

Brussels, 7.10.2020 COM(2020) 620 final

COMMUNICATION FROM THE COMMISSION TO THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL

A Union of Equality: EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation

{SWD(2020) 530 final}

EN EN

Where is the essence of humanity when every single day Roma people are excluded from society and others are held back simply because of the colour of their skin or their religious belief?

Commission President von der Leyen, State of the Union 2020

Europe has a duty to protect its minorities from racism and discrimination. We must replace antigypsyism with openness and acceptance, hate speech and hate crime with tolerance and respect for human dignity, and bullying with education about the Holocaust. Above all, we must promote diversity as a wonderful gift that makes Europe strong and resilient. This is why the Commission calls on all Member States to join the pledge to end racism and discrimination, which blatantly affects our large ethnic Roma minorities. We urge Member States to commit to a new EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation to bring social fairness and more equality in all senses of the word.

Statement by President von der Leyen, Vice-President Jourová and Commissioner Dalli ahead of the 2020 Roma Holocaust remembrance day

I. INTRODUCTION

Building a Union of equality is one of the major priorities of the Commission. The EU has legal instruments and a comprehensive policy to build a true Union of equality. Nevertheless, as underlined in the EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025¹, discrimination on the grounds of racial or ethnic origin persists. This is particularly true for Roma², who often remain marginalised. Many of the continent's estimated 10-12 million Roma³ continue to face discrimination, antigypsyism⁴ and socioeconomic exclusion in their daily lives.

In 2011, the Commission adopted an EU framework for national Roma integration strategies up to 2020⁵. It primarily aimed at tackling the socioeconomic exclusion of Roma in the EU and enlargement countries by promoting equal access to education, employment, health and housing. It called on Member States to design national Roma integration strategies, to appoint national Roma contact points⁶ and to set national goals. Two years later, the Council adopted a Recommendation on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States, which provided guidance to Member States on how to strengthen implementation of their national strategies⁷. The Western Balkan region voluntarily aligned with the EU framework for national Roma integration strategies up to 2020.

National representatives appointed to act as contact point for the national Roma strategy with the authority to coordinate its development and implementation at national level. Following adoption of the EU framework they were appointed in all Member States, except Malta which does not have a Roma community.

Council Recommendation of 9 December 2013 on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States (OJ C 378/1, 24.12.2013).

A Union of equality: EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025 - COM(2020) 565 final.

The reference to 'Roma', as an umbrella term, encompasses a wide range of different people of Romani origin such as: Roma, Sinti, Kale, Romanichels and Boyash/Rudari. It also encompasses groups such as Ashkali, Egyptians, Yenish, Dom, Lom, Rom and Abdal, as well as traveller populations, including ethnic Travellers or those designated under the administrative term *gens du voyage* and people who identify as Gypsies, Tsiganes or Tziganes, without denying their specificities.

Council of Europe 2012 estimates.

Antigypsyism (a form of racism against Roma) is a historically rooted structural phenomenon that appears at institutional, social and interpersonal levels. It has its origins in how the majority views and treats those considered 'gypsies'. It is rooted in a process of 'othering' that builds on negative as well as positive, exoticising stereotypes. While there is consensus about the understanding of antigypsyism among proponents of the need to reinforce the fight against it, there has been a debate about the term. The European Parliament (in its 2015, 2017 and 2019 and 2020 resolutions), the Commission (in its annual communications between 2015 and 2019, and its 2018 conclusions paper), the Council (in its 2013 recommendation and 2016 conclusions) and the Council of Europe have recognised antigypsyism as a barrier to inclusion, and hence the importance of tackling it. The Commission uses the spelling proposed by the Alliance against Antigypsyism, while accepting that different terms might be appropriate in different national contexts.

⁵ COM(2011) 173 final.

These two instruments were important⁸ for placing Roma inclusion high on EU and national agendas and mobilising EU policy, legal and funding instruments. Nevertheless, overall **progress in Roma integration has been limited** over the past 10 years, even if there are significant differences across policy areas and countries⁹. Education is the area that progressed the most, notably by reducing early school-leaving and improving participation in early childhood education and compulsory schooling. However, cases of segregation of Roma pupils in education have increased¹⁰. Poverty risk and self-perceived health status of Roma improved but medical coverage continues to be limited. Access to employment did not improve, and the share of Roma youth not in employment, education or training has even increased. Especially due to inadequate and segregated housing the housing situation remains difficult. There is evidence of some reduction in discrimination experiences among Roma and increased acceptance of Roma by the general population. However, antigypsyism, hate crime, trafficking in Roma, in particular women and children, continue to be a matter of high concern¹¹.

The conclusion of the EU framework for national Roma integration strategies provides an opportunity to step up action to address this persistent failing. This is all the more important as the COVID-19 pandemic has revealed the extreme exposure of excluded and marginalised Roma communities to negative health and socioeconomic impacts.

To achieve more and faster progress, this Communication sets out a new EU Roma strategic framework, promoting effective **equality**, socio-economic **inclusion** and meaningful **participation** of Roma. Whilst Member States are on the front line to drive real change for Roma, which requires a strengthened political commitment, the EU can help them to shape an effective approach and equip them with the right tools. This strategic framework draws on the findings from the evaluation of the previous framework, extensive consultations¹², annual assessments of the implementation of national strategies¹³ and analysis of the reasons for the limited effectiveness of past measures¹⁴. It responds to calls from the European Parliament, the Council and civil society for a strengthened post-2020 EU initiative¹⁵. It recognises that not all Roma are socially excluded, but all can experience discrimination and disempowerment. It takes an intersectional approach, sensitive to the combination of ethnicity with other aspects of identity and the ways in which such intersections contribute to unique experiences of discrimination¹⁶.

This EU Roma strategic framework also contributes to several other initiatives. It is a direct contribution to implementing the EU anti-racism action plan, the European pillar of social

⁸ As demonstrated by the evaluation of the framework: COM(2018) 785 final, SWD(2018) 480 final.

Report on the evaluation of the EU framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020, <u>COM(2018)</u> 785 final.

Under Council Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin (the 'Racial Equality Directive'), the Commission has initiated infringement procedures against three countries (CZ, HU and SK) for school segregation of Roma children.

Report on the evaluation of the EU framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020, COM(2018) 785 final.

See accompanying SWD(2020) 530 final, Annex 1.

¹³ COM(2019) 406, SWD(2019)320, all annual reports.

¹⁴ A meta-evaluation of interventions for Roma inclusion.

See European Parliament 2020 2019, Council, civil society.

According to Article 10 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), when 'defining and implementing its policies and activities, the Union shall aim to combat discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation'. The European Institute for Gender Equality defines 'intersectionality' as an 'analytical tool for studying, understanding and responding to the ways in which sex and gender intersect with other personal characteristics/identities, and how these intersections contribute to unique experiences of discrimination'. This definition applies equally to any form of discrimination.

rights¹⁷ and to the achievement of the UN Agenda 2030 and the Sustainable Development

Achieving equity and inclusion calls for increased use and better channelling of resources, and the involvement and partnership of Roma communities, all government levels, sectors and stakeholders (national governments, EU institutions, international organisations, civil society and, as well as industry and academia). Close cooperation between the European and the national level is particularly crucial. At EU level, this strategic framework sets out ambitious common objectives and targets. At national level, governments should develop strong national Roma strategic frameworks to make long-term commitments and work hand in hand with the EU institutions on Roma equality, inclusion and participation. As proposed in the 2016 Council conclusions, 19 the Commission is adopting a proposal to review and replace the 2013 Council Recommendation.

II. COMMON OBJECTIVES FOR ROMA EQUALITY, INCLUSION AND PARTICIPATION

The evaluation of the current framework and the conclusions drawn from it by the European Parliament, Council, and several Europe-wide and national civil society organisations²⁰ show a need to renew and step up the commitment to Roma equality, inclusion and participation at both European and national level. A strengthened commitment is necessary to tackle persistent discrimination, including antigypsyism, and to improve inclusion of Roma people in education, employment, health and housing²¹. Roma people should be involved from the design to the implementation of measures. At the same time, action should acknowledge the diversity and needs of specific groups within the Roma population.

The Commission therefore sets seven objectives at the EU level for the period up to 2030. Three of these objectives are horizontal in the areas of equality, inclusion and participation. The other four are sectoral objectives in the areas of education, employment, housing and health. To implement these objectives effectively, they need to be backed up with the ability to measure progress. For this reason, and for the first time, the Commission proposes quantitative EU

Principles 1 (quality and inclusive education), 3 (equal opportunities) and 20 (access to essential services) are particularly important for Roma and guide the use of EU funds for both targeted and mainstream measures.

The 2016 Council conclusions asked the Commission to propose a post-2020 initiative, and include therein a proposal for a revision of the 2013 Council Recommendation Accelerating the process of Roma integration.

On the need for a clearer focus on fighting antigypsyism and discrimination in the post-2020 EU framework, see expert recommendations developed in the aftermath of the Conference 'How to address anti-Gypsyism in a post-2020 EU Roma Framework?' (Vienna, 27.11.2018).

The Agenda's ambition of 'leaving no one behind', there is significant scope to improve the situation of Roma in Europe. By addressing the situation of Roma, the EU can move closer to achieving the sustainable development goals (SDG). SDGs 1-2 (reducing poverty and hunger), 3-4 (supporting health and wellbeing and quality education for all), 6-7 (access to clean water and sanitation, and affordable and clean energy), 10-11 (reducing inequality within and among countries, and inclusive and sustainable cities and communities) and 16 (inclusive societies, access to justice for all and effective, accountable and inclusive institutions) are particularly important entry points.

European Parliament resolution of 17 September 2020 on the implementation of National Roma Integration Strategies: combating negative attitudes towards people with Romani background in Europe (P9 TA(2020)0229); European Parliament resolution of 12 February 2019 on the need for a strengthened post-2020 Strategic EU Framework for National Roma Inclusion Strategies and stepping up the fight against anti-Gypsyism (P8 TA(2019)0075); EPSCO Council Conclusion of 24 October 2019 on the Economy of Wellbeing (13432/19), inviting the Commission to renew the commitment on Roma inclusion. Additionally, at the High-Level Conference on the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies held in Bucharest on 4-5 March 2019, participants called on the Commission to propose an ambitious new post-2020 EU framework, and on Member States and enlargement countries to step up their commitments to Roma integration. Information from the Presidency (7003/19, 14.3.2019).

headline targets to monitor achievement towards these objectives. While such targets require minimum progress to be achieved by 2030, the long-term aim remains to ensure effective equality and to close the gap between Roma and the general population. These targets are the fruit of experience with surveys among Roma communities and result from an in-depth consultation involving the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), Member States as well as Roma and pro-Roma civil society²². The charts below set out the seven objectives, the EU-level targets, the progress to be reached and the current situation.²³

ENSURE EFFECTIVE EQUALITY, INCLUSION AND PARTICIPATION HORIZONTAL OBJECTIVES AND TARGETS BY 2030

Red: EU level target on minimum progress to be reached by 2030 Green: minimum progress to be reached for Roma by 2030 Blue: latest available data from which progress will be measured

1. Fight and prevent antigypsyism and discrimination

Cut the proportion of Roma with discrimination experience by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 less than 13% of Roma experience discrimination
- discrimination experience of Roma:26% (past 12 months), 41% (past 5 years)

Decrease the proportion of general population who feel uncomfortable having Roma neighbours by at least a third

- to ensure that by 2030 less than 30% feel uncomfortable having Roma neighbours
- proportion of general population who feel uncomfortable having Roma neighbours: 46%

2. Reduce poverty and social exclusion to close the socio-economic gap between Roma and the general population

Cut poverty gap between Roma and general population by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 the majority of Roma escape poverty
- 'at risk of poverty' rate: Roma 80%; general population 16.8% (gap 63.2 pps)

Cut poverty gap between Roma children and other children by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 the majority of Roma children escape poverty
- Roma children: 85%; children in general: 19.6% (gap: 65.4 pps)

3. Promote participation through empowerment, cooperation and trust

Capacitate and engage at least 90 NGOs in EU-wide coordinated Roma civil society monitoring

• NGOs involved in Roma Civil Monitoring project: 85

Ensure participation of Roma NGOs as full members in national monitoring committees for all programmes addressing needs of Roma communities

Double proportion of Roma who file a report when they experience discrimination

- to ensure that by 2030 at least 30% of Roma victims report discrimination
- proportion who reported last incident of discrimination they experienced (in any area) in last 5 years: 16%

Encourage participation of Roma in political life at local, regional, national and EU levels

(in Member States with significant Roma population)

 to ensure they register as voters, vote, run as candidates

See accompanying SWD(2020) 530 final.

For further information on indicator labels and data sources, see Annex 2 and the report on the <u>Monitoring framework</u> for a post-2020 EU initiative on Roma equality, inclusion and participation by the working party on Roma indicators and reporting (coordinated by the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), involving national Roma contact points, national statistical offices and the Commission).

