessment to high risk processing. DE questions the mandatory requirement to assess the impact of all processing operations without distinction. LT in favour of exceptions

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 24

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	interference with those rights and fundamental freedoms.	subjects prior to the commencement of such processing, and shall design data processing operations in a manner which such a way as to prevents or at least minimises the risk of interference with those rights and fundamental freedoms.		for prosecution of criminal offences.	
	provide that the products and services intended for the data processing shall take into account the implications of the right to the protection of personal data from the stage of their design and facilitate the compliance of the processing with the applicable law. 4- Each Party can take the measures needed to adapt the application of the provisions of the	take into account the implications of the right to the protection of personal data from the stage of their design and facilitate the compliance of the processing with the applicable law. 4 3- Each Party may, having regard to the risks	Support	DE agrees to maintain T-PD text. IE supports deletion of this paragraph, since it is unworkable in practice to impose such an obligation to producers/designers of products/services.	

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 25
DGD2B RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED EN

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DECTDICT	FN	
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	according to the size of the controller, or where applicable the processor, the volume or nature of data processed and, more generally, in light of the risks for the interests, rights and fundamental freedoms of the data subjects.	subjects—can—take—the measures needed to adapt the application of the provisions of the previous in paragraphs 1 and 2 in the measures giving effect to the provisions of this Convention, according to the nature of the data, the nature, scope and purpose of the processing and the size of the controller, or where applicable the processor, the volume or nature of data processed and, more generally, in light of the risks for the interests, rights—and fundamental freedoms—of the data subjects.		
Article 9 – Exceptions and restrictions	Article 9 – Exceptions and restrictions	Article 9 – Exceptions and restrictions		
1 No exception to the provisions of Articles 5, 6 and 8 of this Convention shall be allowed except within the limits defined in this article.	1 No exception to the principles expressed in this Chapter shall be allowed, except to the provisions of Articles 5.3, 7.2, 7bis and 8 when such derogation is provided for by law and constitutes a necessary measure in a	the principles expressed in this Chapter shall be allowed, except to the provisions of Articles 5.3, 7.2, 7bis and 8 when such derogation	Support	BE and HU suggest that not all exceptions from Article 5 paragraph 3 are allowed (e.g. lawfulness of processing must always be maintained). CZ suggests broadening national security

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 26
DGD2B RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED EN

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED T-PD PROPOSALS **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL democratic society for: democratic society for: exemptions to apply to Article 12 (5) and to Article 12bis. NL suggests adding following paragraph: "No exception to the principles expressed in this Chapter shall be allowed, except to the provisions of Articles 5.3, 6, 7.2, 7bis, 8 and 8 bis, when such derogation provided bv an accessible and foreseeable law and constitutes a necessary measure in a democratic society for the protection of national security". delete 2 Derogation from the delete Support provisions of Articles 5, 6 and 8 of this Convention shall be allowed when such derogation is provided for by the law of the Party and constitutes а necessary measure in a democratic society in the interests of: a protecting State the protection of a the protection of security. Support а national security, public public safety, the monetary national security, public interests of the State or the safetv. important safetv. important suppression criminal economic and financial economic and financial of

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

27

EN

DECEDEINT HE/EH DECEDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
offences;	interests of the State or the prevention and suppression of criminal offences;	interests of the State or the prevention, investigation and prosecution of criminal offences;			
b protecting the data subject or the rights and freedoms of others.		•	Support		
	2 Restrictions on the exercise of the provisions specified in Article 12 may also admitted where they are provided by law and constitute a necessary measure in a democratic society for the freedom of expression.	2 Restrictions on the exercise of the provisions specified in Article 12 may also be allowed admitted where they are provided by law and constitute a necessary measure in a democratic society for the freedom of expression.	Support		
3Restrictions on the exercise of the rights specified in Article 8, paragraphs b, c and d, may be provided by law with respect to automated personal data files used for statistics or for scientific research purposes when there is obviously no risk of an infringement of the	3 Restrictions on the exercise of the provisions specified in Articles 7bis and 8 may be provided by law with respect to data processing for statistical purposes or for the	3 Restrictions on the exercise of the provisions specified in Articles 7bis and 8 may be provided by law with respect to data processing for statistical purposes or for the purposes of scientific research, when there is obviously no risk of	Support		

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL privacy of the data subjects. fundamental fundamental and and freedoms of freedoms ٥f data data subjects. subjects. Article 10 - Sanctions and Article 10 - Sanctions Article 10 - Sanctions remedies and remedies and remedies Support Each Party undertakes to Each Party undertakes to Each Party undertakes to establish establish appropriate establish appropriate CZ suggests clarifying that appropriate sanctions and remedies for iudicial and non-iudicial iudicial and non-iudicial unclear/verv certain violations of provisions of sanctions and remedies sanctions and remedies general obligations (e.g. domestic law giving effect to for violations of domestic for violations of domestic data protection by design) the basic principles for data law giving effect to the are not enforced by law giving effect to the of this protection set out in this of provisions sanctions. provisions this Convention. chapter. Convention. Article 11 Extended Article 114 Extended Article 11 - Extended protection protection protection None of the provisions of this unchanged unchanged Support chapter shall be interpreted as limiting or otherwise affecting the possibility for a Party to grant data subjects a wider measure of protection than that stipulated in this Convention. Chapter III -Chapter III -Chapter III - Transborder Transborder flows of Transborder flows of data flows personal data personal data Article 12 - Transborder Article 12 - Transborder Article 12 - Transborder flows of personal data flows of personal data flows of personal data and domestic law 1 The following provisions shall Delete Support Delete apply to the transfer across

	DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS		
national borders, by whatever medium, of personal data undergoing automatic processing or collected with a view to their being automatically processed.						
2A Party shall not, for the sole purpose of the protection of privacy, prohibit or subject to special authorisation transborder flows of personal data going to the territory of another Party.	1. A Party shall not, for the sole purpose of the protection of personal data, prohibit or subject to special authorisation the transfer of data to a recipient who is subject to the jurisdiction of another Party to the Convention, unless the Party referred to at the beginning of the present paragraph is regulated by binding harmonised rules of protection shared by States belonging to a regional international organisation and the transfer of data is not governed by measures provided for in paragraph 3.b.	1. A Party shall not, for the sole purpose of the protection of personal data, prohibit or subject to special authorisation the transfer of data to a recipient who is subject to the jurisdiction of another Party to the Convention. Such a Party may however do so if bound by binding harmonised rules of protection shared by States belonging to a regional international organisation and where the transfer of data is not governed by measures provided for in paragraph 3.b.	Support provided that "binding" (to qualify the harmonised rules of protection, which cannot be e.g. soft law instruments) is reinserted and the last part of the last sentence is deleted: 1. A Party shall not, for the sole purpose of the protection of personal data, prohibit or subject to special authorisation the transfer of data to a recipient who is subject to the jurisdiction of another Party to the Convention. Such a Party may however do so if bound by binding harmonised rules of protection shared by States belonging to a regional international organisation and where the transfer of data is not	SI suggests further clarifying the meaning of "bound by harmonised rules", what constitutes a "regional organisation" etc. ES questions the need to delete the last part of the sentence. COM: The last part of the last sentence should be deleted, since the EU MS may further restrict transfers on the basis of BCRs, Standard contractual clauses etc. (measures provided for in		

<u>DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDIC</u>TED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL governed by measures paragraph 3b can also provided for in paragraph include standardised 3.b. safeguards as provided for in Article 19 g). 2. Support Nevertheless. each 2. When the recipient When the recipient Party shall be entitled to is subject to the is subject to the derogate from the provisions iurisdiction of a State or jurisdiction of a State or international organisation international organisation of paragraph 2: which is not Party to the which is not Party to this Convention, the transfer of Convention, the transfer of data can only occur where data can only occur where an appropriate level of an appropriate level of personal data protection personal data protection based on the principles of based on the principles of the Convention is this Convention is quaranteed. ensured. An appropriate An appropriate level of protection can be level of protection can be ensured by: ensured by: a) the law of that State or a) the law of that State or international organisation, international organisation, including the applicable including the applicable international treaties or international treaties or agreements, or agreements, or b ad hoc or approved b) ad hoc or approved standardised safeguards standardised safeguards provided by legally binding provided by legally binding and enforceable and enforceable instruments adopted and instruments adopted and implemented by the implemented by the

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	persons involved in the transfer and further processing.	persons involved in the transfer and further processing.			
a insofar as its legislation includes specific regulations for certain categories of personal data or of automated personal data files, because of the nature of those data or those files, except where the regulations of the other Party provide an equivalent protection;	4. Notwithstanding the provisions of the previous paragraphs, each Party may provide that the transfer of data may take place, if: a) the data subject has given his/her specific, free and [explicit, unambiguous] consent, after being informed of risks arising in the absence of appropriate safeguards, or b) the specific interests of the data subject require it in the particular case, or c) prevailing legitimate interests, in particular important public interests, are provided by law and constitute a necessary measure in a democratic society.	4. Notwithstanding the provisions of the previous paragraphs, each Party may provide that the transfer of data may take place, if: a) the data subject has given his/her specific, free and [explicit, unambiguous] consent, after being informed of risks arising in the absence of appropriate safeguards, or b) the specific interests of the data subject require it in the particular case, or c) prevailing legitimate interests, in particular important public interests, are provided for by law and constitute a necessary measure in a democratic society.	Support		

CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	5. Each Party shall provide that the competent supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis of the Convention be informed of the modalities regulating the transfers of data provided for in paragraphs 3.b when ad hoc safeguards are set up, 4.b and 4.c. It shall also provide that the supervisory authority be entitled to request that the person who transfers data, or the recipient, demonstrate the quality and effectiveness of actions taken and that the supervisory authority be entitled to prohibit, suspend or subject to condition such transfers of data.	5. Each Party shall provide that the competent supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis of the Convention be provided with all relevant information in relation to modalities regulating the transfers of data provided for in paragraphs 3.b when ad hoc safeguards are set up, 4.b and 4.c. It shall also provide that the supervisory authority be entitled to request that the person who transfers data, or the recipient, demonstrate the effectiveness of the safeguards quality and effectiveness of actions taken and that the supervisory authority be entitled to prohibit, suspend or subject to condition such transfers where the safeguards are deemed inadequate of data.	Support the text proposed by T-PD or reformulate as follows: 5. Each Party shall provide that the competent supervisory authority within the meaning of Article 12 bis of the Convention be provided with all relevant information in relation to data transfers according to paragraphs 3.b when ad hoc safeguards are set up, 4.b and 4.c, including on the ad-hoc transfers. It shall also provide that the supervisory authority be entitled to request that the person who transfers data, or the recipient, demonstrates the effectiveness of the safeguards -adopted measures -quality and effectiveness of actions taken and that the supervisory authority be entitled to prohibit, suspend or subject to condition such transfers where the measures and	ES proposes to delete "4.b and 4.c". HU questions the need for DPAs authorisation in case of transfers on the basis of paragraph 4b and partly 4c. IE against submitting all relevant information to DPAs prior to data transfers. COM: The "safeguards" are only with respect to para. 3.b (ad hoc safeguards provided by legally binding instruments), but not with respect to 4.b and 4.c, where a balance of interests takes place. Therefore, the term "measures" (referring to this balance) should also be used. COM: The term "not [] appropriate" should be preferred over the term "inadequate", which has a