SECTORAL OBJECTIVES

4. Increase effective equal access to quality inclusive mainstream education

Cut gap in participation in early childhood education and care by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 at least 70% of Roma children participate in pre-school
- early childhood education and care participation (3+):
 Roma 42%; general population 92.2% (gap 50.2 pps)

Reduce gap in upper secondary completion by at least one third

- to ensure that by 2030 the majority of Roma youth complete at least upper secondary education
- completed upper secondary or above: Roma 28%; general population 83.5% (gap 55.5 pps)

Work towards eliminating segregation by cutting at least in half the proportion of Roma children attending segregated primary schools (in Member States with significant Roma population)

- to ensure that by 2030 less than one in five Roma child attend schools where most or all children are Roma
- Roma children attending schools where most or all children are Roma: 44%

5. Increase effective equal access to quality and sustainable employment

Cut employment gap by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 at least 60% of Roma are in paid work
- paid employment: Roma 43%; general population 73.1% (gap 30.1 pps)

Cut gender employment gap for Roma by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 at least 45% of Roma women are in paid work
- gender employment gap Roma: 27pps (women: 29%, men: 56%); general population gap: 11.7pps (women: 67.2%, men: 78.9%)

Cut gap in NEET rate by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 less than one in three Roma youth is not in education, employment or training
- NEET rate (16-24 years): Roma 62%; general population 10.1% (gap 51.9 pps)

6. Improve Roma health and increase effective equal access to quality healthcare and social

Cut life expectancy gap by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 Roma women and men live 5 years longer
- life expectancy gap at birth (general population vs Roma): Roma women 10.4 years; Roma men 10.2 years

7. Increase effective equal access to adequate desegregated housing and essential services

Reduce gap in housing deprivation by at least one third

- to ensure that by 2030 the majority of Roma do not face housing deprivation
- housing deprivation: Roma 61%; general population 17.9% (gap: 43.1 pps)

Cut gap in overcrowding by at least half

- to ensure that by 2030 the majority of Roma no longer live in overcrowded households
- overcrowding: Roma 78%; general population 17.1% (gap 60.9 pps)

Ensure that at least 95% of Roma have access to tap water

access to tap water in dwelling: Roma 70%, general population: 97.7%

Other indicators are being explored²⁴.

Other indicators are being explored by the working party on Roma indicators and reporting coordinated by FRA. They concern for example material and social deprivation, access to health and social services, housing segregation.

III. RENEWED AND STRENGTHENED NATIONAL ACTION FOR EQUALITY, INCLUSION AND PARTICIPATION

Meeting the objectives of this strategic framework needs action at both EU and national level. This complementary approach is the only way to drive a change on the ground. Member States hold the main competences in the areas covered by this framework and a structured approach is needed. While the situation of Roma varies across countries, there is a need to increase commitment and accountability at national level to bring a real change in Roma everyday life. This includes involvement of civil society and all relevant stakeholders in the preparation of national Roma strategic frameworks.

Taking forward national action through national Roma strategic frameworks

Member States are invited to develop, adopt and implement national Roma strategic frameworks including:

- o common features
- o minimum commitments which should apply to all
- o possible additional commitments depending on the national context
- o more ambitious commitments for Member States with large Roma populations

Proposals for these elements are set out below. Where possible, specific national targets should be set. The Commission will assist this process with all necessary guidance. It will also support

national measures including by enforcing equality legislation, mainstreaming Roma equality, inclusion and participation in EU policy initiatives, mobilising EU funds for Roma and combating antigypsyism.

Member States are invited to complete the development of these national frameworks by September 2021, and to share these with the Commission.

Together with this Communication, the Commission is adopting a proposal for a **Council Recommendation** on Roma equality, inclusion and participation, which sets out a list of specific measures to be taken by Member States in order to achieve the EU objectives. The two are therefore complementary. The proposed Recommendation also guides capacity-building of and partnerships between stakeholders, including national Roma contact points, equality bodies, civil society and the regional and local actors. In addition, it provides guidance for ensuring a better use of EU and national funds, as well as effective national monitoring, reporting and evaluation of national Roma strategic frameworks.

III.1. Guidance for national action following a common but differentiated approach

In order to help Member States developing meaningful and effective national Roma strategic frameworks, the Commission proposes a series of common features, as well as minimum commitments for all national strategic Roma frameworks. Moreover, as the proportion of Roma, as well as their national contexts, varies considerably from one Member State to the other, the Commission proposes additional and more targeted commitments. This recognises the diversity of situations in Member States and allows for a common but differentiated approach.

First, the Commission proposes that all national Roma strategic frameworks have the following common features:

✓ Strengthen focus on equality to complement the inclusion approach: Addressing the four policy areas (education, employment, healthcare and housing) through an integrated

approach remains key for Roma inclusion, but there is also a need for a clear focus on equality. In particular, the fight against discrimination and antigypsyism should be a key objective and cross-cutting priority in each policy area, complementing the inclusion approach. This joint focus should ensure that Roma have effective access to economic and social justice and equal opportunities.

- ✓ Promote participation through empowerment, cooperation and trust: Meaningful Roma participation must be ensured in all stages of policy-making. Roma political, economic and cultural engagement should be promoted with a sense of belonging as full members of society. Empowerment and capacity-building of Roma, civil society and public authorities must be ensured, building cooperation and trust between stakeholders and between Roma and non-Roma communities.
- ✓ Reflect diversity among Roma: Member States should ensure that their strategic frameworks cover all Roma on their territory and reflect the needs of diverse groups through an intersectional approach. They should bear in mind how different aspects of identity can combine to exacerbate discrimination. They should set quantitative and/or qualitative targets to ensure that diversity in terms of age, gender, sexual orientation, mobility and other personal characteristics is reflected.
- ✓ Combine mainstreaming and explicit, but not exclusive Roma targeting²⁵: National Roma strategic frameworks should combine mainstreaming and explicit but not exclusive targeting, ensuring that mainstream services are inclusive and providing additional targeted support to promote effective equal access for Roma to rights and services. They should serve as planning instruments for using national and EU funds for Roma-targeted action and inclusive mainstream reform.
- ✓ Improve target-setting, data collection, monitoring and reporting: Working towards achievement of the EU-level headline targets and corresponding quantitative and/or qualitative national targets can trigger real progress towards Roma equality, inclusion and participation. Data should be collected regularly to feed into reporting and monitoring, improve transparency and accountability, and promote policy transfer and learning²⁶.

Second, operationalising the common features, building on the experiences with the current framework and following the widespread consultations²⁷ carried out over the past two years, the Commission invites all Member States to include in their national Roma strategic frameworks, as a minimum, the following commitments:

²⁵ See the <u>common basic principles</u>. Principle 2 (explicit but not exclusive targeting) 'implies focusing on Roma as a target group but not to the exclusion of other people who share similar socio-economic circumstances'. Principle 4 (aiming for the mainstream) refers to the aim 'to insert Roma in the mainstream of society (mainstream educational institutions, mainstream jobs, and mainstream housing). Where partially or entirely segregated education or housing still exist, Roma inclusion policies must aim to overcome this legacy. The development of artificial and separate 'Roma' labour markets is to be avoided'.

For a human-rights-based approach to data collection, national authorities are encouraged to consult the European handbook on equality data (2016 revision), Guidelines on improving the collection and use of equality data (2018) and Data collection in the field of ethnicity (2017). Member States are encouraged to allocate the necessary resources for such data collection and take advantage of the support of the FRA to strengthen their capacities to this end.

See the accompanying SWD(2020) 530 final.

The **national strategic framework** should set out:

- a) national baselines and targets towards the EU objectives and targets based on a comprehensive needs-assessment;
- b) targets and measures for specific groups (Roma children, women, young people, older Roma or those with disabilities, EU mobile citizens, non-EU nationals, stateless Roma) to reflect diversity among Roma, including gender-responsive and child/age-sensitive measures:
- c) measures to tackle antigypsyism and discrimination (e.g. through national anti-racism action plans);
- d) measures to ensure the socio-economic inclusion of marginalised Roma, in particular in the areas of education, employment, health and housing;
- e) a combination of targeted and mainstream measures taking account of specific local challenges and explicitly addressing the barriers that deprive Roma of equal access to mainstream policies²⁸;
- f) a dedicated budget for implementation and monitoring²⁹ making full use of social innovation and private capital;
- g) mechanisms for reporting, monitoring and evaluating progress towards set targets;
- h) a system of policy-relevant consultation and cooperation with Roma and pro-Roma civil society, sectoral ministries, equality bodies, other national human rights institutions and other stakeholders; and
- i) capacity-building to promote the active participation of civil society in all stages of policy-making and ensure its involvement in national and EU platform processes³⁰.

The National Roma Contact Points (NRCP) should:

- a) be given a mandate, sufficient resources and staff to ensure ongoing coordination and monitoring; and
- b) present a regular progress report and participate in core activities of the NRCP network managed by the Commission³¹.

Third, in addition to these common features and minimum commitments, additional national efforts, according to specific national contexts, can be important. Challenges in Roma equality, inclusion and participation vary depending on the size of the Roma population and their share of the overall population, as well as on the wider economic context and the legacy of exclusion and discrimination. They also vary depending on where and how Roma live (rural, urban, mobile, segregated areas) and specific aspects such as transnational mobility, migration or issues associated with civic documentation. These different challenges can be reflected in national Roma strategic frameworks, with differentiated objectives, levels of investment and types of policy solution. Depending on the national context (such as options for data collection, use of targeted or mainstream EU funding, relative size and specific needs of their Roma population), the Commission invites Member States to make additional commitments as follows:

The <u>Common basic principles</u> for Roma inclusion provide a framework for the successful design and implementation of actions to support Roma inclusion. Principles 2 and 4 deal with combining targeted and mainstream measures.

These platforms bring together governmental and civil society stakeholders. They aim to stimulate cooperation and exchange of experience on successful Roma inclusion.

Member States programming ESF+ specific objective on promoting the socio-economic integration of marginalised communities such as Roma must fulfil all requirements in Annex IV to the <u>Commission proposal for the 2021-2027 Common Provisions Regulation</u> concerning the thematic enabling condition on national Roma strategic frameworks. Several other EU funding instruments, such as cohesion policy funds can be used for Roma equality and inclusion.

Already in the 2011-2020 period, a network of National Roma Contact Points was created, allowing for exchange of information and experience among Member States at the European level.

The national strategic framework should also set out:

- a) national quantitative and qualitative targets for all seven EU objectives and associated targets (depending on data availability);
- b) how EU and national funds and financial instruments will be invested for Roma; and
- c) how institutional or administrative reforms will contribute to equality and inclusion.

The **National Roma Contact Points (NRCP)** should also carry out a mid-term evaluation and review of the national strategic framework.

Fourth, where Roma make up a significant proportion of the population (i.e. well above 1%)³², promoting their equality and inclusion is not only important in terms of fundamental rights but also has clear economic significance. In countries with a larger share of Roma people, this group represents a growing proportion of the school-age population and the future labour force. Progress in socioeconomic inclusion for the Roma has the potential to reduce labour and skills shortages in times of adverse demographic developments and reduce social expenditure. Investment in better education and upskilling of a previously excluded labour force can positively affect productivity growth. Ensuring that Roma people can deploy their potential to contribute to the economy and society in general will lead to better social and economic outcomes for all.

This justifies the need for more intensive commitments and EU support, in particular the use of EU funds for both targeted action and inclusive mainstream reforms. In this respect, Member States with a significant Roma population are invited to make full use of the proposed ESF+ specific objective on promoting the socio-economic integration of marginalised communities such as the Roma. They are also encouraged to do more to ensure that the available funding effectively reaches the Roma. This also requires data collection disaggregated by ethnicity and sex to support policy design, monitoring and review.

In addition to the minimum commitments and those deriving from the national context, the Commission therefore invites Member States with significant Roma populations to include in their national Roma strategic framework more ambitious commitments, according to which:

The **national strategic framework** should also:

- a) present a plan or set of measures for preventing and fighting antigypsyism and discrimination, segregation in education and housing, and anti-Roma prejudices and stereotypes (including online);
- b) mainstream Roma equality and inclusion at regional and local levels; and
- c) set out how EU and national funds and financial instruments will be invested for inclusive mainstream policy reform and targeted action.

The role of the **NRCP should be strengthened**, so that it can:

- a) count on a dedicated team and institutional mandate that ensures political weight, effective cross-sectoral coordination and mainstreaming of Roma equality and inclusion at regional and local levels;
- b) be involved (by EU fund managing authorities) in the coordination of cross-governmental discussions on the distribution of EU funds for Roma, and in systematic monitoring of their use (e.g. through monitoring committees, Roma inclusion impact screenings);

9

Four EU countries host large Roma populations (Bulgaria: 9,94%, Romania: 9,02%, Slovakia: 8,63%, Hungary: 7,49%). Czechia has a smaller Roma population (1,90%), as do Greece (1,63%) and Spain (1.55%). See Council of Europe 2012 estimates.

- c) ensure national consultation and dialogue empowering Roma (in particular young people and women); and
- d) ensure that public policies and universal services reach out to Roma effectively, including those living in remote rural areas (e.g. emergency and medium-term measures in times of crisis, legislative reform, policy planning on education, employment, healthcare, housing, other areas of socio-economic inclusion, social services, transport, minimum income systems, anti-discrimination legislation).

Finally, in designing and implementing national Roma strategic frameworks, Member States are advised to consider the **common basic principles** of Roma inclusion³³. Annex 1³⁴ provides additional **guidance for policy planning and implementation** when fighting antigypsyism and multi-generational poverty³⁵, promoting Roma participation and empowerment, reflecting diversity among Roma and combining targeted and mainstream approaches. It also sets out guidance to better **meet emerging challenges**, such as tackling the disproportionate impact on Roma of crises such as the COVID-19 pandemic, ensuring digital inclusion and delivering environmental justice. In addition, it provides guidance on promoting (awareness of) Roma art, history and culture and social innovation and policy experimentation.

The Commission will support Member States in developing and implementing their national Roma strategic frameworks not only through financial support and coordination measures, such as mutual learning or capacity-building, but also through methodological support³⁶ and assistance from the structural reform and support programme (SRSP) to develop monitoring and evaluation systems³⁷. Member States can also get support from the FRA, equality bodies and other national human rights institutions and national statistical institutes to ensure/improve regular data collection capacities at national level³⁸. EU support will be modulated according to the level of Member States' commitments.

III.2 Reporting and monitoring of national action and progress towards targets

In order to ensure more effective data collection, reporting and monitoring of progress on both EU targets, as well as of the national targets proposed above, the Commission proposes for the first time the use of a **portfolio of indicators** (see Annex 2). This would be of real value to mutual learning between Member States. This portfolio has been developed by a working party on Roma indicators and reporting coordinated by the FRA, involving national Roma contact points, national statistical offices and the Commission. It will also enable reporting on measures set out in the proposed Council Recommendation.

_

³³ Common basic principles.

Annex 1 uses experience from the evaluation of the EU framework, <u>input from three expert reports and civil positions feeding reflections on post-2020 policies for Roma</u>, and expertise from Commission services.

An ongoing Commission project, to be finalised by end 2020, is analysing the root causes of the transmission of poverty and exclusion across generations and suggest measures to tackle it. Another ongoing Commission-Fundamental Rights Agency project will be analysing data for insights on the links between discrimination and vulnerability in Europe at subnational level; the weight of discrimination in the relative risk of socio-economic exclusion, and whether Roma have been more affected by and vulnerable to the COVID-19 pandemic in specific territorial contexts. The findings may provide an evidence base for comprehensive action addressing both socio-economic disadvantage and discrimination.

In particular from the Commission's Joint Research Centre for randomised impact evaluations of selected targeted or mainstream flagship interventions but also from the Fundamental Rights Agency to assess the pertinence of intended measures.

Romania for example currently receives technical support under the Structural Reform Support Programme to develop a monitoring and evaluation system for the implementation of the Roma inclusion strategy.

To establish the principle of self-identification in individual-based data collections, e.g. census, large-scale surveys and administrative data where applicable.

Reporting and monitoring of national action will be done both at EU and national levels. In 2022, the Commission will take stock of national Roma strategic frameworks, assess the commitments made by the Member States and provide guidance for any improvement needed.

Member States are asked to report on implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks every two years from 2023 onwards, including measures to promote equality, inclusion and participation and making full use of the portfolio of indicators. The reporting should focus on implementation of the commitments set out in the national frameworks, including achievement of national targets, where appropriate. These reports should be made public, to increase transparency and promote policy learning. The strategic frameworks and finalised reports should also be discussed in national parliaments.

The Commission requests the FRA to carry out the regular Roma survey in four-year cycles starting in 2020 to provide the necessary baseline, mid-term and end-term data to measure change.³⁹ The FRA is also asked to support Member States' data collection and reporting efforts including through the working party on Roma indicators and reporting, and feed the Commission's monitoring and analysis of national progress.

National reports will serve, together with input from civil society and FRA data, as a basis for the Commission's periodic monitoring reports, issued every two years. The Commission will also carry out a mid-term and an ex-post **evaluation** of the EU Roma strategic framework.

IV. **EUACTIONS**

Member States are key actors to enable change on the ground for Roma. EU action and support will complement national efforts to promote progress towards the EU objectives and targets by 2030.

IV.1. Enforcing EU legislation

Action to fight antigypsyism and discrimination against Roma rests on an established EU legal framework, including the general principles of non-discrimination and equality set out in the Treaties, reaffirmed in the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, 40 as well as the Racial Equality Directive⁴¹ and the Council Framework Decision on Racism and Xenophobia⁴². As underlined in the EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025, a comprehensive system of protection against discrimination requires first and foremost the effective enforcement of the legal framework, to ensure that individual rights and obligations are respected in practice. This work goes broader than Roma, but will be of direct benefit to Roma communities.

The Commission will continue to monitor and enforce the application of the Racial Equality **Directive**, by investigating systematic discrimination and launching infringement proceedings, if necessary, to prompt changes in national legislation and policy. Over the last years, a particular focus was put on discrimination against Roma children in education. The Commission will provide guidance and training, and offer financial support for the collection of equality data and the effective implementation and enforcement of the Directive, including through the representation of victims' interests. As announced in the EU anti-racism action plan, the

In 2021 the survey will be extended to Serbia and North Macedonia.

See in particular Articles 2, 3(3) of the Treaty on European Union (TEU), articles 8, 10, 19 and 67(3) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), and articles 20 and 21 of the Charter.

^{2000/43/}EC

^{2008/913/}JHA

Commission will report on the application of the Directive⁴³ in 2021 and follow up with any possible legislation by 2022. Moreover, the Commission will continue to support the work of equality bodies, which accord a high priority in their work⁴⁴ to seeking improvement in the situation and experience of Roma. The Commission will monitor the implementation of the Commission Recommendation on standards for equality bodies⁴⁵. The role and independence of equality bodies and the potential need for new legislation to strengthen the role of these bodies will be an important theme in the 2021 report.

The Commission will also continue its work on preventing and combating racism and xenophobia, in particular by reinforcing recording and reporting of hate crimes with the support of the FRA, enhance the training strategies of law enforcement and strengthen the support for victims of hate crime. According to FRA⁴⁶, Roma experience a high rate (30% of respondents of Roma origin) of hate-motivated harassment. The Commission reiterates its commitment to ensure full and correct transposition and implementation of the Council Framework Decision on Racism and Xenophobia, and where necessary launch infringement procedures⁴⁷. As a prerequisite for the fight against antigypsyism, the minimum standards set on the criminalisation of hate speech, and the denial, condoning or trivialisation of the Holocaust need to be fully and correctly transposed into the legislation of Member States. As other people with a minority ethnic or racial background, Roma are affected by online hate speech, and antigypsyism is one of the most commonly reported ground of hate speech. The Commission will continue to cooperate with IT companies to counter illegal hate speech online, and extend efforts to other social media platforms⁴⁸. The Framework Decision is complemented by the Victims' Rights Directive⁴⁹, which amongst other things aims to ensure justice, protection and support for victims of hate crimes and hate speech. The EU strategy on victims' rights (2020-2025) addresses the specific needs of victims of hate crimes, including Roma⁵⁰.

IV.2. Mainstreaming Roma equality in EU policy initiatives and mobilising EU funds for Roma⁵¹

Mainstreaming Roma equality, inclusion and participation in all relevant Commission initiatives will be key to achieving the objectives set out in this strategic framework. When developing policies, from socio-economic inclusion to Artificial Intelligence, from the Green Deal to digital inclusion and from addressing hate speech to migration policies, integrating the equality dimension also includes ensuring that EU and national policies **serve the interests of all Roma people**. As part of its activities towards promoting equality for all and equality in all its senses, the Commission's internal Task Force on Equality will strive to ensure that the fight against discrimination on grounds of racial or ethnic origin and its intersections with other grounds of discrimination, is integrated into **all EU policies, legislation and funding programmes.** When implementing the EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025, the perspective of Roma will always be considered. Guidance and training on mainstreaming will support all involved in the integration

The report will also cover the application of <u>Council Directive 2000/78/EC of 27 November 2000 establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation (OJ L 303, 2.12.2000, p. 16).</u>

⁴⁴ Equinet, 28 July 2020: 'Roma and Traveller inclusion: towards a new EU framework learning from the work of equality bodies'.

⁴⁵ C(2018)3850 final.

FRA, 2017, Second European Minorities and Discrimination Survey.

EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025, COM(2020) 565 final.

See work on Code of conduct on countering illegal hate speech online, C(2018) 1177 final.

⁴⁹ 2012/29/EU.

⁵⁰ COM(2020) 258 final.

⁵¹ See Annex 3 of the SWD for more information on relevant mainstream EU policy initiatives and the use of EU funds.

of an equality perspective into every stage of EU interventions, and more active consultation of organisations representing Roma will be promoted throughout the Commission's policy cycle.

The Commission internal **Roma taskforce**⁵² will continue to engage different Commission services at various levels in key priority areas, such as the effective use of EU funds to promote Roma equality and inclusion.

As part of **NextGeneration EU**, the new Recovery and Resilience Facility will support investments and reforms essential to a lasting recovery and foster economic and social resilience and cohesion. In order to receive support, Member States will have to draw up recovery and resilience plans addressing the economic and social impacts of the crisis, the digital and green transitions and the relevant priorities identified in country specific recommendations under the European Semester. This support will give possibilities to Member States to foster the inclusion of marginalised groups, including Roma and other people with a minority racial or ethnic background. The Commission's proposals for the **multi-annual financial framework** promote the inclusion of Roma and the fight against discrimination, in particular through the European Social Fund Plus (ESF+), the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) and the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD). In 2019, the Commission highlighted the importance of Roma inclusion in several **European Semester** country specific reports⁵³; this should be reflected and addressed in the 2021-2027 programmes.

The Commission's proposals for the Common Provisions, the ESF+, the ERDF, and the EAFRD regulations⁵⁴:

- ✓ provide financial support for the implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks and measures, including human capacity, infrastructure and capacity building activities;
- ✓ provide for all programmes to promote equal opportunities for all, without discrimination on the basis of gender, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation, throughout their preparation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation;
- ✓ request fulfilment of thematic (national Roma strategic policy framework, national strategic policy framework for social inclusion and poverty reduction) and horizontal (Charter of Fundamental Rights) enabling conditions throughout the 2021-2027 period;
- ✓ require that at least 25% of ESF+ resources foster social inclusion, ensuring that a minimum amount targets those most in need; and
- ✓ stress the 'partnership principle', i.e. the involvement of all relevant stakeholders, including bodies representing social inclusion, non-discrimination and fundamental rights, civil society organisations, in the preparation and implementation of programmes and partnership agreements and in monitoring committees.

Member States have a key role in designing public policies and maximising the use of funding programmes to support Roma, as most of the EU budget is implemented by Member States in shared management. The Commission therefore invites Member States to target funds under the 2021-2027 multi-annual financial framework (MFF) and NextGeneration EU to tackle the challenges and address the needs of Roma, so as to implement the commitments taken in their national Roma strategic frameworks. The Commission will aim to ensure that country-specific challenges identified in the European Semester are properly addressed in the forthcoming partnership agreements, and that measures promoting equality and inclusion are implemented via operational programmes. The Commission will closely monitor that, in such Member States, a twin strategy of, on the one hand, making services inclusive and on the other hand providing

4 COM(2018)375 final, COM(2018)382 final, COM(2018)392 final.

_

Created in 2010 and composed of representatives of DG JUST, EMPL, EAC, SANTE, NEAR, HOME, REGIO and AGRI.

See country reports for BG, CZ, ES, HU, RO, SK and in particular their Annex D.

targeted programmes towards marginalised Roma communities is in place and reflected in the 2021-2027 programming documents. The enabling conditions applicable to specific EU funds in 2021-2027 proposed by the Commission aim to ensure respect for fundamental rights as well as Roma equality, inclusion and participation.

In order to enhance efficiency and effectiveness as regards the Roma-related interventions, the Commission will support transnational learning regarding both policy and funding, such as the EURoma network⁵⁵ of managing authorities and national Roma contact points.

InvestEU programme⁵⁶ under its social investment and skills window can also contribute to socio-economic inclusion of marginalised groups, including Roma. This can happen through innovative funding approaches such as social impact bonds and result-oriented projects including through blending with EU grants and/or financial instruments from sectorial programmes or combination of different streams of EU funding. The Commission will implement focused pilot initiatives with the aim of testing and demonstrating working approaches to concrete inclusion aspects (housing, employment, social security) through the use of innovative funding approaches, which could be taken up/expanded or replicated through larger programmes at national or EU level. Member States will be able to seek technical support to mainstream Roma equality in policy-making and reform processes through the Technical Support Instrument.

IV.3. EU action and support to promote Roma participation, inclusion and diversity

In the EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025, the Commission committed to lead by example as an institution by taking steps to significantly **improve the representativeness of Commission staff through measures targeting recruitment and selection**. When carrying out these measures the Commission will ensure that they apply to Roma. The Commission invites the other EU institutions to take steps to foster diversity and inclusion in their respective workplaces.

The Commission will organise regular meetings with Member State representatives⁵⁷ and **EU-level civil society and international organisations**, with a stronger mutual learning mandate. It will also ensure regular exchanges between stakeholders. The Commission will continue to organise meetings on **cohesion policy** with civil society organisations ('structured dialogue') in 2021-2027. It will hold closed dialogue meetings with Roma civil society organisations on cohesion policy developments.

As proposed by the European Parliament⁵⁸, the Commission will launch a new cycle of Roma civil society capacity-building to enable **coordinated independent civil monitoring and reporting**, building on lessons from the <u>Roma Civil Monitor</u> project (2017-2020). Coordinated independent civil monitoring reports are planned in two-year cycles starting in 2022.

The Commission will seek to maximise the influence of the European Roma platform⁵⁹, bringing together national governments, the EU, international organisations and Roma civil society representatives and aiming to stimulate cooperation and exchange of experience. It will

In the context of the network of National Roma Contact Points.

14

Network launched in 2007 by Spain's ESF managing authority.

⁵⁶ InvestEU Programme (2021-2027), see also Annex 3 of SWD.