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED

33 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np EN DGD2B

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL safeguards are not specific meaning with deemed inadequate respect to the EU acquis. appropriate. of data. when the transfer is Delete Support Delete made from its territory to the territory of a non Contracting State through the intermediary of the territory of another Party, in order to avoid such transfers resulting in circumvention of the legislation of the Party referred to at the beginning of this paragraph. NL suggests adding following paragraph: "(6) exception to the An principles expressed in this article shall be allowed when such derogation is provided by an accessible and foreseeable law and constitutes a necessary measure in a democratic society for the protection of national security". (Article 12 above replaces (Article 12 above replaces Article 2 – Transborder flows the old Article 12 and the old Article 12 and of personal data to a recipient Article 2 of the Additional Article 2 of the Additional which is not subject to the Protocol) Protocol) jurisdiction of a Party to the Convention (Additional

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL Protocol) 1 Each Party shall provide for Delete Support Delete the transfer of personal data to a recipient that is subject to the jurisdiction of a State or organisation that is not Party to the Convention only if that State or organisation ensures an adequate level of protection for the intended data transfer. By way of derogation Delete Delete Support from paragraph 1 of Article 2 of this Protocol, each Party may allow for the transfer of personal data: if domestic law Delete Delete Support provides for it because of: Delete Delete Support specific interests of the data subject, or Delete Delete Support prevailing legitimate interests, especially important public interests, or if safequards, which Delete Delete Support can in particular result from contractual clauses. are provided by the controller responsible for the transfer and are found adequate by the competent authorities according to domestic law. **Additional Protocol** Ш bis Chapter Chapter Ш bis

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DECTDICT	FN	T
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	Supervisory authorities	Supervisory authorities		
Article 1	Article 12bis Supervisory authorities	Article 12bis Supervisory authorities		
1 Each Party shall provide for one or more authorities to be responsible for ensuring compliance with the measures in its domestic law giving effect to the principles stated in Chapters II and III of the Convention and in this Protocol.	for one or more authorities to be responsible for ensuring compliance with the measures in its domestic law giving effect	1 Each Party shall provide for one or more authorities to be responsible for ensuring compliance with the measures in its domestic law giving effect to the principles of this Convention.	Support	
2 a To this end, the said authorities shall have, in particular, powers of investigation and intervention, as well as the power to engage in legal proceedings or	2 To this end, such authorities: a. shall have powers of investigation and intervention;	2 To this end, such authorities: a. shall have powers of investigation and intervention;	Support	
bring to the attention of the competent judicial authorities violations of provisions of domestic law giving effect to the principles mentioned in paragraph 1 of Article 1 of this Protocol.	a'. are consulted when drawing up legislative and administrative measures relating to the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data;	a'. are consulted when drawing up legislative and administrative measures relating to the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data; (see new paragraph 2bis below)		
	b. shall perform the functions relating to transfers of data provided for under Article 12, notably the approval of standardised	b. shall perform the functions relating to transfers of data provided for under Article 12, notably the		

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	safeguards; c. shall have the power to issue decisions with respect to domestic law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention and may in particular sanction administrative offences; d. shall have the power to engage in legal proceedings or to bring to the attention of the competent judicial authorities violations of provisions of domestic law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention; e. shall be responsible for raising awareness of and providing information on data protection;	approval of standardised safeguards; c. shall have the powers to take corrective action and, where appropriate, to impose administrative sanctions for violations of the law issue decisions with respect to domestic law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention and may in particular sanction administrative offences; d. shall have the power to engage in legal proceedings or to bring to the attention of the competent judicial authorities violations of provisions of the domestic law giving effect to the provisions of this Convention; e. shall promote public be responsible for raising awareness of the rights of data subjects and the exercise of such		BE reckons that "corrective action" is a too vague term. IE argues "administrative sanctions" includes "fines" and explicit mention to fines should be at the Explanatory Report. IE suggests deleting reference to domestic law.	

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL rights, and the awareness of controllers and processors of their responsibilities under this Convention; specific attention shall be given to the data protection rights of children providing information on data protection; 2bis. Support provided the word The competent LT is not in favour of the supervisory authorities "severely" is deleted. shall be consulted on foreseen role of DPAs in The the legislative process. proposals for 2bis. competent any authorities who are not involved in the legislative supervisorv or administrative measures shall be consulted on lawmaking process. involving the processing of proposals for anv personal data which may legislative or severely affect administrative measures data subjects by virtue of the involving the processing of nature, scope and purpose personal data which may of such processing. severely affect data subjects by virtue of the nature, scope and purpose of such processing. Each supervisory Each competent b. Each supervisory authority can be supervisory authority can authority shall hear claims requested by any person be requested shall deal by lodged any person to investigate a claim with requests and concerning the protection of concerning the protection complaints lodged by data his/her rights and fundamental of his/her rights and subjects any person to

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 38

DGD2B RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED EN

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **POSITION COMMENTS CONVENTION AND** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL investigate a claim freedoms with regard to the fundamental freedoms processing of personal data with regard to the data concerning their data protection rights the within its competence. processing within its competence and shall protection of his/her rights inform the data subject and fundamental freedoms of the follow-up given to with regard to the data processing within its such a claim. competence and shall keep data subjects informed of progress of the follow-up given to such a claim. 3 The supervisory authorities The supervisory The supervisory Oppose: support text as IE suggests deleting the authorities shall **perform** authorities shall act with proposed by T-PD. last sentence of proposed shall exercise their functions in complete independence. their duties and exercise independence and by T-PD text and including their powers in complete impartiality in performing the Explanatory it in independence. They shall their duties and exercising Report. neither seek nor accept their powers perform Bv instructions from their duties and exercise COM: omittina anyone in the their powers in complete 'complete' from the independence. They shall performance of their requirement of neither seek nor accept duties and exercise of independence. the their powers. instructions from Convention modernised anvone in the would lower the level of performance of their protection with respect to duties and exercise of Convention 108 the their powers. currently in force, and in Directive 95/46/FC is not a Impartiality substitute for independence, so it should not be mistaken for a synonym.