Preparatory action 2020 — Roma Civil Monitor — Strengthening capacity and involvement of Roma and pro-Roma civil society in policy monitoring and review.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/combatting-discrimination/roma-and-eu/european-platform-roma-inclusion_en.

organise thematic, country and regional reviews of national strategic frameworks based on the findings of the Roma Civil Society Monitoring project and national monitoring reports.

Through its funding to the national Roma platforms the Commission will promote a reform of these platforms⁶⁰, in particular by making them more representative of the national Roma population. They should be extended to new stakeholders (e.g. children's rights organisations, the private sector) to enable new learning, tap into the potential of social innovation, change mentalities and bring about lasting social change. To encourage the **active engagement of Roma, particularly women and youth**, a platform representative should be elected to ensure transnational networking between national and European Roma platforms, while Roma youth should be offered dedicated traineeships or junior positions in national structures linked to the implementation of national Roma platforms. Synergies with other EU, national or international initiatives, in particular the civil monitoring project, should be used to foster mutual learning and policy transfer.

IV.4. EU action and support to promote equality and fight antigypsyism

To promote Roma equality by tackling antigypsyism the Commission will support activities promoting positive narratives and Roma role models, combatting negative stereotypes, raising awareness on Roma history and culture, and promoting truth and reconciliation under the citizens, equality, rights and values programme.

The Commission will run a joint campaign with UNESCO to tackle **disinformation**, **hate speech and conspiracy theories**, including those implicating Roma. It will continue to support the private sector through the EU Platform of Diversity Charters and explore ways of engaging with the media to build positive narratives and promote equality and diversity in all spheres. Building on existing experience⁶¹, the Commission will develop a series of seminars on racial and ethnic stereotypes, including against Roma, bringing together journalists, civil society organisations and representatives of people with a minority racial or ethnic background.

The Commission's **communication activities** will advertise the benefits of equality and diversity⁶². The Commission will organise a series of awareness-raising events focusing on Member States with large Roma communities, to fight stereotypes, promote cultural diversity, empower and highlight Roma children, young people and women as role models in diverse communities, and bring communities together.

Awareness of the consequences of multiple discrimination against Roma women will be aligned with the EU-wide communication campaign on **combating gender stereotypes**, which applies an intersectional approach to all spheres of life, as part of the gender equality strategy.

The Commission will:

_

- Enforce existing EU legislation protecting Roma against discrimination and racism and fill gaps where necessary;

National Roma platforms are participation and consultation processes convened and managed by National Roma Contact Points to promote dialogue, mutual learning, cooperation and involvement in the development, implementation and monitoring of national strategic frameworks, with support from the Commission via regular calls for funding support. National Roma Platform processes should contribute to design, implementation, monitoring and policy review. The main mission of the Platforms is threefold: widen policy discussions on the implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks, deepen domestic accountability structures, and reinforce links between the local and national levels.

⁶¹ See Media seminars - Stopping discrimination against Roma.

e.g. from a Roma woman's perspective: <u>Equal opportunities — let's make it a reality for all.</u>

- Mainstream Roma equality in EU policy initiatives and mobilise EU funds for Roma equality, inclusion and participation;
- Take steps to improve the diversity of Commission staff;
- Launch a new cycle of Roma civil society capacity-building and strengthen European and national Roma platforms;
- Promote positive narratives and Roma role models, combat negative stereotypes, raise awareness on Roma history and culture, and promote truth and reconciliation.

V. PROMOTING ROMA EQUALITY, INCLUSION AND PARTICIPATION BEYOND THE EU

The EU and the Member States should promote Roma equality, inclusion and participation in their **external action**, in particular under their enlargement, neighbourhood, development and humanitarian policies.

The Western Balkan region represents a geostrategic priority for the EU. The Commission Communication of February 2020⁶³ calls for alignment with EU policies, including in support of the most disadvantaged. Western Balkan partners already aligned, voluntarily, with the EU framework for national Roma integration strategies up to 2020. And they have made some remarkable advances. At the Zagreb EU-Western Balkans Summit in May 2020, EU leaders reaffirmed their support for the European perspective of the Western Balkans and their determination to step up support for its political, economic and social transformation⁶⁴. They welcomed the Western Balkan partners' strong commitment to the primacy of democracy and the rule of law, including human rights, gender equality and minority rights⁶⁵.

The presence of Roma in Western Balkans is important and similar to EU Member States with a significant Roma population. There is a compelling case for addressing Roma equality, inclusion and participation in the EU and Western Balkans in the same way, including application of the same objectives for the period up to 2030. In July 2019, the Western Balkans prime ministers adopted a Declaration on Roma integration in the EU enlargement process, committing themselves to the concrete improvement of the situation of Roma as regards education, employment, health, housing, civil registration and non-discrimination by the time of their accession⁶⁶. The EU will continue to support implementation of the Declaration and the work on data collection, Roma-responsive budgeting and the mapping of Roma housing. Progressive alignment with EU objectives and methodology will be part of the European perspective for all countries seeking to join the EU.

The Western Balkans partners, similarly to the EU Member States' semester process, present annual Economic Reform Programmes (ERP), including reforms to boost competitiveness and improve conditions for inclusive growth and job creation. ERPs report on social inclusion, poverty reduction and equal opportunities, including Roma. The **2021-2027 Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance** – once adopted – will continue to support reforms and alignment with EU requirements at regional and national levels. The economic and investment plan for Western Balkans identifies priority areas of investment to boost convergence, growth and competitiveness in the region, notably in support of marginalised groups and minorities, notably

⁶³ Enhancing the accession process - A credible EU perspective for the Western Balkans - COM(2020) 57 final.

EU and Western Balkans Summit, 5-6 May 2020, Council Conclusions and COM(2020) 315 final.

Zagreb Declaration.

Increase Roma employment (from 16.5 to 25%), compulsory education completion (from 51% to 90%), provide health insurance (for at least 95%), housing legalisation, prevent discrimination, ensure full civil registration. Poznan Declaration.

Roma communities.⁶⁷ Additional relevant EU funds, related to COVID-19 recovery or other external relations support measures, such as the Neighbourhood development and cooperation instrument (NDICI), will also be mobilised to promote the inclusion of Roma⁶⁸.

The EU will continue to promote non-discrimination and equality across the world on the basis of the EU strategic framework⁶⁹ and EU **Action Plans on Human Rights and Democracy** (2020-2024)⁷⁰ and the EU Gender Action Plans⁷¹ and cover Roma issues in the implementation of the 2019 EU guidelines on non-discrimination in external action⁷². EU action will complement national initiatives and support civil society. Roma equality and inclusion will be a regular agenda item in human rights and other political dialogues with non-EU countries having a significant Roma population. The EU will maintain its active engagement on Roma equality in regional and multilateral fora, in particular the Council of Europe, the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe and the United Nations.

VI. CONCLUSION

Roma have contributed to the cultural richness, diversity, economy and common history of Europe for centuries. The EU has a duty to protect its Roma minority from discrimination, antigypsyism and social exclusion. Achieving Roma equality, inclusion and participation requires all EU institutions, national governments and EU agencies, equality bodies and other human rights institutions to team up and take action in partnership with civil society and international organisations, and the full involvement of Roma themselves. The Commission invites the European Parliament to support this strategic framework and calls on the Council to work towards the swift adoption of the proposed **Recommendation for Roma equality, inclusion and participation**, ensuring that Member States and the Commission work hand in hand. Working together, we can make real progress by 2030 to bring about a Europe in which Roma individuals and communities, in all their diversity, have equal opportunities in all spheres of life, benefit from socio-economic inclusion and participate equally in society.

-

⁶⁷ COM (2020) 641 final adopted on 6 October 2020.

⁶⁸ Commission Communication on Support to the Western Balkans in tackling COVID-19 and the post-pandemic recovery (COM(2020) 315 final).

^{69 11855/12} Annex II. Council of the EU, 25 June 2012.

EU Action Plans on Human Rights and Democracy 2012-2014 and 2015-2019; <u>Joint Communication and EU Action Plan on Human rights and Democracy (2020-2024)</u> as adopted by the College on 25 March 2020, adoption by the Council is foreseen in the last quarter of 2020.

Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment: Transforming the Lives of Girls and Women through EU External Relations 2016-2020 SWD (2015) 182 and its planned successor.

EU Human Rights Guidelines on Non-discrimination in External Action.



Brussels, 7.10.2020 COM(2020) 620 final

ANNEX 1

ANNEX

to the

COMMUNICATION FROM THE COMMISSION TO THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL

A Union of Equality: EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation

{SWD(2020) 530 final}

Annex 1: Guidelines for planning and implementing national Roma strategic frameworks

TACKLING ANTIGYPSYISM

Thanks to the work of the Alliance against Antigypsyism, the European Parliament and the Council of Europe¹, there is emerging consensus that antigypsyism (a specific form of racism against Roma) contributes to persistent Roma exclusion. As antigypsyism and exclusion form a vicious circle, they should be tackled together. Fighting discrimination and antigypsyism will contribute to the success of inclusion measures, which in turn will foster greater openness and acceptance in society. Fighting antigypsyism and promoting diversity and inclusion require the participation of society as a whole, Roma and non-Roma communities alike. They involve Roma empowerment and tackling mainstream (including institutional) attitudes and behaviour. Equality bodies could be privileged partners for National Roma Contact Points (NRCP) in providing standards for implementation and championing the stronger anti-discrimination focus in strategies.

National Roma strategic frameworks should:

- include a stand-alone focus on the fight against antigypsyism, in order to:
 - 1) recognise antigypsyism and the responsibility to act against it;
 - 2) recognise the historical dimensions of antigypsyism, in particular the Roma Holocaust; raise awareness of Roma history and promote reconciliation;
 - 3) raise awareness of the mutual benefits of diversity and inclusion; construct positive narratives; foster role models; support inter-community encounters and inter-cultural learning to fight stereotypes and misinformation about Roma in education, the media, the arts, culture and history;
 - 4) fight discrimination as a manifestation of antigypsyism;
 - 5) combat hate speech and hate crime as manifestations of antigypsyism and encourage the reporting of bias-motivated crime, harassment and violence;
 - 6) promote access to justice for victims of antigypsyism and discrimination;
 - 7) raise awareness among Roma of their rights; and
 - 8) dismantle and prevent systemic/institutional/structural discrimination² experienced by Roma;
- prevent and fight antigypsyism as a cross-cutting/horizontal priority in all sectoral policy areas, in order to:
 - 1) fight segregation, bullying and harassment in education; sensitise school staff;
 - 2) fight discrimination in (access to) employment and sensitise employers;
 - 3) fight discrimination in access to good-quality healthcare; eliminate parallel, segregated services; prevent human rights violations (e.g. forced abortion and forced sterilisation); sensitise healthcare workers;
 - 4) fight spatial segregation; prevent forced evictions without alternative housing; sensitise authorities; and
 - 5) regularly collect equality data (data on experiences of discrimination; data from equality bodies on incidents of discrimination).

Antigypsyism — a reference paper, Berlin/Budapest, 2017; European Parliament Resolution of 15 April 2015 on the occasion of International Roma Day — Anti-gypsyism in Europe and EU recognition of the memorial day of the Roma genocide during World War II; European Parliament report on fundamental rights aspects in Roma integration in the EU – fighting anti-gypsyism (2017/2038(INI)); European Parliament Resolution of 12 February 2019 on the need for a strengthened post-2020 strategic EU framework for national Roma inclusion strategies and stepping up the fight against anti-gypsyism; ECRI 2012 General Policy Recommendation No 13 on combating anti-gypsyism and discrimination against Roma; Council of Europe, Declaration of the Committee of Ministers on the rise of anti-

gypsyism and racist violence against Roma in Europe.

Systemic discrimination results from inequalities embedded in legislation, policy and practice. They are often not embedded by intent but because of a range of institutional factors in the formulation, implementation and review of legislation, policy and practice. See <u>Roma and traveller inclusion: towards a new EU framework, learning from the work of equality bodies.</u>

FIGHTING MULTIGENERATIONAL POVERTY

(with a child protection focus and better use of EU funds)

Tackling multigenerational poverty and exclusion is crucial to improving the situation of marginalised Roma. Exclusion and discrimination in access to education, employment, healthcare and housing affect children's development and may in turn affect their future parenthood, leading to further disadvantage for their own children. The vicious circle of exclusion and discrimination is bound to continue unless there is significant intervention to address comprehensively the root dynamics and plan a better future for the next generation. This requires a **focus on children** and must be sustained over time.

- mobilise relevant expertise at all levels of governance to formulate child protection measures; allocate adequate resources to early childhood education and care and education (e.g. scholarships, mentorships, after-school support), nutrition, personal development and work with families;
- encourage participation in early childhood education and care;
- protect women, children and youth through strategies to fight crimes such as trafficking in human beings, including for all forms of exploitation as relevant (sexual exploitation, labour exploitation, forced begging and the exploitation of criminal activities for forced and exploitative sham marriages), and enable their access to assistance, support and protection;
- improve access to community and family based services for people with disabilities and children deprived of parental care; strengthen measures to prevent institutionalisation through support for families in precarious situations and people with disabilities;
- ensure the long-term sustainability of support measures for children and their families, so as to improve conditions for the next generation;
- base the planning of financial support and investment on accurate analysis of the root causes of
 marginalisation (socio-economic exclusion and discrimination); collect more granular evidence
 through systematic evaluations and analysis of the types of national, regional and local intervention
 that (do not) work and why, to deepen understanding of the obstacles to inclusion; involve all
 stakeholders (local authorities, civil society, Roma/non-Roma stakeholders with possibly diverging
 views) in analytical work;
- analyse the use of EU funds in cooperation with managing authorities if monitoring reports find that funds have not been used effectively to achieve inclusion goals, engage with local/managing authorities and stakeholders to understand why and address any obstacles that are identified; and
- establish close links between NRCPs and the authorities responsible for monitoring EU funds; ensure that the use of EU funds for Roma creates real opportunities for participation and has the intended day-to-day impact for them, rather than benefiting other interests.

PROMOTING ROMA PARTICIPATION

Roma participation in shaping public affairs is a pre-condition and an enabler of equality and inclusion, and promotes democratic and efficient governance. Roma participation and empowerment are about giving people a voice and enabling them to act in new, life-affirming ways. Inclusion opens the way for action and gives people the opportunity to participate. Participation and empowerment are principles and processes for bettering people's living conditions and life outcomes. Supporting meaningful Roma participation in policy-making at local, national and EU level is a pre-condition for tackling exclusion. Roma-led and pro-Roma civil society organisations are particularly important actors. When coordinating the development of national strategic frameworks, NRCPs are encouraged to promote participatory models, e.g. by facilitating thematic working groups that develop needs assessment, priorities, targets, action in key fields, bringing together national, regional, local and non-governmental actors, and ensuring Roma participation. These models and structures could subsequently be used for monitoring and evaluating implementation.

National Roma strategic frameworks should:

- set out minimum compulsory aspects and channels of Roma participation in policy development, implementation and monitoring, and the programming of EU funds, including by written protocols of participation setting out the mandate (scope and nature of engagement), composition (principles for selecting members), working methods and expected outcomes of consultation and participation bodies, with a view to ensuring effective cooperation, trust and accountability³;
- create opportunities for Roma communities' empowerment at the local level to enable community
 ownership and action aimed explicitly at bringing about social and political change. Mobilising
 communities should be seen as a deliberate inclusive and participatory process involving Roma
 people, local authorities and organisations;
- ensure that Roma are represented in all their diversity (including nationals and non-nationals, marginalised and integrated, women, children and young people) in policy and consultation processes;
- improve local action by engaging more Roma professionals to act as mediators and help overcome the persistent lack of trust between Roma and majority communities;
- promote civil society cooperation between Roma-focused and mainstream organisations, especially those targeting children's, young people's and women's rights;
- use EU and other funds to provide regular capacity-building support (in equality screening, participation, etc.), in particular for grassroots and local civil society; and
- in countries with a significant Roma population:

o promote positive action to increase Roma participation in national and local administration in the fields of equality and inclusion, research, etc.; and

o consider establishing national Roma umbrella organisations for sustained consultation and participation in policy discussions. These should receive core institutional grants from national governments or regular civil society support funds.

Violetta Zentai, Georgeta Munteanu and Simona Torotcoi, *The quality of participation in a post-2020 EU initiative for Roma equality and inclusion*, expert reports building on forward-looking aspects of the evaluation of the EU framework for national Roma integration strategies, 2020, pp. 41, 59-60.

REFLECTING DIVERSITY

It is crucial to recognise the diversity among Roma people and communities when designing national strategic frameworks. The EU Roma strategic framework promotes empowerment of Roma women, young people and children (and Roma living with disabilities, elder Roma, LGBTI+ Roma and EU mobile citizens) to overcome socio-economic gaps, fully exercise their rights, realise their potential and be active agents of change.

- assess the needs and situation of all (including non-national, non-EU and stateless) Roma;
- address multiple discrimination and intersectionality, which increase the severity of exclusion;
- target the most marginalised Roma groups with inclusion and anti-poverty measures (without excluding other groups in a similar situation) and address all Roma with measures promoting participation, and Roma and non-Roma with measures preventing and fighting antigypsyism and discrimination:
- establish specific goals and targeted measures for Roma women, children and young people, those with disabilities, elder Roma, EU mobile citizens, stateless Roma and those from non-EU countries (as relevant) and break down indicators by sex and age;
- address the gender dimension in all areas, especially education, employment, healthcare, child support and fighting (multiple) discrimination, including (domestic) violence and exploitation; promote participation and ensure that measures are gender-responsive;
- support Roma women's access to justice to prevent/overcome domestic violence and other human rights violations;
- engage in transnational cooperation to tackle the challenges and opportunities arising from transnational mobility of Roma more effectively, ensuring access to education, employment, housing, healthcare and other social services; and
- end statelessness among Roma by ensuring universal birth registration and access to identity documents, formal statelessness determination procedures and universal access to services.

COMBINING MAINSTREAM AND TARGETED APPROACHES

While anti-Roma discrimination and exclusion justify a continued targeted approach, the aim of targeting is to promote effective inclusion and equality for Roma in all spheres of life. That pre-supposes inclusive reform of mainstream policies, which requires a smart combination of targeted and mainstream approaches. Targeted policies should be temporary and serve to mitigate the additional disadvantages and discrimination that Roma face. Targeting should be explicit (though not necessarily based on ethnicity), but not exclusive, i.e. not exclude non-Roma in the same situation.

- spell out how the specific targeted measures (safeguards) address the barriers that prevent Roma from accessing and benefiting from mainstream policies, and how public policies are made more inclusive of Roma:
- promote access to rights and mainstream services for Roma with additional targeted support, but without creating permanent parallel structures;
- target intervention territorially to ensure that it takes account of local conditions; combine territorial and social group targeting in broad interventions (e.g. to tackle extreme poverty) and ensure that they reach the Roma population;
- in countries with a significant Roma population:
 - o subject key mainstream policy measures to screening/audit to assess their impact on Roma equality and inclusion;
 - o set out how EU funds will be used for inclusive reform of mainstream policies (e.g. desegregation in education or housing) and for targeted action; and
 - o set out arrangements for mainstreaming Roma equality, inclusion and participation at regional and local levels.

UPSCALING MEASURES TO PREVENT/MITIGATE THE DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT OF CRISES ON ROMA

All the core challenges facing the EU today (including the coronavirus pandemic, climate change, and the green and digital transitions) have a Roma equality and inclusion dimension. Particular care should be taken to ensure that discriminated and marginalised groups, in particular among Roma, are not forced to bear a disproportionate share of the burden from crises and transitions, and that emergency responses and longer-term growth strategies involve targeted additional support for their inclusion. Lessons should be learned from the coronavirus pandemic, which affected marginalised Roma communities disproportionately and saw them exposed to the worst short-term health and medium/long-term economic impacts. National Roma strategic frameworks should help mitigate the effects of the coronavirus crisis and equip us better to deal with any such occurrence in the future.

- plan effective data collection and monitoring of socio-economic impacts (by age, sex and medical need) to ensure effective and tailored policy measures that respond to the existing/future pandemics;
- take account of short-, medium- and long-term needs and involve those concerned in developing and implementing measures;
- support local authorities' efforts to address the most immediate needs of Roma communities (e.g. access to shelter, including food and water, access to free health services and financial support for Roma families in precarious economic situations);
- prioritise efforts to tackle structural inequalities and Roma communities' lack of access to basic services and infrastructure;
- ensure that measures and/or actions using EU and national funding reach out to and address the needs of the most marginalised and disadvantaged communities;
- promote access to safe and clean drinking water for Roma⁴;
- improve access to sanitation and ensure the continuity of basic utility services in the event of a pandemic;
- promote health literacy in the Roma population;
- promote the dissemination of accurate, clear and evidence-based information and awareness-raising campaigns as effective tools against discrimination and xenophobia;
- provide for regular monitoring of environmental conditions and risks specifically affecting disadvantaged Roma communities and take action to remedy hazardous or unhygienic conditions;
- promote consistency between emergency and recovery measures, and mainstream initiatives such as the 'green deal', digitalisation, the European pillar of social rights, the Sustainable Development Goals, the European Semester and mainstream strategies, programmes and reforms.

The <u>Drinking Water Directive</u> (recital 31; Article 16) requires Member States to take account of the specific situation of minority cultures, such as Roma and travellers, whether or not settled, by taking the necessary measures to improve their access to water intended for human consumption.

ENSURING DIGITAL INCLUSION

As the coronavirus pandemic forced schools, campuses and offices to close, everyone turned to the internet for a lifeline. The mass shift to online education and telemedicine, etc. assumed that everyone had internet access. However, the crisis revealed startling global disparities in online and distance learning. Roma are often located in rural areas, areas that are still in behind when it comes to access to high speed broadband infrastructures. For marginalised Roma with little or no access to IT equipment or digital literacy, its impacts brought to light deep-seated structural inequalities, translating into risks of Roma children underperforming and lagging behind in their school work and adults being deprived of real-time information and job opportunities. Underlying challenges linked to inequality, discrimination and exclusion in the digital age must be tackled, to ensure that no-one is left behind. The successful deployment of digital technologies and Europe's resilience and social fairness depend on people having access to the necessary infrastructure, equipment and digital skills.

National Roma strategic frameworks should:

- tackle the digital exclusion of Roma by providing access to digital technologies, in particular access to and support for online and distance learning if education and training institutions close, as during the coronavirus pandemic;
- encourage synergies with other policy initiatives (especially those concerned with online public, e-government and commercial services), so as to improve the usability of public services and promote inclusive e-government, with specific measures to deliver public services to and connect Roma with a special attention to rural areas;
- boost digital skills and competences⁵ among Roma by:
 - 1) improving access to digital equipment and network connections (e.g. public internet access points in deprived areas);
 - 2) promoting basic digital skills and competences in a lifelong learning perspective and offering respective training;
 - 3) improving Roma's quality of use and participation in the information society; and
 - 4) promoting the reporting of online discriminatory practices in access to and the use of services;
 - 5) embedding digital literacy initiatives in local socio-economic contexts, adapting them to the specific needs and conditions of Roma communities;
 - 6) encouraging and supporting digital literacy⁶ initiatives that:
 - stimulate motivation and awareness as regards using the internet;
 - are affordable and sustainable;
 - feature content and delivery modes adapted to Roma (new teaching methods, informal learning, etc.); and
 - are accessible and usable;

• encourage the use of digital solutions for healthcare, for both patients and healthcare professionals, in order to ensure continuity of care and safe means of treatment; and

revisit strategic frameworks for digital inclusion to assess barriers experienced by Roma.

⁵ The <u>Digital Competences for citizens framework</u> identifies five components of digital competence: information and data literacy, communication and collaboration, digital content creation, safety and problem solving.

⁶ The <u>Digital Competence for citizens' framework</u> defines information and data/digital literacy as the ability to articulate information needs; to locate and retrieve digital data, information and content; to judge the relevance of the source and its content; and to store, manage, and organise digital data, information and content.

DELIVERING ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

The environmental discrimination⁷ faced by numerous Roma communities is coming to public attention. This long-neglected reality has revealed its disproportionate effects during the coronavirus pandemic, which saw marginalised communities more vulnerable to contamination and other associated health issues. Health risks are compounded by inadequate living conditions and segregation, pushing Roma even further into socio-economic exclusion.

National Roma strategic frameworks should:

- recognise and tackle environmental discrimination, in particular as it affects marginalised Roma communities in segregated areas (as a manifestation of antigypsyism); promote understanding of how environmental discrimination and a lack of environmental services force marginalised Roma to live in environmentally degraded areas;
- focus on access to water, adequate sanitation, waste collection and management services, and fight
 persisting spatial segregation as a cause of environmental discrimination in the field of housing and
 essential services;
- tackle insufficient access of Roma to green living areas with recreational value;
- prevent environmental health risks and tackle the health impact of exposure to pollution and contamination; and
- ensure occupational health and safety for those working in less favourable environmental conditions.

Network's website.

_

Environmental discrimination is suffered by Roma living in segregated settlements among environmentally hazardous conditions (next to waste dumps, abandoned industrial sites or flood-prone areas) deprived of basic environmental necessities such as water and waste management. See <u>Pushed to the wastelands: environmental racism against Roma communities in central and Eastern Europe</u>. For conceptual explanations and resources, see the Energy Justice

PROMOTING (AWARENESS OF) ROMA ARTS, HISTORY AND CULTURE

Roma art, history and culture are integral features of our European and national landscapes. However, over centuries, portrayals of Roma culture and identity have been romanticised and stereotyped, and this has exacerbated the alienation of Roma communities from mainstream societies. Cultural recognition should be built through Roma narratives.

- recognise and raise awareness and Roma ownership of the contribution of Roma art and culture to national and European heritage;
- support platforms to facilitate contacts between Roma and non-Roma at local level through the promotion of traditional and modern Roma arts, crafts and culture, and knowledge about Roma history;
- promote awareness-raising activities in cooperation with media operators in support of a self-constructed Roma identity and cultural heritage;
- combat anti-Roma prejudice and stereotypes;
- designate and commemorate 2 August as European Roma Holocaust Memorial Day, to commemorate the victims of the Roma genocide in World War II;
- promote an integrated approach to Holocaust commemoration, by remembering the fate of the Roma on International Holocaust Memorial Day (27 January, the day on which the Auschwitz-Birkenau concentration camp was liberated);
- integrate Roma communities in national cultural narratives, by including Roma arts, history and culture in collections in national archives, museums and permanent art exhibitions; allocate appropriate resources to preserving, conserving and developing Roma arts and culture, including through the promotion of festivals;
- include the Romani language and Roma history in school curricula and textbooks for both Roma and non-Roma students; promote multicultural awareness-raising activities and campaigns in schools; and
- provide opportunities for empowerment and support Roma entrepreneurs and self-employed individuals with local businesses that promote Roma traditions and culture.