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

TO SERVED

OUT OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY

<u>DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDIC</u>TED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL The last sentence instructive, in particular in view of the global outreach of this instrument, and in view of those countries which are now at the process of establishing their data protection systems. Each Party shall Each Party shall Support ensure that the ensure that the supervisory authorities supervisory authorities are have adequate human. provided with the resources necessary for technical and financial the effective performance resources and of their functions and infrastructure necessary to perform their functions and exercise of their powers have adequate human, exercise their powers technical and financial independently and effectively. resources and infrastructure necessary to 5bis The supervisory perform their functions and authorities shall draw up exercise their powers independently and a public report of their activities and shall see effectively. to it that transparency 5bis Each supervisory on their activities be ensured. authorities shall prepare and publish an annual suggests replacing draw up a public report BE 5ter Members and staff "annual report" of the supervisory outlining its activities bv and shall see to it that "periodical report". authorities shall be bound by obligations of transparency on their

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **POSITION COMMENTS CONVENTION AND** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL confidentiality with activities be ensured. regard to confidential information they have 5ter Members and staff of the supervisory access to or have had authorities shall be access to in the bound by obligations of performance of their duties. confidentiality with regard to confidential information they have access to or have had access to in the performance of their duties. 4 Decisions of the supervisory Decisions of the Decisions of the Support authorities, which give rise to authorities. authorities. supervisorv supervisorv complaints, may be appealed which aive rise to which give rise complaints. complaints. mav be may be against through the courts. appealed against through appealed against through the courts. the courts. In accordance with 5 In accordance with the In accordance with Support provisions of Chapter IV, and the provisions of Chapter the provisions of Chapter without prejudice to IV. the supervisory IV. the supervisorv the provisions of Article 13 of the shall shall authorities co- I authorities COoperate with one another Convention, the supervisory operate with one another authorities shall co-operate to the extent necessary for to the extent necessary for the performance of their the performance of their with one another to the extent necessary for the performance duties, in particular by: duties, in particular by: of their duties, in particular by exchanging all useful information. exchanging all useful a providing mutual Support under the information, in particular assistance by exchanging condition that the following BE, IE prefer to keep

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **POSITION COMMENTS CONVENTION AND** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL taking, under their addition is accepted: by relevant and useful "relevant and useful information information" instead domestic law and solely and providing mutual "necessary" information. for the protection of cooperating with each а exchanging all assistance personal data. all other to the useful information. in supervisory authority of DE appropriate measures to expresses а particular by taking, under provide factual information the other Partv bv reservation on the their domestic law and relating specific exchanging relevant and extension of international to processing carried out on solely for the protection of useful information data transfers by DPAs, in and its territory, with the personal data. cooperating with each particular in the field of exception of personal data appropriate measures to other. police iudicial under the and provide factual information condition undergoing cooperation. this that. as relating to specific regards the protection of processing, unless such processing carried out on data is essential for copersonal data, all the its territory, with the rules and safeguards of operation or that the data subject has previously exception of personal data this Convention undergoing complied with: agreed to in an processing, unless such unambiguous, specific. data is essential for cofree and informed manner: operation or that the data subject has previously agreed to unambiguous, specific. free and informed manner: Support coordinating b coordinating their their investigations or investigations or interventions, interventions or or conducting joint actions: conducting joint actions; providing information providing information Support C their law and and documentation on on administrative practice their law and relating to data protection. administrative practice relating to data protection. 8 In order to organise In order to organise | Support subject to small | COM: Risk of duplication

CHS/np 42 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 EN DGD2B

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL their co-operation and to their co-operation and to modification: of fora perform the duties set out perform the duties set out preceding preceding In order to organise the the paragraph, the supervisory their co-operation and to paragraph, the supervisory authorities of the Parties authorities of the Parties perform the duties set out shall form shall form а in the preceding conference/network. conference/network. paragraph, the supervisory authorities of the Parties shall may, in the framework of existing form fora. а conference/network HU underlines the need to The supervisory The supervisory Support authorities shall not be authorities shall not be preserve the indepencompetent with respect to competent with respect to dence of the judiciary. processing carried out by processing carried out by entities acting in their entities acting in their SI suggestion to further iudicial capacity. clarify this paragraph, judicial capacity. such as e.g. on the limits and whether courts/tribunals can be supervised when acting in capacities other (administrative tasks. financial tasks), whether public prosecution should be systems included etc. suggests adding NL following paragraph: "(10) exception to the principles expressed in this article shall be allowed

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 43

DGD2B RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED EN

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL when such derogation is provided by an accessible and foreseeable law and constitutes a necessary measure in a democratic society for the protection of national security". Chapter IV - Mutual Chapter IV - Mutual Chapter IV Mutual assistance assistance assistance Article 13 - Co-operation Article 13 – Co-operation Article 13 - Co-operation between Parties between Parties between Parties The Parties agree to unchanged unchanged Support render each other mutual in order assistance implement this Convention. unchanged For that purpose: unchanged Support Party а Party each Party shall Support each shall each shall designate one or more designate one or more designate one or more authorities supervisory authorities supervisory authorities, the name and within the meaning of address of each of which it within the meaning of 12bis of this Article 12bis shall communicate to the Article of this Secretary General Convention, the name and Convention, the name and of the address of each of which it address of each of which it Council of Europe: shall communicate to the shall communicate to the Secretary General of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe; Council of Europe: each Party which has each Party which b each Party which Support designated more than one has designated more than has designated more than one **supervisory** authority authority shall specify in its one **supervisory** authority communication referred to in shall shall specify in its specify in the previous sub-paragraph communication referred to communication referred to the competence of each in the previous in the previous subsubauthority. paragraph the paragraph the

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL competence of each. competence of each. Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support An authority designated by a Party shall at 12bis 12bis the request of an authority designated by another Party: furnish information on Delete Delete Support its law and administrative practice in the field of data protection: take, in conformity with Delete Delete Support its domestic law and for the sole purpose of protection of privacy. appropriate all measures for furnishing factual information relating to specific automatic processing carried out in its territory, with the exception however of the personal being data processed. Article 14 - Assistance to Article 14 - Assistance Article 14 - Assistance subjects to data subjects resident to data subjects resident data resident abroad abroad abroad Each Party shall assist Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support any person resident abroad to 12bis 12bis exercise the rights conferred by its domestic law giving effect to the principles set out in Article 8 of this Convention. When such a person Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support 12bis resides in the territory of 12bis

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL another Party he shall be given the option of submitting his request through intermediary of the authority designated by that Party. Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support The request for assistance shall contain all the 12bis 12bis necessary particulars, relating inter alia to: the name, address and Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support any other relevant particulars 12bis 12bis identifying the person making the request; the automated Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support 12bis personal data file to which the 12bis request pertains, or its controller: the purpose of the Incorporated into Article Incorporated into Article Support С 12bis 12bis request. Article 15 - Safeguards Article 15 - Safeguards Article 15 -Safequards concerning assistance concerning assistance concerning assistance rendered by designated rendered by designated rendered by designated supervisory authorities supervisory authorities authorities. 1 An authority designated by a 1 A **supervisory** authority supervisory Α Support Party which has designated by a Party authority designated by a Party which has received received information from an which has received authority information from an information from authority designated by supervisory designated by another Party authority either another Party either designated by another accompanying a request for accompanying a request Party either accompanying a request for assistance or for assistance or in assistance or in reply to its own request for in reply to its own request reply to its own request for

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
assistance shall not use that information for purposes other than those specified in the request for assistance.	that information for purposes other than those	for assistance shall not use that information for purposes other than those specified in the request for assistance.		
2 Each Party shall see to it that the persons belonging to or acting on behalf of the designated authority shall be bound by appropriate obligations of secrecy or confidentiality with regard to that information.	Delete	Delete	Support	
3 In no case may a designated authority be allowed to make under Article 14, paragraph 2, a request for assistance on behalf of a data subject resident abroad, of its own accord and without the express consent of the person concerned.	2 In no case may a designated supervisory authority be allowed to make a request for assistance on behalf of a data subject of its own accord and without the express consent of the person concerned.	2 In no case may a designated supervisory authority be allowed to make a request for assistance on behalf of a data subject of its own accord and without the express consent of the person concerned.	Support	
Article 16 – Refusal of requests for assistance	Article 16 - Refusal of requests for assistance	Article 16 – Refusal of requests for assistance		
A designated authority to which a request for assistance is addressed under Articles 13 or 14 of this Convention may	A designated supervisory authority to which a request for assistance is addressed under Article 13 of this	A designated supervisory authority to which a request for assistance is addressed under Article 13 of this	Support	

DESTDEINT HE/EH DESTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
not refuse to comply with it unless:	Convention may not refuse to comply with it unless:			
a the request is not compatible with the powers in the field of data protection of the authorities responsible for replying;	unchanged	unchanged	Support	
b the request does not comply with the provisions of this Convention;	unchanged	unchanged	Support	
c compliance with the request would be incompatible with the sovereignty, security or public policy (ordre public) of the Party by which it was designated, or with the rights and fundamental freedoms of persons under the jurisdiction of that Party.	compliance with the request would be incompatible with the sovereignty, national security or public order of the Party by which it was designated, or with the rights and fundamental freedoms of persons under the jurisdiction of that Party.	under the jurisdiction of that Party.	Support	
Article 17 – Costs and procedures of assistance	Article 17 - Costs and procedures of assistance	Article 17 - Costs and procedures of assistance		
1 Mutual assistance which the Parties render each other under Article 13 and assistance they render to data subjects abroad under Article 14 shall not give rise to the payment of any costs or	1 Mutual assistance which the Parties render each other under Article 13 and assistance they render to data subjects [abroad] under Article 14 shall not give rise to the payment of any	Mutual assistance which the Parties render each other under Article 13 and assistance they render to data subjects [abroad] under Article 12bis shall not give rise to the payment of any	Support	

Convention.

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL costs or fees other than fees other than those incurred costs or fees other than for experts and interpreters. those incurred for experts those incurred for experts The latter costs or fees shall and interpreters. The latter | and interpreters. The latter be borne by the Party which costs or fees shall be costs or fees shall be has designated the authority borne by the Party which borne by the Party which making the request for designated designated the has the has assistance. supervisory authority supervisory authority making the request for making the request for assistance. assistance. The data subject may unchanged unchanged Support not be charged costs or fees in connection with the steps taken on his behalf in the territory of another Party other than those lawfully payable by residents of that Party. Other details unchanged unchanged Support concerning the assistance relating in particular to the forms and procedures and the languages to be used, shall be established directly between the Parties concerned. Chapter V - Convention Chapter V - Convention **Chapter V – Consultative** Committee Committee Committee Article 18 - Composition of Article 18 - Composition Article 18 - Composition of the committee the committee of the committee Consultative Convention Support Α Α Convention Α Committee shall be set up Committee shall be set up Committee shall be set up after the entry into force of after the entry into force of after the entry into force of this

this Convention.

this Convention.