PROMOTING SOCIAL INNOVATION AND POLICY EXPERIMENTATION

Social innovation and policy experimentation constitute new approaches from the field of social change that encompass ideas, practices and initiatives that intervene at the various levels of a system to catalyse deep shift and lasting positive impact. As such, they can be meaningful tools to promote Roma equality, inclusion, participation and empowerment.

EU policy defines 'social innovation' as activities that are social both as to their ends and means, and which relate to the development and implementation of new ideas (concerning products, services and models) that simultaneously meet social needs and create new social relationships or collaborations, thereby benefiting society and boosting its capacity to act⁸. 'Social policy experimentations' mean policy interventions that offer an innovative response to social needs, implemented on a small scale and in conditions that enable their impact to be measured, prior to being implemented in other contexts or on a larger scale, if the results prove convincing⁹.

National Roma strategic frameworks should:

- support emergence of national alliances for learning and innovation for inclusion bringing together actors from across the ecosystem (relevant Roma practitioner organisations together with business/industry, social incubators and change-makers' networks, embassies, research organisations);
- launch joint co-creation processes with national/regional stakeholders, philanthropy and social purpose organisations to identify needs, available resources and opportunity for joint systematic action (including with available EU advisory support);
- support incubation of outcome-oriented projects addressing key social service areas (access to housing, utilities, basic public infrastructure and services etc.);
- catalyse and accumulate learning on working approaches on the different topics/sectors, while activating and capacitating key actors from the different sectors (public, private, civil) for joint collaboration;
- experiment with social policies (e.g. providing basic income guarantees) to generate models and test alternative delivery mechanisms for welfare benefits;
- explore mobilisation of private capital, and the pooling of funds with e.g. philanthropic organisations through possible matching schemes, to respond to unaddressed needs of the most vulnerable;
- explore new service or delivery models and expanded provisioning through outcome-oriented partnerships;
- support pooling and integration of targeted and flexible funding; and
- support the establishment of social innovation competence centres (to be supported through ESF+ transnational activities) and give mandate to support Roma inclusion needs.

⁹ Ibid, Article 2(17).

.

⁸ Cf. Commission proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on the European Social Fund Plus (ESF+) 2018/0206 COD (COM(2018) 382 final), 30.5.2018, Article 2(16).



Brussels, 7.10.2020 COM(2020) 620 final

ANNEX 2

ANNEX

to the

COMMUNICATION FROM THE COMMISSION TO THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL

A Union of Equality: EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation

{SWD(2020) 530 final}

EN EN

www.parlament.gv.at

PORTFOLIO OF INDICATORS

The general objective of this portfolio of indicators is to monitor progress against the objectives and targets of the EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation. In order to meet this general objective, Member States need to implement a number of measures in priority areas, each of them having its specific horizontal or sectoral objective.

The portfolio of indicators to be used for measuring progress towards these objectives has been developed in the context of the Working Party on Roma equality, inclusion and participation indicators and reporting coordinated by the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA). Members of the Working Party are the National Roma Contact Points from 20 Member States and representatives from Statistical Offices and the European Commission. Furthermore, the portfolio was aligned with the indicators and targets developed in relevant EU initiatives for the period up to 2030 and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The full report is available at https://fra.europa.eu/en/news/2020/roma-working-party-consultations-roma-inclusion-monitoring-framework.

The portfolio of indicators is based on the structure-process-outcome (S-P-O) indicator model recommended by the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) when assessing compliance with human rights standards. This model allows an assessment of:

- a) legal and policy frameworks in place (structural indicators);
- b) specific interventions to implement it (process indicators);
- c) achievements, as experienced by the rights holders (outcome indicators).

<u>Structural indicators</u>: EU and national legal frameworks and strategies that are put in place to comply with the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights (for Roma, an EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation).

<u>Process indicators</u>: The specific interventions and actions (e.g. programmes, projects, measures) put in place to achieve the objectives and targets of the national Roma strategic frameworks by implementing the legal and policy provisions mentioned.

Outcomes or result indicators: The situation on the ground and any changes in the enjoyment of fundamental rights of individuals with specific characteristics, such as ethnic origin in the case of Roma. These are mostly standard indicators, populated by data that can be disaggregated based in different categories of ethnic origin, sex and age. In Member States where no such data are available socioeconomic data can be used as proxy. The indicators should be in line with the Europe 2020 or any post-2020 indicators of poverty and social exclusion, as well as sectoral policy areas delivering on the objectives of the European Pillar of Social Rights, such as education, health and employment.

OBJECTIVES, HEADLINE INDICATORS, TARGETS AND MEASURES

The monitoring framework was explicitly designed to track progress towards policy goals. The goals are reflected in the outcome indicators (headline and secondary) and the targets could be the desired status Member States would like to achieve by 2030 in each area of Roma equality, inclusion and participation. The framework is based on the Commission's Better Regulation Guidelines, the EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation and the proposal for a Council Recommendation on Roma equality, inclusion and participation.

Most outcome indicators are survey-based but should be complemented with administrative data, e.g. on infrastructure, residential segregation, etc.

<u>Headline indicators</u>: These are outcome indicators that are survey-based and mandatory for all Member States for which such data are available or can be collected in the future. Countries that do not have any quantitative data (ethnically disaggregated or proxy) collection in place should consider collecting qualitative data and formulating targets towards process indicators (see below).

¹ European Commission (2017): Better Regulation Guidelines. Staff Working Document. Brussels, 7 July 2017; SWD(2017) 350.

<u>Secondary outcome indicators</u>: These are contextual indicators and complement the headline indicators of the objective. Member States can choose whether to populate them or not.

There is a difference between the obligation to populate indicators and to collect data for indicators. For example, the topics of segregation in education, access to tap water, or birth certificates are more relevant in some countries than in others. Also, some secondary indicators could become headline indicators if particularly relevant in a specific country, for example medical insurance coverage.

<u>Process indicators:</u> A combination of legal and economic facts, types of measures, capacity of implementing actors, level of engagement with Roma communities and civil society organisations (CSOs). It is optional for Member States to choose the indicators and areas of policy interventions within their strategic frameworks.

Table 1: Overview of EU headline objectives and indicators for Roma equality, inclusion and participation

	Horizontal objectives		EU headline indicators	SDG relevance
1	Fight and prevent antigypsyism and discrimination ²	1	Share of people who felt discriminated against because of being Roma in any of the areas covered in the survey in the past 12 months	SDG 10.3.1 SDG 16.b.1
		2	Share of general population who feel uncomfortable having Roma as their neighbours	
2	Reduce poverty and social exclusion	3	At-risk-of poverty rate (below 60% of median equivalised income after social transfers)	SDG 1.2.1
		3.1	Children< 18 at-risk-of poverty	SDG 1.2.2
		4	Share of people living in a household in severe material deprivation (cannot afford 4 out of 9 items, e.g. food, inviting friends, etc.)*	SDG 1
		4.1	Children < 18 living in severe material deprivation*	SDG 1
3	Promote participation by empowerment, building cooperation and trust	4	Share of people who felt discriminated against (in any area) in the last 12 months and reported the last incident of discrimination because of being Roma	
		5	Active citizenship and participation indicators TO BE DEVELOPED	
	Sectoral objectives		EU headline indicators	SDG relevance
4	Increase effective equal access to quality inclusive mainstream education	6	Share of children aged from 3 up to the age of starting compulsory primary education who attend early childhood education and care	SDG 4.2.2
		7	Share of people aged 20-24 who completed at least upper secondary education	SDG 4.3
		8	Share of children aged 6-15 who attend schools where 'all or most of schoolmates are Roma' as reported by the respondents (selected countries only)	
5	Increase effective equal access to paid quality and sustainable employment	9	Share of people who self-declared their main activity status as 'paid work' (including full-time, part-time, ad hoc jobs, self-employment and occasional work or work in the past four weeks), 20-64 years old	SDG 8.5
		10	Share of young people aged 15-29*** whose current main activity is 'neither in employment, education or training' (NEET)	SDG 8.6.1

² Operational objectives under this horizontal objective include fighting discrimination, harassment, hate crime and hate speech against Roma; promoting (awareness of) Roma history, culture, recognition and reconciliation.

_

		11	Gender employment gap: difference in the paid work rate between women and men, 20-64 years old	SDG 8.5
6	and increase effective	12	Difference in life expectancy at birth (general population vs. Roma)	
	equal access to quality healthcare and social services	13	Share of people who have restricted access to health and social services, TO BE DEVELOPED	
7	access to adequate desegregated housing and	14	Share of people living in housing deprivation (living in an apartment that is too dark, with a leaking roof/damp walls, floors, no bath/shower, no indoor toilet)	SDG 11.1
	essential services ³	15	Share of people living in household that does not have the minimum number of rooms according to Eurostat's definition of overcrowding	
		16	Share of people living in households without tap water inside the dwelling (selected countries only)	SDG 6.1.1

FRA data for populating indicators can be disaggregated by sex, age, DEGURBA

PROXY INDICATORS

In countries where ethnic data collection is impossible, proxy data can be used, for example based on socio-economic data. Data collection can be conducted in settlements and regional units identified as segregated or with a high share of vulnerable persons. The underlying assumption should be that the population in these localities includes a high percentage of Roma or are strongly perceived as Roma and therefore vulnerable to social exclusion and discrimination. Note that such proxy data could restrict data collection to only data on the most marginalised groups and could leave out those who are not economically deprived but still face the consequences of antigypsyism in their daily life or when they disclose their identity. In such cases, it is important to complement the proxy data with qualitative and administrative data from research and consultations with civil society organisations, national human rights institutions and local authorities. If quantitative data are lacking, countries are still encouraged to collect qualitative data at the level of process indicators.

Data for qualitative process indicators may come from a variety of sources. Since 2016, Member States have reported to the Commission on process indicators relevant to the substantive policy areas included in the 2013 Council recommendation using a harmonised online reporting template. However, even when comparable across countries, these data represent only a small part of the process-relevant information that is necessary for sound process-level monitoring. The second strand of process-relevant data collection, i.e. data that reflect the specifics of Roma inclusion challenges and measures that address them in individual Member States is equally important for the development of a sound national monitoring system and therefore key to a successful national Roma strategic framework. Furthermore, it is recommended that Roma civil society is part of the monitoring process and development of national data collection and monitoring systems. Guidelines on improving the collection and use of equality data have been provided by the subgroup on equality data of the EU High-Level Group on Non-discrimination, Equality and Diversity⁴.

In 2016, Member States started reporting to the Commission on process indicators, in compliance with the 2013 Council recommendation on effective Roma integration measures. This work is to be continued in the context of the FRA working party on indicators and reporting.

^{*}Will be replaced with social and material deprivation (Eurostat [ilc_mdsd07]) and respective indicator for children if used in the SDG reporting for general population in the future

^{**}Current data based on FRA surveys only covers the 16-29 age group

³ Such as tap water, adequate sanitation, waste collection- and management services, electricity, gas, access to transport, financial services and digital communications (in line with principle 20 of the European Pillar of Social Rights). An operational objective under this sectoral objective is promoting environmental justice and fighting environmental deprivation.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/final guidelines 4-10-18 without date july.pdf.

HORIZONTAL OBJECTIVES

Objective 1: Fight and prevent antigypsyism and discrimination

Headli	ne indicators:	General
		population
1)	Share of people who felt discriminated against because of being	Potentially FRS ⁵
	Roma in any of the areas covered in the survey in the past 12	SDG 10.3.1 and 16.b.1
	months	
2)	Share of general population who feel uncomfortable having Roma	FRS
	as their neighbours	

Objective 1-a: Fighting discrimination, harassment, hate crime and hate speech against Roma

Outcome indicators	
Secondary (optional)	
Indicator	General population
Share of people aged 16+ who have experienced hate-motivated	n.a. / potentially FRS
harassment at least 5 acts because of being Roma in the 12 months	SDG 10.3.1
before the survey	SDG 16.b.1
Share of people aged 16+ (out of all respondents) who were physically attacked because of being Roma in the past 12 months	n.a. / potentially FRS SDG 16.1.3
physically attacked occause of being Rollia in the past 12 months	500 10.1.5

Process indicators for objective 1-a: Fighting discrimination, harassment, hate crime and hate speech against Roma

Indicator – Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma equality, inclusion and participation strategic frameworks or related sets of policy documents explicitly include measures to combat antigypsyism;
- national action plan for the implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks of the EU Member State concerned envisages specific measures to address antigypsyism and discrimination;
- equality bodies regularly monitor the implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks for compliance with the Racial Equality Directive and the Council Framework Decision on combatting certain forms of racism and xenophobia and record cases of discrimination against Roma;
- anti-discrimination reports and surveys are regularly produced and released;
- antigypsyism is recognized in Member States' legal frameworks, policies, policy documents and policy implementation measures;
- antigypsyism is provided as a category in hate crime data recording;
- the specific measures to address antigypsyism and discrimination have funding allocated;
- municipalities with a significant Roma population have (a) dedicated Roma councillor position(s) among their staff.