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
2 Each Party shall appoint a representative to the committee and a deputy representative. Any member State of the Council of Europe which is not a Party to the Convention shall have the right to be represented on the committee by an observer.	unchanged	unchanged	Support	
3. The Consultative Committee may, by unanimous decision, invite any non-member State of the Council of Europe which is not a Party to the Convention to be represented by an observer at a given meeting.	decision taken by a majority of two-thirds of the representatives of	3 The Convention Committee may, by a decision taken by a majority of two-thirds of the representatives of the Parties entitled to vote, invite an observer to be represented at its meetings.	Support text as proposed by T-PD	
	4 Any Party which is not a member of the Council of Europe shall contribute to the funding of the activities of the Convention Committee according to the modalities established by the Committee of Ministers in agreement with that Party.	4 Any Party which is not a member of the Council of Europe shall contribute to the funding of the activities of the Convention Committee according to the modalities established by the Committee of Ministers in agreement with that Party.	Support	
Article 19 – Functions of the committee	Article 19 – Functions of the committee	Article 19 – Functions of the committee		_
The Consultative Committee:	The Convention Committee:	The Convention Committee:	Support	

DESTREAM HE/FII DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL a may make proposals with a may make la may make Support view to facilitating or improving recommendations with a recommendations with a application of view to facilitating or view to facilitating or the Convention: improving the application improving the application of the Convention: of the Convention: may make proposals for unchanged unchanged Support amendment of this Convention in accordance with Article 21: unchanged unchanged shall formulate its opinion Support proposal any for on amendment of this Convention which is referred to it in accordance with Article 21. paragraph 3; d may, at the request of a may-express an Support may-express an d Party, express an opinion on opinion on any question opinion on any question any question concerning the concerning concerning the the application of this Convention. interpretation interpretation or or this application of this application of Convention: Convention: shall prepare, before shall prepare, before Support any new accession to the any new accession to the Convention, an opinion for Convention, an opinion for the Committee of Ministers the Committee of Ministers relating to the level of data relating to the level of protection of the candidate personal data protection for accession: of the candidate accession and where necessary recommend measures to take to reach compliance with the provisions of this Convention:

<u>DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDIC</u>TED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL f may, at the request of a f may, at the request of a Support State or an international State or an international organisation or on its own organisation or on its own initiative, evaluate whether initiative, evaluate whether the level of **personal** data the level of data protection the former provides is in protection the former compliance with provides is in compliance the provisions with the provisions of this of this Convention and where Convention: recommend necessarv measures to take to reach such compliance; g may develop or approve BE agrees with COM and may develop or Support subject models of standardised models accepted deletion of the approve would furthermore like to safeguards referred to in standardised safeguards last part of the last receive more explanations referred to in Article 12; Article 12: sentence of Article 12 on the envisaged models paragraph 1. of standardized safeguards in accordance with Article 12 further explained during the CAHDATA meeting (who can submit them? Rules of procedure?) h shall periodically review h shall periodically review Support the implementation of this the implementation of this Convention by the Parties Convention by the Parties in accordance with the in accordance with the provisions of Article 4.3 provisions of Article 4.3 and decide upon and recommend measures to take where a measures to take where a

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

52

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

FN

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	Party is not in compliance	Party is not in compliance			
	with the Convention;	with this Convention;			
	i shall facilitate, where necessary, the friendly settlement of all difficulties related to the application of this Convention.	i shall facilitate, where necessary, the friendly settlement of all difficulties related to the application of this Convention.	Support		
Article 20 – Procedure	Article 20 – Procedure	Article 20 – Procedure			
1 The Consultative Committee shall be convened by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe. Its first meeting shall be held within twelve months of the entry into force of this Convention. It shall subsequently meet at least once every two years and in any case when one-third of the representatives of the Parties request its convocation.	General of the Council of Europe. Its first meeting shall be held within twelve months of the entry into force of this Convention. It shall subsequently meet at least once a year and in	1 The Convention Committee shall be convened by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe. Its first meeting shall be held within twelve months of the entry into force of this Convention. It shall subsequently meet at least once a year and in any case when one-third of the representatives of the Parties request its convocation.	Support		
2 A majority of representatives of the Parties shall constitute a quorum for a meeting of the Consultative Committee.	2 A majority of representatives of the Parties shall constitute a quorum for a meeting of the Convention Committee.	2 A majority of representatives of the Parties shall constitute a quorum for a meeting of the Convention Committee.	Support		
	3 Each Party has a right to vote and shall have one vote. On questions related to its competence, the European Union exercises	3 Each Party has a right to vote and shall have one vote. On questions related to its competence, the European Union exercises	Support		

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2 CHS/np 53
DGD2B RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED EN