Indicator – Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- a publicly accessible system for monitoring court cases and complaints to national equality bodies on cases of antigypsyism is in place;
- a publicly accessible system for monitoring cases and incidents of discrimination, hate speech and hate crime against Roma and reporting them to national equality bodies or Ombudsperson offices, prosecutors or the police is in place and functioning;
- system of training police officers on non-discrimination and recognition of bias-motivated crime with specific modules on discrimination against Roma is in place;
- Member States allocate airtime to Roma in public media outlets;

-

⁵ FRA's Fundamental Rights Survey.

- Member States implement awareness-raising campaigns;
- tools for reporting hate speech and hate crime are in place and easily accessible;
- initiatives/training with the participation of IT companies (Google, Facebook, Twitter, etc.) are being organised in order to better identify antigypsyism content on social media platforms;
- initiatives/training on capturing and addressing cases of antigypsyim and hate speech are being organised for media operators.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- Roma CSOs are actively involved in the development of specific measures to address antigypsyism and discrimination;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to address antigypsyism and discrimination are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of implemented measures.

Objective 1-b: Promoting awareness of Roma history, culture, recognition and reconciliation

Outcome indicators: Secondary (optional): There are no indicators developed in this area yet, some possible thematic areas to develop such indicators include:

- awareness among the general population that Roma are a recognised national minority;
- awareness among the general population about Roma history, literature, arts, culture, music, and politics;
- participation of the general population in Roma cultural festival and other public events;
- awareness among the general population that the Romani language is a recognised non-territorial language under the Council of Europe Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;
- awareness among the general population about the Roma Holocaust.

Process indicators for objective 1-b: Promoting awareness of Roma history, culture, recognition and reconciliation

Indicator – Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma strategic frameworks or related policy documents explicitly include measures with indicators and targets to promote awareness of Roma history and culture;
- the Roma Holocaust is recognised and memorial days for its remembrance are part of the official calendar of state holidays;
- there are monuments to or memorials of the Roma Holocaust;
- the contribution of Roma personalities to the Member State's history is recognised and part of the official calendar of state holidays;
- Roma history, culture and arts are part of formal curricula in schools, universities and academic courses;
- Roma cultural initiatives are present in relevant national mainstream cultural event calendars;
- Expert Commissions on Antigypsyism (commissions for truth, recognition and reconciliation) exist and operate to create a deeper understanding of barriers and mechanisms of exclusion within the Member State;
- the structures necessary to the implementation of the Council of Europe European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages are in place;
- regular exchanges on topics related to Roma arts, culture and history take place in the designated government advisory bodies, with the aim of impacting policy;
- an annual state budget is available and allocated to support Roma cultural organisations that promote Roma culture;
- an annual state budget is available and allocated to local Roma media (print, online, TV, radio);
- city and local budget is available and allocated to local Roma media and the promotion of Roma arts and culture;
- ministries and state agencies holding the youth portfolio have departments explicitly tasked with the

inclusion of Roma youth and building the capacity of Roma youth organisations.

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- schools teach about Roma history and culture;
- the teaching of the Romani language is offered free-of-charge in schools;
- teachers and school staff are trained on inclusive education and diversity;
- teachers and school staff are trained on Roma culture and history, including the history of the Roma Holocaust;
- training opportunities related to Roma arts, culture and history are provided to public servants, teachers, police officers, etc.;
- reserved broadcasting time on public media for Roma arts and culture is available and allocated;
- reserved broadcasting time on public media for news in Romani language is available and allocated;
- stage time opportunities in festivals are reserved for featuring Roma culture, supported by public funds;
- the proportion of positive versus negative narratives about Roma is increased in mainstream media and press.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- CSOs are consulted on the need for the to allocate Member State budget to support Roma art and culture;
- government advisory bodies providing feedback on state budget allocation for supporting national Roma strategic frameworks are able to bring forward their proposals on projects related to Roma arts and culture;
- specific measures to promote Roma arts, culture and commemorative events are developed in partnership with Roma CSOs and Roma Holocaust survivors and/or their descendants;
- Roma CSOs participate in the decision-making process on developing specific measures to promote Roma arts and culture and allocating funding for them;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of measures implemented under this operational objective.

Objective 2: Reduce poverty and social exclusion

Headline indicators:	General population:
3) At-risk-of-poverty rate (below 60% of median equivalised income after social transfers)	Eurostat [ilc_li02] SDG 1.2.1
3.1) Children< 18 at risk of poverty	Eurostat [ilc_li02] SDG 1.2.2
	Eurostat [ilc_mddd11] SDG 1
4.1) Children < 18 living in severe material deprivation	Eurostat [ilc_mddd11] SDG 1

Outcome indicators	
Secondary (optional)	
Indicator	General population
Share of people living in a household that cannot afford a meal with meat, chicken, fish (or vegetarian equivalent) every second day	Eurostat [ilc_mdes03]

⁶ Will be replaced with social and material deprivation (Eurostat [ilc_mdsd07]) and respective indicator for children if used in the SDG reporting for general population in the future

Share of people living in a household where at least one person has gone to bed hungry in the past month because there was not enough money for food	n.a./FRS
Share of children aged 0-17 living in a household where at least one person gone to bed hungry in the past month because there was not enough money for food	n.a./FRS
Share of people living in a household that is only able to make ends meet with (great) difficulty	Eurostat [ilc_mdes09]
Share of people who do not have a bank account	n.a./FRS

Process indicators for horizontal objective 2: Reduce poverty and social exclusion

Indicator - Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma strategic frameworks or related policy documents explicitly include measures with indicators and targets to reduce poverty and social exclusion among Roma, with an explicit focus on child poverty;
- social protection and assistance implementation guidelines contain anti-discrimination provisions to secure equal access for Roma;
- a mechanism that guarantees access to a bank account is in place;
- bank guarantees for micro credits for low-income households are being provided.

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- a food and nutrition programme for school children is in place;
- targeted training on tackling discrimination and antigypsyism is organised for staff of social services;
- specific national measures are implemented to take account of intergenerational poverty and the need to support Roma children and their families as regards education, housing, health and poverty reduction:
- training on financial literacy and support for financial inclusion is being provided.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- measures are in place to ensure the participation of Roma in developing policy responses in the area of social inclusion/poverty reduction;
- the specific measures in the area of poverty reduction and social inclusion (in particular those targeting Roma at high risk of marginalisation) are developed in partnership with Roma CSOs;
- interventions in the area of poverty reduction and social inclusion (in particular those targeting Roma at high risk of marginalisation) are carried out with the participation of Roma community organisations;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to reduce poverty and social exclusion (in particular those targeting Roma at high risk of marginalisation) are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of the measures implemented to reduce poverty and social exclusion (in particular those targeting Roma at high risk of marginalisation);
- government institutions and administration (central and local) includes input from Roma civil society, business and industry, academia and research in their decision-making processes in the area of social inclusion/poverty reduction.

Objective 3: Promote participation by means of empowerment and building cooperation and trust in public institutions

Headline indicator:	General population
5) Share of people who felt discriminated against (in any area) in the	n.a. / potentially FRS
past 12 months and reported the last incident of discrimination as	
due to their being Roma	
6) Active citizenship and participation indicator TO BE	potentially FRS
DEVELOPED	

Outcome indicators Secondary (optional)			
Indicator	General population		
Share of people aged 16+ who did NOT report the most recent incident of harassment because as due to their being Roma (of all people who experienced harassment)	n.a. / potentially FRS		
Share of people aged 16+ who did NOT report the most recent incident of physical attack as due to their being Roma	n.a. / potentially FRS SDG 16.3.1		
Share of people aged 16+ who had heard of at least one equality body, national human rights institutions or Ombudsperson office	Potentially FRS		
Share of people aged 16+ who tend to trust the police	Eurostat [Ilc_pw03]		
Share of people aged 16+ who tend to trust the judicial system	Eurostat [Ilc_pw03]		
Further indicators related to participation to be developed:			
Share of people who are employed in public services (NACE ⁷ category O) Share of people who are employed as professionals or managers (ISCO ⁸ 8+9)	Eurostat [lfsa_eisn2]		
Share of people who voted in the (most recent) national elections			

Process indicators for horizontal objective 3: Promote participation through empowerment, and building cooperation and trust

Indicator - Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma strategic frameworks or related policy documents explicitly include measures with indicators and targets to promote participation through empowerment, and building cooperation and trust
- local and community-level NGOs involved in coordinated EU-wide civil monitoring of strategy implementation;
- Roma CSO representatives are regularly invited to participate as full members in EU funds national monitoring committees;
- In municipalities with a high share of Roma in the population, the function of Roma mediators is an official post with the local administrations;
- municipalities with a high share of Roma in the population have one or more dedicated Roma councillor position among their staff;
- mainstream political parties pledge to place Roma candidates on electoral lists in electable places for elections for parliaments and regional/ municipal representative bodies;

http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/stat/isco/

NACE is an acronym used to designate the various statistical classifications of economic activities developed since 1970 in the European Union (EU);

https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/NACE background The International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO);

- cities and municipalities with a high share of Roma in the population include Roma advisory bodies or Roma policy coordinators in their institutional set up, to implement Roma inclusion policy.
- a specialised agency with a mandate to improve trust and empowerment of Roma exists and operates effectively;
- the national human rights institutions, Ombudsperson office and equality body regularly consult with civil society on the situation of Roma and/or involve Roma civil society in regular consultation;
- legal support mechanism for addressing cases of antigypgyism have the necessary financial resources to operate effectively;
- mechanisms are in place to secure and encourage the involvement of Roma/pro-Roma civil society organisations in coordinated monitoring of the implementation of national Roma strategic frameworks and the monitoring and reporting of online hate speech;
- budget is allocated for supporting civil society in projects aiming to empower Roma, and build cooperation and trust in public institutions;
- budget is allocated for awareness-raising campaigns aiming to break Roma stereotypes.

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- percentage of reported cases that result in legal cases;
- training of duty-bearers on antigypgyism and anti-discrimination.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- mechanisms to encourage Roma participation in policy design, implementation and monitoring at the national level are explicitly defined in national Roma strategic frameworks;
- there are mechanism that encourage Roma participation in policy design, implementation and monitoring of any policy that impacts their situation at local level;
- there is participation of Roma in media councils;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring of the results of the measures implemented under this horizontal objective;
- participation of Roma in management or decision-making positions within the organisations implementing activities in the area of Roma inclusion;
- Roma are employed in National Roma Contact Points (NRCP) and other institutions related to Roma inclusion;
- local plans have been created (in line with national Roma strategic frameworks) and are being implemented by local authorities in collaboration with Roma CSOs, in particular those working at local level.

SECTORAL OBJECTIVES

Objective 4: Increase effective equal access to quality inclusive mainstream education

Headline indicator:	General
	population
7) Share of children aged from 3 up to the age of starting compulsory primary education who attend early childhood education and care	Eurostat [sdg_04_30] SDG 4.2.2
8) Share of people aged 20-24 who have completed at least upper secondary education	Eurostat [edat_lfs_9903] SDG 4.3
9) Share of children aged 6-15 who attend schools where 'all or most schoolmates are Roma' as reported by the respondents (selected countries only)	Not applicable

Outcome indicators Secondary (optional)			
Indicator	General population		
Share of children of compulsory-schooling age (5-18) who attend education, household members (depending on the country)	n.a.		
Share of people aged 16+ who felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 12 months, when in contact with school authorities (as a parent/guardian or a student)	n.a. / potentially FRS		
Early leavers from education and training, 18-24 years old	Eurostat [edat_lfse_14]		
Share of people aged 30-34 who have completed tertiary education	Eurostat [t2020_41]		
Prevalence of hate-motivated bullying/harassment of children (due to their being Roma) while in school in the past 12 months, out of all respondents who are parents/guardians of school-age children	n.a./ FRS		
Further to be developed:			
 Share of school-age children living in a household without a computer Share of school-age children living in a household without access to the internet Share of young Roma aged 16-24 living in a household without a computer Share of young Roma aged 16-24 living in a household without access to the internet 			

Process indicators for objective 4: Increase effective Roma participation in quality inclusive mainstream education

Indicator - Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- monitoring of the inclusiveness of mainstream education policies is envisaged in national Roma strategic frameworks;
- a national/regional desegregation programme is in place;
- a national plan to prevent and eliminate misdiagnosis leading to inappropriate placement of Roma pupils in special needs education is being implemented;
- affirmative action programmes are in place to employ Roma teachers in mainstream education;
- the functions of Roma school mediator and teaching assistant are integrated in the education system;
- explicit safeguards and criteria for the inclusiveness of mainstream education policies are reflected in national Roma strategic frameworks;
- a system to guarantee young Roma a place in either upper secondary or vocational education, and support their attendance, is in place, with a focus on girls;
- a system to support Roma who seek higher education through scholarships, mentoring and counselling is in place, with a focus on girls.