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DECTDICT	ED	T
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
3 After each of its meetings, the Consultative Committee shall submit to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe a report on its work and on the functioning	its right to vote and casts a number of votes equal to the number of its member States that are Parties to the Convention and have transferred competencies to the European Union in the field concerned. In this case, those member States of the European Union do not vote. 4 After each of its meetings, the Convention Committee shall submit to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe a report on its work and on	its right to vote and casts a number of votes equal to the number of its member States that are Parties to the Convention and have transferred competencies to the European Union in the field concerned. In this case, those member States of the European Union do not vote. 4 After each of its meetings, the Convention Committee shall submit to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe a report on its work and on	Support	
of the Convention.	the functioning of the Convention.	the functioning of this Convention.		
4 Subject to the provisions of this Convention, the Consultative Committee shall draw up its own Rules of Procedure.	5. Subject to the provisions of this Convention, the Convention Committee shall draw up its own Rules of Procedure and establish in particular the procedures of evaluation set out in Article 4.3 and of examination of the level of protection provided for in Article 19, on the basis of objective criteria.	5. Subject to the provisions of this Convention, the Convention Committee shall draw up its own Rules of Procedure and establish in particular the procedures of evaluation set out in Article 4.3 and of examination of the level of personal data protection provided for in Article 19, on the basis of objective criteria.	Support	

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED				
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
Chapter VI – Amendments	Chapter VI –	Chapter VI –		
	Amendments	Amendments		
Article 21 – Amendments	Article 21 -	Article 21 -		
	Amendments	Amendments		
1 Amendments to this	1 Amendments to	1 Amendments to	Support	
Convention may be proposed		this Convention may be		
by a Party, the Committee of		proposed by a Party, the	A WAY	
Ministers of the Council of		Committee of Ministers of		
Europe or the Consultative	•	the Council of Europe or		
Committee.	the Convention Committee.	the Convention Committee.		
2 Any proposal for		2 Any proposal for	Support	
amendment shall be	amendment shall be	amendment shall be	Support	
communicated by the	communicated by the	communicated by the	~	
Secretary General of the	Secretary General of the	Secretary General of the		
Council of Europe to the	Council of Europe to the	Council of Europe to the		
member States of the Council	Parties to the	Parties to this		
of Europe and to every non-	Convention, to the other	Convention, to the other		
member State which has	member States of the	member States of the		
acceded to or has been invited		Council of Europe, to the		
to accede to this Convention in	•	European Union and to		
accordance with the provisions		every non-member State		
of Article 23.	which has been invited to	or international		
	accede to this Convention	organisation which has		
	in accordance with the	been invited to accede to		
	provisions of Article 23.	this Convention in accordance with the		
		provisions of Article 23.		
3 Moreover, any	3 Moreover, any	3 Moreover, any	Support	
amendment proposed by a		amendment proposed by a		
Party or the Committee of		Party or the Committee of		
Ministers shall be communi-	Ministers shall be	Ministers shall be		
cated to the Consultative	communicated to the	communicated to the		

DESTREAM HE/EH DESTRICTED **CURRENT TEXT OF THE** T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL Committee Convention Committee Committee, which shall submit Convention to the Committee of Ministers which shall submit to the which shall submit to the its opinion on that proposed Committee of Ministers its Committee of Ministers its opinion on that proposed opinion on that proposed amendment. amendment. amendment. The Committee of The Committee of Support The Committee of Ministers shall consider the Ministers shall consider Ministers shall consider proposed amendment and any the proposed amendment the proposed amendment opinion submitted by the and any opinion submitted and any opinion submitted Consultative Committee and the Convention bν the Convention bv may approve the amendment. Committee Committee and may and mav approve the amendment. approve the amendment. The text of unchanged unchanged Support anv amendment approved by the Committee of Ministers in accordance with paragraph 4 article shall of this forwarded to the Parties for acceptance. Any amendment unchanged unchanged Support approved in accordance with paragraph 4 of this article shall come into force on the thirtieth day after all Parties have informed the Secretary General of their acceptance thereof. Support 7. Moreover, the Moreover, the Committee of Ministers Committee of Ministers may after consulting the may after consulting the Convention Committee. Convention Committee.

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED					
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS	
	amendment shall enter into force at the expiration of a period of two years from the date on which it has been opened to acceptance, unless a Party notifies the Secretary General of the Council of Europe of an objection to its entry into force. If such an objection	decide that a particular amendment shall enter into force at the expiration of a period of two years from the date on which it has been opened to acceptance, unless a Party notifies the Secretary General of the Council of Europe of an objection to its entry into force. If such an objection is notified, the amendment shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the date on which the Party to this Convention which has notified the objection has deposited its instrument of acceptance with the Secretary General of the Council Europe.			
	8. If an amendment has been approved by the Committee of Ministers but has not yet entered into force in accordance with	8. If an amendment has been approved by the	Support		

 6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2
 CHS/np
 57

 DGD2B
 RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED
 EN

	DECT	DEIN'T HE/EH DECTDIAT	LIN	T
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
	consent to be bound by the Convention without at the same time accepting	consent to be bound by this Convention without at the same time accepting		
Chapter VII – Final clauses	the amendment. Chapter VII – Final clauses	the amendment. Chapter VII – Final clauses		
Article 22 – Entry into force	Article 22 - Entry into force	Article 22 - Entry into force		
1 This Convention shall be open for signature by the member States of the Council of Europe. It is subject to ratification, acceptance or approval. Instruments of ratification, acceptance or approval shall be deposited with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.	1 This Convention shall be open for signature by the member States of the Council of Europe, the European Union and States not members of the Council of Europe which have been invited	1 This Convention shall be open for signature by the member States of the Council of Europe, the European Union and States not members of the Council of Europe which have been invited to accede to this Convention opened for signature on 28 January 1981. It is subject to ratification, acceptance or approval. Instruments of ratification, acceptance or approval shall be deposited with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.	Support text as proposed by T-PD	
2 This Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date on which five member States of the	unchanged	unchanged	Support	