Indicator – Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- measures are in place to secure the effective access of Roma to quality inclusive mainstream education with the long-term aim of reaching the same effective access level as for the general population;
- safeguards to ensure the effective equal access of Roma children to early childhood education and care exist and are operational;
- targeted training on preventing discrimination and antigypsyism in education is given to teachers and other education staff;
- teachers are trained to ensure/use inclusive educational approach;

- individual pedagogical support by qualified staff in mainstream education is provided to Roma pupils;
- curricula and teaching materials addressing Roma culture, history and language are in place;
- measures to promote the access of Roma children to extra-curricular, cultural and leisure activities in a multi-cultural set-up are in place;
- Roma who benefit from support programmes (such as individual support, scholarships and mentoring, including on digital literacy);
- there is budget allocated for combatting anti-Roma racism in schools;
- scholarships are provided to support Roma enrolled in university;
- Romology or Roma studies are part of university-level programmes;
- the teaching of the Romani language is offered free-of-charge in schools;
- targeted measures to support informal training and certify practically-gained skills are in place.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- measures are in place to ensure the participation of Roma in developing policy responses in the area of education:
- school inspectorates participate in monitoring the results of measures implemented under this objective;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to promote equal access to education (in particular fighting segregation and promoting inclusive education at all stages) are being implemented

Objective 5: Increase effective equal access to quality and sustainable employment

Headline indicator:	General
	population
10) Share of people aged 20-64 who self-declared their main activity status as 'paid work' (including full-time, part-time, ad hoc jobs, self-employment and occasional work or work in the past four weeks)	Eurostat [lfsa_ergan] SDG 8.5
11) Share of young people aged 15-29* whose current main activity is 'neither in employment, education or training' (NEET)	Eurostat [edat_lfse_20] SDG 8.6.1
12) Gender employment gap: Difference in the paid work rate between women and men aged 20-64	Eurostat [lfsa_ergan] SDG 8.5
Outcome indicators	
Secondary (optional)	
Indicator	General population
Share of people aged 16+ who felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 12 months when at work	n.a. / potentially FRS
Share of people aged 16+ who felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 12 months when looking for a job	n.a. / potentially FRS
Further indicators on quality of work to be developed: permanent contracts, qualified work, share of people working in public services, work poverty, and vocational educational training	

Process indicators for objective 5: Increase effective Roma participation in paid quality and sustainable employment

Indicator - Dimension A - Institutional set-up

• mechanism for supporting the quality employment of Roma is in place and benefits from the necessary financial resources;

- Roma organisations participate as observers in labour unions and tri-partite commissions;
- mentoring and career development programs to support the employment of Roma professionals in public administration are in place
- mechanisms to support the employment of Roma as full-time staff of labour offices and other branches of administration facilitating access to employment are in place;
- Roma 'employment and youth mediator' positions exist in the administrative structure of municipalities with a high share of Roma in the population;
- schemes that support Roma small business start-ups and entrepreneurial initiatives are in place.

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- targeted measures to support Roma entrepreneurship and self-employment, particularly in young people, are in place;
- targeted measures to support the formalisation of existing informal employment are in place;
- targeted measures to support Roma employment in the public administration are in place;
- public work schemes targeting localities with a high share of Roma in the population have explicit exit strategies with skills-building and qualification components;
- programmes that support first-work experience, job placement and apprenticeships and career development targeting Roma youth are implemented and resourced;
- programmes that support inclusive employers and encourage equal opportunities in the workplace are implemented;
- awareness-raising campaigns and targeted training on tackling discrimination and antigypsyism in the labour market are being organised for employment services, unions and employers;
- micro-loan schemes for small businesses that explicitly target Roma communities exist and are fully operational.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- measures are in place to ensure the participation of Roma in developing policy responses in the area of employment;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to increase effective Roma participation in paid quality and sustainable employment are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of implemented measures;
- government institutions and administration (central and local) include input from Roma civil society and in particular Roma entrepreneurs and successful Roma professionals, in their decision-making processes in the area of employment

Objective 6: Improve Roma health and increase effective equal access to quality healthcare services

Headline indicator:	General population	
13) Difference in life expectancy at birth (general population vs. Roma)	Human Mortality Database / Eurostat [demo_mlexpec]	
14) Share of people who have restricted access to health and social services, TO BE DEVELOPED	n.a. / potentially FRS	
Outcome indicators		
Secondary (optional)		
Indicator	General population	
Share of people aged 16+ who assess their health in general as 'very good' or 'good'	Eurostat [hlth_silc_01]	

^{*}Current data based on FRA surveys only covers the 16-29 age group

Share of people aged 16+ with medical insurance coverage	OECD [ECHI 76]
Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being	n.a. / potentially FRS
Roma in the past 12 months when accessing the health services	
To be developed further:	Eurostat
Share of Roma women who gave birth to their first child before the age of 20.	[demo_fordager]
Unmet medical need	SDG 3.7
	Eurostat [SDG_03_60]

Process indicators for objective 6: Improve Roma health and increase effective Roma access to quality healthcare services

Indicator – Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- the system of health mediation is institutionalised and integrated into the relevant structures of health administration;
- there is a system of encouraging and supporting the career development perspectives of health mediators who wish to become health professionals;
- a system for providing preventive health services to Roma in ghettos and segregated/remote settlements is in place;.
- regional health inspectorates have the resources (financial and human) to ensure that national-level vaccination and immunisation programmes for children and old people as well as preventive services like blood tests and cancer screenings also reach Roma communities

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- health awareness programmes customized for the specific health challenges Roma face (including healthy lifestyles and nutrition) are in place;
- preventive health programmes that reach out to risk groups, including Roma, are in place and operational;
- awareness campaigns that promote the understanding of the need for vaccinations are organised;
- vaccination of children and old people (flu) is affordable and being carried out;
- preventive health screenings of children are regularly conducted free of charge, with follow-up measures for risk groups;
- pre-natal care programmes that target disadvantaged women are in place and pre-natal services are provided on a regular basis;
- mother-child health monitoring schemes targeting children aged 0-3 are in place with a specific focus on disadvantaged groups;
- targeted training on preventing discrimination and antigypsyism is regularly being given to health staff:
- health-related awareness-raising and campaigns targeting Roma communities are in place.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- measures that ensure the participation of Roma in developing policy responses in the area of health are in place;
- specific measures to address challenges in the area of health are being developed in partnership with Roma CSOs;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to improve Roma access to healthcare services are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of measures implemented in the area of health;
- government institutions and administration (central and local) includes input from Roma civil society, in particular the networks of Roma health mediators, in their decision-making processes in the area of health.

Objective 7: Increase effective equal access to adequate desegregated housing and essential services⁹

15) Share of people living in housing deprivation (in an apartment that is too dark or has a leaking roof, damp walls or floors or does not have a bath/shower or indoor toilet) 16) Share of people living in a household that does not have the minimum number of rooms according to Eurostat's definition of overcrowding 17) Share of people living in a household without tap water inside the dwelling (selected countries only) Outcome indicators Secondary (optional)	Headline indicator:	General	
is too dark or has a leaking roof, damp walls or floors or does not have a bath/shower or indoor toilet) 16) Share of people living in a household that does not have the minimum number of rooms according to Eurostat's definition of overcrowding 17) Share of people living in a household without tap water inside the dwelling (selected countries only) Outcome indicators Secondary (optional) Indicator General population Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		population	
To develop living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling share of people living in a household without at toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation.		Eurostat [tessi 291]	
16) Share of people living in a household that does not have the minimum number of rooms according to Eurostat's definition of overcrowding 17) Share of people living in a household without tap water inside the dwelling (selected countries only) SDG 6.1.1 SDG 6.1.1			
minimum number of rooms according to Eurostat's definition of overcrowding 17) Share of people living in a household without tap water inside the dwelling (selected countries only) Outcome indicators Secondary (optional) Indicator General population Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	,	E	
To develop living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	,		
Outcome indicators Secondary (optional) Indicator Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	overcrowding	SDG 1, SDG 11	
Outcome indicators Secondary (optional) Indicator Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.			
Indicator Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		SDG 6.1.1	
Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Outcome indicators		
Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service. Eurostat [ilc_mdho05 / SDG_06_10] SDG 6 Eurostat [SDG_01_60] SDG 1 n.a. n.a. n.a. n.a. n.a. n.a. n.a. n.a.	Secondary (optional)		
Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside the dwelling Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Indicator	General	
the dwelling SDG_06_10] SDG 6 Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		population	
SDG 6 Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Share of people living in a household without a toilet, shower or bathroom inside		
Share of people living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	the dwelling		
foundation or rot in window frames of floor Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.			
Share of people living in a household that in the past 12 months has ever been forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.			
forced to leave the accommodation or halting site Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		SDG I	
Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		n.a.	
Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.			
To develop further: Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Share of people aged 16+ who have felt discriminated against due to their being	n.a. / potentially FRS	
Residential segregation. Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Roma in the past 5 years when looking for housing		
Indicator(s) reflecting the geographic aspects of Roma situation. Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	To develop further:		
Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.	Residential segregation.	n.a.	
transports, schools, child care, etc.) because of distance, costs, opening times or lack of service.		n.a.	
lack of service.	Access to basic services and infrastructure in the area (health services, public		
Share of people living in illegal or unregulated housing.			
	Share of people living in illegal or unregulated housing.		

Process indicators for objective 7: Increase effective Roma access to adequate desegregated housing and essential services

Indicator – Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma strategic frameworks or related policy documents include explicit measures to combat residential segregation;
- clear guidelines for evictions are in place and are effectively implemented to protect against for irregular evictions;
- clear guidelines for evictions are in place and are effectively implemented to protect households with children;
- existing loopholes in housing regulation that prevent the legalization of unregulated housing stock in Roma neighbourhoods are closed;
- eligibility and assessment criteria for EU-funded projects that improve the infrastructure in localities with a high share of Roma in the population provide specific points for companies that

_

⁹ Such as tap water, adequate sanitation, waste collection- and management services, electricity, gas, access to transport, financial services and digital communications (in line with principle 20 of the European Pillar of Social Rights).

employ or are operated by Roma;

- policies that encourage and support community-level local self-help initiatives in the area of housing are in place;
- the needs of halting sites and caravan pitches are assessed regularly;
- mechanisms that ensure the right to safe water and sanitation is effectively being enjoyed by Roma are in place.

Indicator – Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- explicit safeguards and criteria for the inclusiveness of mainstream housing services and programmes are reflected in national Roma strategic frameworks;
- targeted measures are in place to provide support to socially deprived areas, with a view of decreasing segregation;
- targeted measures with secured financial resources are in place to improve public infrastructure for disadvantaged settlements as regards roads, water, sanitation, access to public services and sewage facilities:
- 'housing first' programme are in place;
- targeted training on tackling discrimination and antigypsyism in housing is given to staff in housing services and municipal offices;
- mapping and monitoring of disadvantaged settlements and camps is conducted on a regular basis;
- monitoring of housing aspects (number of local housing units needing assessment) is conducted on a regular basis.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- measures are in place to ensure the participation of Roma in developing policy responses in the area of housing;
- the specific measures to address challenges in the area of housing are being developed in partnership with Roma CSOs;
- interventions in the area of housing that target Roma (in particular desegregation) are developed and implemented with the participation of Roma community organisations;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to improve the housing situation and, in particular, desegregation, are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of implemented measures in the area of housing, in particular desegregation;
- government institutions and administration (central and local) include input from Roma civil society, in particular networks of Roma health and education mediators, in their decision-making processes in the area of housing.

Objective 7-a: Fighting environmental deprivation, promoting environmental justice

Outcome indicators		
Secondary (optional)		
Indicator	General population	
Share of Roma living in a household with the following listed as problems in their accommodation: pollution, grime or other environmental problems in the local area such as: smoke, dust, unpleasant smells or polluted water	Eurostat [ilc_mddw02]	

Outcome indicators: Secondary (optional): There are no indicators developed in this area yet, possible thematic areas to develop could be:

Exposure to environmental living conditions that are hazardous and associated with health risks:

- living in areas prone to natural disasters (by type of disaster river flooding, flash-floods, land-slides, etc.);
- living in environmentally hazardous areas (by type landfills or dump sites, abandoned

- industrial sites, mines, etc.);
- exposure to hazardous factors (by type living in polluted areas, relying on untreated and contaminated water sources, exposed to toxic emissions, electro-magnetic radiation etc.);
- working in hazardous occupations including work on wastelands, dumpsters etc. and with no adequate protection;
- living in areas with lack of infrastructure such as safe drinking water, waste water treatment, paved roads, waste collection, etc.;
- share of households relying on burning solid waste to heat their dwellings.

Process indicators for objective 7-a: Fighting environmental deprivation, promoting environmental justice

Indicator - Dimension A - Institutional set-up

- national Roma strategic frameworks or related policy documents include explicit measures to combat environmental deprivation and promote environmental justice;
- implementation guidelines secure priority access to social housing of Roma living in environmentally hazardous areas;
- standards for housing safety and prevention of living in hazardous conditions are strictly enforced;
- environmental assessment of new building sites and halting sites is carried out;
- effective mechanisms are in place to ensure the enforcement of environmentally-relevant provisions of labour legislation.

Indicator - Dimension B - Particular measures and actions

- targeted measures with secured financial resources are in place to resettle Roma families living in environmentally hazardous areas;
- impact assessment of housing policies and housing provisions targeting Roma are carried out as regards environmental factors;
- environmental impact of policies and environmental risks for Roma are addressed in national Roma strategic frameworks.

Indicator - Dimension C - Quality of decision-making processes

- specific measures to address environmental challenges in the areas where Roma live (in particular in segregated Roma communities) are developed in partnership with Roma CSOs and Roma residents from the concerned localities:
- interventions in the area of safe and sustainable environment targeting Roma (in particular, in segregated Roma communities) are developed and implemented with the participation of Roma community organizations;
- Roma CSOs participate in the monitoring committees of the EU funds operational programme under which the specific measures to improve the environmental situation in the areas where Roma live (in particular in marginalised Roma communities) are being implemented;
- Roma CSOs participate in monitoring the results of measures implemented to improve environmental situation in areas where Roma live (in particular in segregated Roma communities);
- government institutions and administration (central and local) include input from Roma civil society, in particular the networks of Roma health mediators, in their decision-making processes in the area of health.