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DESTDICT	FD	
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
Council of Europe have expressed their consent to be bound by the Convention in accordance with the provisions of the preceding paragraph.				
3 In respect of any member State which subsequently expresses its consent to be bound by it, the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date of deposit of the instrument of ratification, acceptance or approval.	unchanged	unchanged	Support text subject to minor clarification: 3 In respect of any Party member State which subsequently expresses its consent to be bound by it, the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date of deposit of the instrument of ratification, acceptance or approval.	
Article 23 – Accession by non-member States	Article 23 – Accession by non-member States and international organisations	Article 23 – Accession by non-member States and international organisations		
1 After the entry into force of this Convention, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe may invite any State not a member of the Council of Europe to accede to this Convention by a decision taken by the majority provided	1 After the entry into force of this Convention, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe may, after consulting the Parties to the	of this Convention, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe may, after consulting the Parties to this Convention and obtaining their	Support	

	DECT	DEINT HE/EH DECTDICT	FD	
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS
for in Article 20.d of the Statute of the Council of Europe and by the unanimous vote of the representatives of the Contracting States entitled to sit on the committee.	and in light of the opinion prepared by the Convention Committee in accordance with Article 19.e, invite any State not a member of the Council of Europe or an international organisation to accede to this Convention by a decision taken by the majority provided for in Article 20.d of the Statute of the Council of Europe and by the unanimous vote of the representatives of the Contracting States entitled to sit on the Committee of Ministers.	opinion prepared by the Convention Committee in accordance with Article 19.e, invite any State not a member of the		
2 In respect of any acceding State, the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date of deposit of the instrument of accession with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.	or international organisation acceding to the present Convention according to paragraph 1 above, the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month	2 In respect of any State or international organisation acceding to this Convention according to paragraph 1 above, the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date of deposit of the instrument of accession with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.	Support	

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED								
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS				
	Council of Europe.							
Article 24 – Territorial clause	clause	Article 24 – Territorial clause						
1 Any State may at the time of signature or when depositing its instrument of ratification, acceptance, approval or accession, specify the territory or territories to which this Convention shall apply.	European Union or other international organisation may at the time of signature or when depositing its instrument of	1 Any State, the European Union or other international organisation may at the time of signature or when depositing its instrument of ratification, acceptance, approval or accession, specify the territory or territories to which this Convention shall apply.	Support					
2 Any State may at any later date, by a declaration addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, extend the application of this Convention to any other territory specified in the declaration. In respect of such territory the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the date of receipt of such declaration by the Secretary General.	European Union or other international organisation may at any later date, by a declaration addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, extend the application of this Convention to any other territory specified in the declaration. In respect of such territory the Convention shall enter into	2 Any State, the European Union or other international organisation may at any later date, by a declaration addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, extend the application of this Convention to any other territory specified in the declaration. In respect of such territory the Convention shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of three months after the	Support					

6365/14 ADD 1 REV 2

CHS/np

61

DGD2B

RESTREINT UE/EU RESTRICTED

61

DECEDEINT HE/EH DECEDICTED							
CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL	T-PD PROPOSALS	TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2 nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)	EU PROPOSED POSITION	COMMENTS			
	date of receipt of such declaration by the Secretary General.	date of receipt of such declaration by the Secretary General.					
3 Any declaration made under the two preceding paragraphs may, in respect of any territory specified in such declaration, be withdrawn by a notification addressed to the Secretary General. The withdrawal shall become effective on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of six months after the date of receipt of such notification by the Secretary General.	unchanged	unchanged	Support				
Article 25 – Reservations	Article 25 – Reservations	Article 25 – Reservations					
No reservation may be made in respect of the provisions of this Convention.	unchanged	unchanged	Support				
Article 26 – Denunciation	Article 26 -	Article 26 -					
	Denunciation	Denunciation					
1 Any Party may at any time denounce this Convention by means of a notification addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.	unchanged	unchanged	Support				
2 Such denunciation shall become effective on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of six	unchanged		Support				

notification or communication relating to this Convention.

DECTDEINT HE/EH DECTDICTED T-PD PROPOSALS TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT **CURRENT TEXT OF THE EU PROPOSED** 2nd CAHDATA MEETING **CONVENTION AND POSITION COMMENTS** (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT) ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL months after the date of receipt of the notification by the Secretary General. Article 27 - Notifications Article 27 - Notifications The Secretary General of the The Secretary General of Support Council of Europe shall notify the Council of Europe the member States of the shall notify the member Council and any State which States of the Council and has acceded to this any Party to this Convention of: Convention of: any signature: unchanged Support the deposit of any unchanged Support of ratification. instrument approval acceptance. accession; any date of entry into unchanged Support force of this Convention in accordance with Articles 22, 23 and 24: other unchanged act. any Support

CURRENT TEXT OF THE CONVENTION AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL

T-PD PROPOSALS

TEXT FOR DISCUSSION AT 2nd CAHDATA MEETING (25/3 PROPOSED TEXT)

EU PROPOSED POSITION COMMENTS

Article ... of the Protocol: signature and entry into force

- 1. This protocol shall be open for signature by the Parties to the Convention. It shall be subject to ratification, acceptance or approval. Instruments of ratification, acceptance or approval shall be deposited with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.
- 2. This protocol shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of [three] months after the date on which all Parties to the Convention have expressed their consent to be bound by the protocol in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 1 of this Article.
- 3. However, this protocol shall enter into force following the expiry of a period of [two] years after the date on which it has been opened to signature, unless a Party to the Convention has notified the Secretary General of the Council of Europe of an objection to its entry into force. The right to make an objection shall be reserved to those states which were Parties to the Convention at the date of opening for signature of this protocol.
- 4. Should such an objection be notified, the protocol shall enter into force on the first day of the month following the expiration of a period of [three] months after the date on which the Party to the Convention which has notified the objection has deposited its instrument of ratification, acceptance or approval with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.